Santiago As Matamoros: Race, Class, And LIMPIEZA DE SANGRE In A Sixteenth-Century Spanish Manuscript

Rebecca C. Quinn
Southern Methodist University, rebecca.teresi@gmail.com

Follow this and additional works at: https://scholar.smu.edu/weil_ura

Recommended Citation
Quinn, Rebecca C., "Santiago As Matamoros: Race, Class, And LIMPIEZA DE SANGRE In A Sixteenth-Century Spanish Manuscript" (2011). The Larrie and Bobbi Weil Undergraduate Research Award Documents. 1.
https://scholar.smu.edu/weil_ura/1

This document is brought to you for free and open access by the Fondren Library at SMU Scholar. It has been accepted for inclusion in The Larrie and Bobbi Weil Undergraduate Research Award Documents by an authorized administrator of SMU Scholar. For more information, please visit http://digitalrepository.smu.edu.
SANTIAGO AS MATAMOROS:
RACE, CLASS, AND LIMPIEZA DE SANGRE
IN A SIXTEENTH-CENTURY SPANISH MANUSCRIPT

By

Rebecca C. Quinn
Introduction

In May of 2004, officials from the Cathedral of Santiago de Compostela announced the impending relocation of a statue [fig. 1] by 18th-century artist José Gambino from the Cathedral to an adjoining Museum.\(^1\) The statue, depicting the church’s patron Saint James as Matamoros, or Moor-Slayer, was to be replaced by another by the same artist [fig. 2] depicting James as Pilgrim. The church reportedly proposed the change for the main purpose of addressing the “sensitivities of other ethnic groups,” in hopes “to emphasize St James’s kinder side.”\(^2\) However, after public outcry against the decision, Cathedral authorities decided instead to censor the offending elements of the statue, masking the figures of the trampled and decapitated Moors with a dense floral arrangement [fig. 3].\(^3\) Certainly, addressing the sensitivities of visitors to the Church was an important consideration in the Cathedral’s deliberations, but it could not have been the only one. For Spaniards, the central controversy of images like Santiago Matamoros lies not in their insensitivity or gore but rather in their ability to remind Spain of those parts of the national narrative that the modern Spanish memory, after four decades of fascism, would just as soon forget.

That the Santiago Matamoros image type garnered such attention in the 21st century testifies to its lasting emotional and political legacy. As I will later argue, such an image, in its attack on the Other, succeeds in establishing a strong sense of community, proto-national

\(^1\) It is important to note the timing of this announcement, which occurred just weeks after the bombings at the Atocha train station in Madrid.


identity, and hegemony, making its significance in the larger narrative of Spanish history indisputable. Studying the origins of these images helps make sense of the modern motif and why it continues to retain its power. As I will demonstrate in the following pages, because of Saint James’ singular place in Iberian tradition, Jacobean myths and portrayals become by the 16th century particularly representative of the Spanish concept of self. It is this unyielding nexus between patron and patria that render Santiago Matamoros worthy of more thorough attention; a portrait of Saint James is, for some, a self-portrait of Iberia after 1492, the year that marks both the birth of a Spanish empire with Columbus’ arrival in the Americas and the death of any semblance of convivencia4 with the surrender of Granada and the final expulsion of Jews from Spain.

I will examine the Santiago Matamoros phenomenon principally through the study of its frequent appearance in the carta executoria de hidalguía, or nobility patent, a document produced over a broad period spanning the late middle ages and most of the early modern period. This epoch is a particularly rich setting for understanding Santiago’s relevance to the Spanish cultural narrative as it stands at the apex of the so-called Siglo de Oro, or Golden Age of the Spanish empire, in which the production of arts and literature reached their zenith as the Habsburg empire rose and fell. As a case study, I will consult a particular example of this document found in the Bridwell Library Special Collections at Southern Methodist University.5 This document is exemplary of the type in its formulaic construction and ornamentation, most interestingly in its adoption of the Santiago Matamoros type in its marginal illumination. As I will illustrate, such images of James as Moor-Slayer helped to position the saint both as

4. “Coexistence,” a term often used to describe the Iberian Middle Ages where Christians, Muslims, and Jews shared the Peninsula.

5. MS. 46
eradicator of an unwanted past and a forger of a mythical individual and national identity.
Chapter 1

The Galician Grave

Like many tales of the medieval church, the story of the discovery of St. James’ tomb in Galicia is one of quasi-cinematic grandeur. Singular, however, is its unsurpassed sociocultural consequence. Saint James the Greater, one of Christ’s twelve apostles and brother of John, was of little real significance to the Christian religion before 814 when, according to legend, his tomb was discovered by the hermit Pelayo amidst a chorus of angels and blinding light. His legendary connections to Iberia were two-fold: first, he purportedly evangelized the pagan Celts in the northwest of the Peninsula during his lifetime and second, his remains underwent a miraculous translatio from the Holy Land to Galicia after martyrdom at the hands of King Herod. The Bishop Teodemir of Iria Flavia pronounced the discovery as miraculous in 830, establishing the northwestern part of the Iberian Peninsula as James’ official resting place.

This divine revelation sparked the transformation of the small Galician city of Compostela into a

---

6. There exist conflicting accounts of this event. In some versions, the Bishop Teodemir discovers the tomb and not Pelayo. For the purposes of this paper, it is the discovery itself and not the details that are of interest. See entry on “Theodomir, Bishop of Iria Flavia” in E. Michael Gerli’s Medieval Iberia: an Encyclopedia, p. 785, for the alternate story.


8. In America Castro’s groundbreaking 1948 text, he thoroughly explores the devotion to the cult of St. James. Castro, the father of Medieval Iberian scholarship, provides a comprehensive account of the development of the Jacobean cult. Despite his somewhat creative approach to historiography, his research is nevertheless relevant to our question. According to Castro, the strength of the relationship between James and Spain was such that James was understood as extraordinary among saints, sharing a filial and later geminal relationship with Jesus. The beginnings of his cult named Santiago as “hermano del señor”, implying a heretical codivinity between Jesus and James; popular belief understood Santiago as the "twin brother of the Lord". This idea recurs in the apocryphal gospels: "Is this not the son of the Carpenter, and his mother Mary, and his brothers James and Simeon?" quoted from Hechos de Andrés y Matías, A Walker, Apocryphal Gospels, 1873 p. 354. Américo Castro, España En Su Historia: Cristianos Moros Y Judíos (Buenos Aires: Editorial Losada, 1948), pp. 108, 110, 117.

hub of Christian worship, rivaled only by Jerusalem and Rome in terms of cultic consequence.

In addition to religious significance, the discovery brought weighty political and economic consequences. In the early Middle Ages, Northern Iberia was a volatile region. The territories of Galicia, Asturias, the Basque Country, and Cantabria were notoriously difficult to control, as they had remained fractured throughout Roman and Visigothic rule; for many centuries, the northwest of Spain had been at best a loose conglomeration of tribes. King Alfonso II (r. 741-892) quickly took advantage of the discovery of Santiago’s remains, making a journey to the site and ordering the construction of various churches along the route in an act of veneration and political strategy. This event was decisive for the king, who seized the chance to unite the unruly northwest under religious and territorial leadership. Although the political unity of the region had already taken shape by the 8th century, long before the reign of Alfonso II, its origins and development are still shrouded in mystery. As a result, Alfonso’s actions upon discovery of the tomb constitute one of the first significant political moments in the history of the area and indeed the entire Peninsula.¹⁰

Immediately, the cult of St. James and unified, Christian power in Iberia were equated, and not a moment too soon. The good news of the discovery came just over a century after the 711 Muslim invasion and conquest of the Peninsula, a feat that had taken just under five years to realize. Christian Kings in the North had begun to push back immediately, fighting for the southward expansion of their small kingdoms. In the context of this struggle, the discovery of the tomb and the later apparitions of the saint served in many ways to boost the morale of those laboring for Reconquest of the Peninsula, uniting the fractured Christian kingdoms under a single

¹⁰ Reilly pp. 74-76. See also entry on “James the Great, St.” in E. Michael Gerli’s Medieval Iberia: an encyclopedia, pp. 436-7.
cause and transforming the Reconquest into a Crusade.\textsuperscript{11}

**A Path for Pilgrims**

After the excitement of the discovery of James’ remains, Christian pilgrims flooded into Iberia along what became known as the Camino de Santiago, or the Way of St. James. This pilgrimage route became the symbol of Christian Spain, both in and out of Iberia. For example, contemporaneous non-Christian populations of Iberia saw the city of Compostela and the cathedral dedicated to the saint, like the saint himself, as analogous to Christian Spain. The most noteworthy manifestation of this mentality occurred in 997, when the Umayyad vizier al-Mansur burned Compostela, taking with him the bells of the Church to be used as ornament in the Great Mosque of his native Córdoba.\textsuperscript{12} For this Muslim leader, Christian power was centered in the Cathedral, the holy site of veneration of St. James and the final destination for the countless pilgrims who traveled to Compostela every year. This belief was so widely held that the famed 11\textsuperscript{th}-century Cordoban Muslim historian Ibn Hazm immortalized it in his *Critical History of Religious Ideas*. There, he argued that James was the most important saint in all of Christendom, not just in Iberia, because of the long journeys pilgrims made to visit his tomb. Most importantly, Hazm equated the pilgrimage to Compostela with the Muslim pilgrimage to Mecca: "for them [the Spanish Christians] Santiago is as venerable as the Kaaba in Mecca is for

\textsuperscript{11} Joseph F. O'Callaghan, "The Liturgy of Reconquest and Crusade," in Reconquest and Crusade in Medieval Spain (Philadelphia [Pa.: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2004), pg. 24. Although there is debate surrounding the appropriateness of the words “reconquest” and “crusade” in the history of Spain, O'Callaghan allows the validity of such labels by the 12\textsuperscript{th} century.

\textsuperscript{12} Reilly pg. 87. For information on the recovery of the bells by the Christian forces, see Reconquest and Crusade, pp. 95, 207.
Muslims, as in both places can be found the object of their supreme adoration."\textsuperscript{13} Clearly, James was no generic saint—in many ways, for the Muslims of Al-Andalus, he \textit{was} Christianity.

As time went on, the pilgrimage route became a center of economic power in Northern Spain and a site of international exchange with Northern Europe. Traffic on the pilgrimage road to Compostela increased significantly in the 11th century, stimulating the diversification of Northern Christian towns in an area of the Peninsula that was then primarily agricultural.\textsuperscript{14} The growth in popularity of the Camino created an entire economy based on the steady stream of pilgrims flooding over the Pyrenees. Accordingly, food, entertainment, lodging, and travel business emerged as the dominant trade in the region.\textsuperscript{15} In some cases, for pilgrims coming from the north, the pilgrimage and thus James himself were their first experiences and associations with Christian Spain. It is no wonder, then, that James was selected and glorified over time as her mightiest and most iconic patron.

\textbf{A Bellicose Saint?}

\textbf{The Battle of Clavijo}

For the first twenty years after the discovery of the tomb, James existed in Christian hagiography \textbackslash exclusively in the context of his apostleship and the pilgrimage to his shrine. But the perception of James as a peaceful, harmless pilgrim rapidly changed in 844 during the Battle of Clavijo when, according to a Jacobean legend, James appeared to King Ramiro on the eve of battle to assure him of victory. Although scholars such as Francisco Puy-Muñoz and Jerilynn

\begin{itemize}
  \item \textsuperscript{13} Quoted from The History of the Mohammedan Dynasties, II, 193 in Castro pg. 119.
  \item \textsuperscript{14} Reilly pg. 119.
  \item \textsuperscript{15} Reilly pg. 119.
\end{itemize}
Dodds dispute the historical reality of this battle, its legendary consequence is undeniable. The 13th-century archbishop of Toledo, Rodrigo Jiménez de Rada, recounts the tale:

And so the Saracens moved against Ramiro with infinite troops. The army of King Ramiro...took refuge in a fortified place called Clavijo. And since Ramiro was unsure the night before the battle, Saint James appeared to him, and encouraged him that he could be sure of his victory, and should confront the Arabs the next day. At first light he told the bishops and magnates about his vision; giving thanks to God, they quickly rallied together to battle, comforted by the promise of the apostle....Once the battle had begun, the Saracens, shaken and disconcerted, turned their backs to the swords of the Christians, so that almost seventy thousand of them died. They say that in this battle, Saint James appeared on a white horse, waving a white pennant.16

According to another account of Clavijo, from the Historia Roderici of the 12th century, the night before the battle, James promised King Ramiro I of Asturias that he would come to the aid of the Christians: "I will come to your aid and on the morrow by the hand of God you will overcome the countless multitude of Saracens...You and the Saracens will see me on a white horse...bearing a great white banner."17 In this version, the soldiers then saw James, who gave them encouragement before the battle, although he did not actually appear during combat. It was during this conflict that the battle cry of St. James originated: "O God and Saint James, help us!"18 Such association of James with intercession in battle was critical to the development of the saint’s twin identities as pilgrim and warrior.19


17. Reconquest and Crusade pg. 195. The image of James on the white horse makes a possible allusion to the horseman of the Apocalypse as described in Revelation 19:11.

18. Ibid.

19. Ibid. James is more rarely described as appearing with another Spanish saint, Millán de la Cogolla, as in the legend of the 939 Battle of Simancas, where James and Millán appeared "whiter than the recent snows, coming on two horses whiter than crystal, bearing arms that no mortal man had ever seen."
No first-hand reports of the miraculous intercession survive; rather, all known accounts of the event originate nearly three centuries after its purported 9th century date. Although such discrepancy is not uncommon for medieval battle lore, it is important to highlight the legendary status of the battle, which is in many ways aggravated by the lack of contemporaneous written record and the surge in popularity centuries later. In the case of Clavijo, the battle from which the myth of Santiago’s identity as Matamoros springs, all of the myth making that accompanies such status is revealed.

St. James and Spanish Battle Cries

By the twelfth and thirteenth centuries, the concepts of James and war were so tightly interwoven that James became a veritable god of war for Spanish Christians; reliance on James in battle became manifest in various wartime practices. Throughout the Middle Ages, it was common for military leaders to appeal for God’s help in battle, especially through the intercession of Saints and the Virgin. By the 12th century, an intercessory formula was firmly established: a Spanish Christian in battle would assuredly request the help of God the Father, the Virgin, and, of course, James, patron of Spain. This wartime appropriation of religion is one of the factors that contributed to the establishment of Santiago Matamoros as a figure type, which will be discussed in the following pages.

Many records survive of appeals for James’ intercession in Reconquest skirmishes. For example, according to an account from the 12th century *Chronica Adefonsi Imperatoris*, the


21. Accounts of such battle cries are known today primarily through 12th-century texts, which tell of legendary battles from earlier centuries. Among the most important of these are the *Chronica Adefonsi Imperatoris*, which deals extensively with the reign of Alfonso VII of León, the *Historia Roderici*, an anonymous prose history of the Cid Campeador, and the *Historia Silense*, a history tracing the events of Christian Iberia from the time of the Visigoths until the reign of Alfonso VI.
Mayor of Toledo, before a battle against the Muslims at Montiel, reportedly prayed the following: "O St. James, apostle of Christ, defend us in battle, lest we perish in the great judgment of the Saracens." Another example occurs during a battle against the Almoravids when Christian soldiers, according to report, cried out: "to the God of the heavens and the earth and to Holy Mary and to St. James in prayer to aid and defend them." A further example of this practice is evident in a skirmish outside Seville: Christians "cried out to the Lord God, to Holy Mary, and St. James to have mercy on them and to forgive the sins of their kings, of themselves, and of their relations." In Toledo, the militia leaders appealed to Jesus, Mary, and then to James: "O St. James, Apostle of Christ, defend us in battle lest we perish in a great judgment with the Saracens." During the siege of Seville, Pelay Pérez Correa and his men "in manly voice called God and Santiago to their aid." Interestingly, Pérez Correa was the master of Santiago at the time. In the Cantar del mio Cid, this practice is highlighted as one of both Christians and Muslims: "the Moors call on Muhammad and the Christians on Santiago," and later "In the name of the Creator and the Apostle Santiago, strike them." Similarly, during the battle of Jerez, the battle cry was both "Santiago" and "Castilla"—suggesting an equation of the Saint with the Nation. In this sense, Santiago as Matamoros, the national wartime intercessor, was a tool of

22. Reconquest and Crusade pg. 189. Quoted from Chronica Adefonsi Imperatoris Bk. 2, ch. 69.

23. Reconquest and Crusade pg. 193. This text is the oldest preserved Spanish epic poem recounting the tale of an exiled Spanish knight who works to regain Christian territory from the Muslims and eventually, through the marriage of his daughters, towards unification of the Christian kingdoms. It is important to note that the medieval author parallels James with Muhammad and not Jesus.


25. Ibid. If the appeal to God for aid in battle was unsuccessful, the faithful did not lose hope. Instead, this loss was attributed to a bureaucratic error—in one account, because of the sins of the soldiers, God's messenger Gabriel did not "take them before Christ's tribunal."
necessity and expediency for the Iberian people. 26

Without doubt, however, the most enduring battle cry was “¡Santiago y cierra España!”—literally, “St. James and Seal Spain!”—an appeal for St. James to intercede in the closing of Spain’s borders from foreign bodies. 27 The ambiguity of this battle cry, in its failure to define “Spain,” calls for geographical and ideological purification and isolation. It is this sentiment that best foreshadows the ideas of nobility, blood purity, and Santiago Matamoros that will be complicated in the coming chapters of this paper.

Establishing Military Orders

Yet another example of the importance of James to the Reconquest is his place as patron of an exclusive Military Order. During the Reconquest, the establishment of Military Orders in the Northern Christian Kingdoms became a powerful religio-political practice, as membership in such organizations was not solely a manifestation of dedication to the Christian cause but a sign of noble status. 28 The Order of Santiago, considered the most powerful and wide-reaching of these organizations, was founded in 1170 at Cáceres in León. The members of the Order established a pact with the Archbishop of Compostela a year later, thus gaining official recognition as beneficiaries and agents of St. James. Two years later, the Friars of Ávila incorporated into the Order, making an agreement to advance on Jerusalem via Morocco once the Muslims had been driven out of the Peninsula in an act that established the Reconquest of the Peninsula as an ideological, geographical, and political prelude to the European Crusades. Five

26. Castro pp. 166-7. Saint James was not looked to as patron to bestow holiness or divine grace, but rather as patron of quotidian necessities, such as good harvests, good health, and of course good battles.

27. Palma Martínez-Burgos García, Religiosidad Popular Y Modelos De Identidad En España Y América (Cuenca: Ediciones De La Universidad De Castilla-La Mancha, 2000), pg. 48.

28. Reconquest and Crusade pg. 55. For example, these orders, such as Order of Santiago, were entrusted with the guardianship of castles to establish a perimeter of defense on the Christian border. See related information on Cartas Executorias and Noble Status in later chapter
years after the founding of the Order, it received official Papal approval and, by 1180, held property in France, England, Portugal, Castile, and Carinthia; the Order of Santiago had politically matured in just one short decade.²⁹ The order’s powerful status demonstrates not only that the patronage of St. James and the success of the Reconquest were understood to be inseparable but also that, as will be demonstrated below, James’ favor and protection had gained a new dimension. While before the 12th century James’ patronage served to support pilgrim and warrior exclusively, afterwards it served as a sign of nobility.

²⁹. Reconquest and Crusade pg. 54.
Chapter 2

James: Apostle, Pilgrim, and Warrior

Santiago’s unique role in Spain is reflected in the cultic images that depict the saint and developed in response to his place in Peninsular history. The familiar iconographic depictions of St. James found throughout Western Europe are rooted in the Byzantine and early Christian tradition, where artists principally depicted James in the context of his status as apostle. In these scenes, such as in a 6th-century Last Supper example from the Italian church of S. Apollinare Nuovo [fig. 4], tradition depicts James alongside the other eleven followers of Christ but gives him no marks or features that distinguish him from the others. It is not until the explosion in popularity of the pilgrimage route to Compostela in the 9th and 10th centuries that the iconographic formulas for St. James are codified: James becomes first Pilgrim and later warrior.

James as Pilgrim

The first and most enduring of these two types is Santiago Peregrino, or Saint James as Pilgrim, a depiction that features the saint in all the pilgrim’s garb of those who come to visit his shrine: staff, cloak, hat, and scallop shell, the emblematic mark of the Camino. These elements can be appreciated in their most mature form in a 16th-century manuscript illumination from a French book of hours [fig. 5]. In this example, the pilgrim saint appears in an act of


31. Reconquest and Crusade pg. 191. There are some less-common ways of depicting St. James that are not relevant to this paper but worth mentioning: St. James sometimes appears not as Pilgrim or Matamoros but rather as a disembodied hand wielding a sword from a cloud in the sky, a possible reference to his status as one of the Biblical sons of Thunder.
contemplative reading, mimaetically imitating the attitude the owner of the manuscript ought to take in his or her own study.

Similar depictions of Santiago Peregrino are known throughout Spain and indeed the rest of Europe, seen on everything from painted altarpieces, such as in a fifteenth-century Italian example that depicts James in pilgrim’s garb, his scallop-shell adorned hat at his feet [fig. 6], to decorative sculptures, such as in an example from the Cathedral of Burgos [fig. 7] to manuscript illuminations, such as the previously mentioned French book of hours [fig. 5]. The scallop shell often worn by the saint derives from its use as a symbol of the pilgrimage and marker for the pilgrim’s path, as seen on a marker outside of Burgos [fig. 8], and on shrines, shops, taverns, and inns that are pilgrim-friendly, as illustrated by a contemporary example in which a shell beckons pilgrims into a sundries shop along the route in France [fig 9].

The portrayal of St. James as pilgrim is unique within the canon of hagiographical representation in that it is the only known instance in which a saint is shown to assume the role of his followers. The proliferation of such iconography no doubt served to encourage travel to Compostela and to emphasize the saint’s exemplarity as a model for Christian life but also must have impelled identification with James as “one of Us.” In this light, James the Pilgrim, an inherently communal figure, represents the medieval Christian Everyman who must journey to absolve his sins. How fitting, then, that the saint who so emphatically embodies the concept of Us transforms into the saint who purges the Christian community of Them?

James as Warrior

After tales of the Battle of Clavijo and the subsequent series of miraculous wartime interventions had thoroughly disseminated by the 12th century, the alternate identity of James as Warrior emerged. With the rise in popularity of such tales came a second iconographic

32. Raulston pg. 346.
permutation of St. James—that is, St. James as Warrior and later Matamoros, or Moor-slayer. The pattern of depiction is formulaic—the saint appears as a sword-wielding rider on a white horse, as told in the popular Clavijo battle myths addressed in the previous chapter. The oldest equestrian depiction of the Apostle appears in the tympanum over the South portal to the Cathedral of Santiago de Compostela from the mid-twelfth century. In this depiction, the Saint is not yet a Matamoros; he is instead surrounded by the faithful kneeling in prayer.\(^{33}\) [fig. 11] Compatible with the 12\(^{th}\)-century battle myths, this scene depicts James as triumphant on horseback wielding a sword, gaining victory not through slaughter or combat but rather through the incitement of wonder and awe.\(^{34}\)

Another early example of this image type comes from the Salamanca Codex of the Pilgrim’s Guide, or Codex Calixtinus, from the 14\(^{th}\) century, where the simply garbed saint rides a white steed and wields a raised sword [fig. 10]. Here, James is identified by both the circular nimbus, representing his sainthood, and the scallop shell, symbol of the pilgrimage, which appears on his banner and recurs in varying sizes and shapes across the crimson background; these identifying elements serve to unify pilgrimage and crusade into one cohesive model. In most other early depictions, Santiago as Warrior reflects the Clavijo narrative in his carrying of a banner along with his sword, elements which together imbue the saint with the power of reclamation and reconquest, as in the illumination from the Pilgrim’s Guide [fig. 10].\(^{35}\) In other instances, he totes a shield bearing the ensiform cross of his eponymous Military Order, a detail

\(^{33}\) Reconquest and Crusade pg. 195.

\(^{34}\) See Chapter 1. The disconnect between the matamoros depiction and the actual battle myths further suggests that Santiago as Matamoros was invented for the purpose of propaganda.

\(^{35}\) This holds true, at least in the Old World. In the New World, one witnesseses an iconographic and, arguably, ideological shift in the Santiago iconography. For more information on Santiago Matamoros/Mataíndios in the New World, see Javier Domínguez García’s De Apóstol Matamoros a Yllapa Mataíndios: Dogmas e Ideologías Medievales en el (des)cubrimiento de América, 2008.
so enduring that it even survives into Colonial images of St. James, such as in a 17th century example from colonial Cuzco, in which the artist has chosen to showcase the crimson cross as a focal point of the composition [fig. 12].

Certain elements of Santiago Peregrino’s costume are at times incorporated into portrayals of the warrior apostle—when he is not dressed in the armor or garb of a crusader, he charges forth in a pilgrim’s cloak and hat pinned back by the scallop shell, as in a 15th-century Schongauer print that will be addressed in the coming pages [fig. 13].

James as Matamoros

The element that distinguishes Santiago as Warrior as specifically Santiago Matamoros is, of course, the vanquished Moors, a term which I use as the medieval Spanish Christians did to evoke not a specific ethnic or religious identity in the modern sense but rather a concept of the Other that encompassed a diverse and multi-ethnic group of followers of Islam in medieval Iberia. Interestingly, however, a close analyses of catalogues of Jacobean art in Spain reveals that the widespread proliferation of Matamoros imagery did not emerge until after the 1492 fall of Muslim Al-Andalus; the Moors who are slain by Santiago in these images belonged to memory and not quotidian experience. Because such Matamoros images privilege the Christian religion in allowing a holy, other-worldly Christian saint to engage in direct combat with a mortal, earthly enemy from a war already won, they rewrite a past in which, according to Remensnyder, Muslims were considered political and not religious enemies. As James is patron of Spain and in many ways its iconographic and ideological stand-in, the Matamoros

36. Interestingly, the cross of Santiago is war-like in and of itself [fig. 14], comprised of a blood-red dagger whose handle creates a cruciform shape ending in pointed flourishes, the union of devotion and battle materialized.

37. See Lamas Manuel Chamoso’s Santiago en España, Europa y América, 1971.

tradition transforms the Moors from a specific political and religio-ethnic enemy of the past into a representative of the collective Other, encompassing all enemies to the Spanish ideology.

The formula for portraying the slain Moorish enemies in the Matamoros figure type is variable but diverges into two categories, which show either James in battle against the Moors or James as victorious over one or more Moors outside of the context of battle. The standard for the period of interest to this paper was set by a late fifteenth-century print by master-engraver Martin Shongauer, today known as either *Saint James and the Saracens, Saint James and the Turks,* or *Saints James at the Battle of Clavijo* [fig. 13].39 In this print, James is shown in pilgrim’s garb on his white steed with sword raised, leading a determined band of armored Christian forces in a charge against a cowering mass of turbaned Saracens. A common element to all portrayals of *Santiago Matamoros* is the decapitated Moor in the foreground, depicted with or without his body in sight. It is this dehumanizing formula—the separation of head and body—that transforms the Moor from neighbor to Other and justifies the military action necessary for Christian Reconquest on both religious and political grounds.40

The iconographic formula that rests behind that of Santiago Matamoros is not unique to Iberia nor to the Middle Ages. Images of conquest in which leaders trample enemies on horseback were popular throughout the art of the Roman Empire, as seen in a Trajanic relief fragment from the Arch of Constantine in Rome that depicts Trajan trampling the Dacians in


40. In order to understand this trend, an emphasis on the military conflict and political upheaval during the Reconquista period must be acknowledged. The lens of convivencia must be focused to avoid any idealization of relations between Muslims and Christians in medieval Iberia. Although numerous examples of peaceable exchange between the three cultures in medieval Iberia often arise in contemporary scholarship, seven centuries of political and military conflict must not be disregarded. In the words of Puy Muñoz, “the popular paradigm today asserts that the Moors were just as Spanish as the Christians, and that medieval Spain was a veritable fiesta of Islam that was put to an end by meddling Christian neighbors”.40 Instead, Muñoz stresses the bloody reality of the Reconquista in Medieval Iberia that is often deemphasized in popular modern scholarship.
battle [fig. 15]. Here, the mounted Emperor appears as the iconic victorious leader, defeating his enemies, sword raised, in an aggressive advance. Similar images can be found in art of the Latin Middle Ages, such as in a Romanesque equestrian sculpture above a tympanum of the Church of Saint-Pierre at Parthenay-le-Vieux in Aquitaine, in which a crowned and mounted figure appears to simultaneously trample a foe and command a falcon [fig. 16]. Linda Seidel argues that such equestrian imagery in the context of the Romanesque implied not only victory but also a certain level of privilege and nobility. Artists portraying Santiago as Matamoros, in their use of an established standard of equestrian imagery, doubtlessly attempted to tap into this known visual pattern of representing victory over the religio-political enemy by exalting the noble status of the victor. In the case of Santiago Matamoros, the idea of Christian purity and nobility become particularly important, especially within the context of the carta executoria de hidalguía, as explored in the following chapters; distinct from the Roman and Romanesque precedents, however, is that Santiago, the victorious leader, is not a political or military ruler but rather a saint and object of devotion.

The Saint with Two Sides? Reconciling Pilgrimage with Reconquest

To modern viewers, these two visions of James—warrior and pilgrim—seem incompatible. Some scholars, like Thomas Spaccarelli and William Melczer, view Santiago Matamoros as an exclusively national image and Santiago Peregrino as an inherently international one. These scholars also view the two as incompatible and representative of

---

42. Raulston pg. 346.
completely opposing values: war instead of peace, homogeneity instead of multiculturalism, and the hierarchical rather than the egalitarian. While these two concepts of James may seem antithetical to a modern audience, Stephen Raulston argues that for a medieval viewer they were not only compatible but representative of the same values; in his view, pilgrimage and crusade are both actions that fulfill “part of a providential plan whose success is assured by James’s patronage and miraculous, direct intervention.” Raulston bases his argument on close examination of altarpieces and sculptural series from Romanesque church portals, in which a medieval understanding of the world and cosmological events attempted to place current events into a larger, Biblical narrative, beginning with Adam. The history of humankind could be seen as a pattern of “exile, suffering, and reintegration,” a pattern into which the community-based Matamoros (crusade) and the individually focused Peregrino (pilgrimage) could easily fit.

Raulston supports his claim with primary-source evidence that is important to highlight in this study. In the *Codex Calixtinus*’ *Veneranda Dies* sermon, the act of pilgrimage to Compostela is established as an extension of the larger human experience, as the text equates the pilgrim with Adam, the first man; both are subject to exile in an attempt at self-exculpation. Gonzalo de Berceo’s later prologue to the *Milagros de Nuestra Señora romería* establishes pilgrimage as a microcosm of the universal human condition—that of suffering through earthly life in attempts to reach the eternal. Further, the 13th-century Castilian King Alfonso X’s...

45. Raulston pg. 346.
46. Ibid pg. 348.
47. Ibid pg. 351.
48. Ibid. Similar allusions are made to the experiences of other Old Testament figures such as Abaham, Jacob, Moses, and later Jesus. 352
49. Ibid pg. 354.
Primera Crónica General de España even establishes Spain as a kind of new Eden, making sense of the significant territorial gains accomplished under his leadership within the larger salvific narrative.\textsuperscript{50} The most iconic example of the unity of Pilgrimage and Reconquest, however, is another tale from the Codex Calixtinus in which St. James appears to Charlemagne in a dream, asking of him two things: to establish the pilgrimage route to his shrine and to reconquer the land lost to Islam. Here, pilgrimage and Reconquest were the two steps necessary to achieve the same, unified goal.\textsuperscript{51} This example speaks to the deliberate blending of the saint’s two attributes, suggesting that contemporary Iberians could have seen pilgrimage and crusade as complementary elements of the same ideal.

\textsuperscript{50} Ibid pg. 357.

\textsuperscript{51} Ibid pg. 361, 365. There are many, non-mythical examples of the unity of pilgrimage and reconquest. For example, Christian crusaders during the first Crusade were given pilgrims staffs along with the cross to equate the Crusades as a journey of pilgrimage.
Chapter 3

Nobility and Limpieza de Sangre

No dudes que el dinero es todo en todo;
es príncipe, es hidalgo, es caballero,
es alta sangre, es ascendiente godo.

Doubt not that money is all in all;
‘Tis prince, ‘tis hidalgo, ‘tis knight,
‘Tis high blood, ‘tis gothic line.

Ricardo, Act II, La prueba de los amigos, Lope de Vega

The above verses from master of Spanish Baroque theatre Lope de Vega reveal both the suspect nature of most claims to pure blood and the power of the purse in pursuit of noble status, the subject of the following chapter. More important, perhaps, are the verses’ portrayal of that which was culturally valued by early modern Spanish society but could never truly be bought: that is, Visigothic lineage and blood free from the taint of Jewish, Moorish, or converso ancestry. This is the concept of limpieza de sangre, one that haunted the Spanish imagination from the end of the 15th century through the first half of the 20th.

To understand the mentality of the 16th century, it is necessary we return to pre-1492 Iberia. Although giants of modern thought like Michel Foucault have argued that the notion of race did not exist before the 17th century, historian David Nirenberg advocates for a more nuanced understanding of race in the context of medieval Iberia, one that equated behavior and

---

52. Lope De Vega, La Prueba De Los Amigos, Comedia Inédita (Madrid: M. Rivadeneyra, 1873), 46. Translation: author.

53. Converso is used in this paper, as in early modern Spain, to denote those who are newly converted to Christianity, particularly, Jews who converted after the anti-Jewish pogroms of 1391.
appearance with biological reproduction. Hispanists like Americo Castro, an important albeit contentious figure in Iberian historiography, advocated for an understanding of the divisions among Muslims, Christians, and Jews in Medieval Spain as more alike to castes instead of races, as physical distinction between the groups was minimal if not nonexistent. This absence of consistent physical distinction will become vital to the understanding of Santiago as Matamoros as it necessitated the formulation of a protagonist in the advancement of Spanish Christendom’s mythological race. In any case, the theory of race is less important to this argument than is the understanding of race by Christians in early modern Spain.

According to Nirenberg, by the fifteenth century, Spanish Christians had already established a complex system of *raza, casta, or linaje*—terms used almost interchangeably to describe the conceptual and incorruptible link between “behavior and appearance to nature and reproduction.” Such theory was closely related to early modern genetic understanding that like begets like; human breeding was analogized to animal husbandry in texts both in Spain and across Europe. Reproduction of the flesh was thought to mirror reproduction of culture, and for this, one who was the product of Jewish or Muslim heritage could not be trusted to behave with Christian values, even after conversion and baptism. In the case of non-Christians, newly-converted Christians, or those descended from converted parents, it was believed that nature would ultimately take hold over nurture and the *cristianos nuevos* would return to their non-


55. Ibid pg. 77.

56. Ibid.
Christian roots, an idea at the heart of the establishment of the Inquisition in 1481. To assuage these fears, it was thus important for members of the Spanish elite to establish their freedom from such lurking ancestral threats by proving their *limpieza de sangre*, or purity of blood.

**Hidalguía and the Structure of post-Reconquista nobility**

The structure of Spanish nobility had solidified by 1300 into the "great houses" of Castile, Aragon, Navarre, and Portugal, as Bernard Reilly has described it, by "a carefully exaggerated family history, great wealth in land, and personal acquaintance with the crown." Below these members of the high nobility were the *hidalgos*, a word whose etymology breaks down into "hijos de algo," literally “sons of something.” Much more numerous than individuals belonging to the great houses, the *hidalgos* were usually owners of smaller properties who tried to ally themselves in some way with a great lineage. Below the *hidalgos* were the *caballeros villanos*, who were differentiated by their urban origins but who nevertheless were of economic means to afford the equipment necessary for mounted combat. As is clear from the requirements of nobility—that is, a bloodline free of non-Christian blood—the concepts of nobility and an uncorrupted, ancestral Christianity were steadfastly bound.

**Petitioning Noble Status**

An individual’s claim to noble status had to be substantiated for him to reap the benefits of his class. Social disruptions of Spain’s late medieval history, such as the success of *conversos* in the administrative sector, led to retaliation from *cristianos viejos*, who, in attempts to keep *conversos* out of the better jobs and appointments, sought to establish a codified structure of

---

57. Ibid pp. 79, 82. This idea lead to widespread persecution of conversos as manifest in anti-converso texts and local legislation. The Spanish monarchy eventually found it necessary to intervene with legislation protecting the rights of cristianos nuevos, mandating that they receive the same treatment as Christians by birth. This law, however, was not widely respected in practice.

58. Reilly pg. 147.

59. Ibid.
exclusion by means of noble status and blood purity. The end of the 15\textsuperscript{th} century witnessed legitimization of the process of appealing for noble status. In 1489, the Catholic Monarchs Ferdinand and Isabel formally established the \textit{Sala de los Hijosdalgo}, one of the four superior tribunals in the Chancillery of Valladolid.\footnote{Elisa Ruiz García, "La Carta Ejecutoria De Hidalguía: Un Espacio Gráfico Privilegiado," En La España Medieval Extra 1 (2006): pg. 257.} Under the authority of this tribunal, courts held hearings regarding nobility in Granada and Valladolid, formally permitting the testing and contesting of noble status. A defendant in such trials attempted to prove three issues: direct male descendence from an ‘ancient’ bloodline, legitimacy of birth, and \textit{limpieza de sangre}.\footnote{Ibid pg. 262.}

There were many ways of approaching the legal establishment of the purity of blood requisite for noble status, some more creative than others. Traditionally, the duty of maintaining accurate records of family heritage and nobility was the task of municipal authorities, despite their ledgers being notoriously incomplete or unfaithful to the truth. If such a paper trail did not exist, the gentleman in quest of status relied on outward displays of \textit{hidalguía} to witness his blood purity. Among the physical attributes that carried such meaning were the display of coats of arms and crests, service as financial patron of chapels, residence in ancestral homes, membership in noble confraternities, maintenance of public office, and abstinence from manual labor.\footnote{Ibid pg. 252.}

Proof of these characteristics lay principally in the confidence of the community; social perception was the ultimate factor in determining noble status, as evinced by the heavy reliance on witnesses during the trial.\footnote{Ibid pg. 262-3. The requirements of witnesses were extensive and illuminating. The list is long, but a few highlights are that a witness must know the noble in question and his family, know his marital status and know}
official, legal body through the acclaim of the unofficial, communal body. The highest level of hidalgo—_hidalgo de sangre_—was defined as an individual whose noble origins were outside the reach of memory, in other words, an individual possessing immemorial nobility.  This “social amnesia” is at the heart of the concept of the Inquisition, _limpieza de sangre_, and indeed, Santiago Matamoros; all were valiant attempts at forgetting Spain’s mongrel past in which blood lines of Christians, Moors, and Jews openly intermingled.

Because the protocol for determining an individual’s noble status was so ambiguous and in light of the tax money at stake, the process was a source of much legal dispute. In any case, according to Ruíz García, most legal records demonstrate that the origins of many such hearings stemmed from the petition of an individual who either felt marginalized or felt he deserved greater rights and privileges. Here, the growing anxiety of the individual in context of society emerges in a way unseen before the modern period. In Spain, a fledgling nation-state with a muddled recent past, this preoccupation appears to have been much more acute than in the rest of Europe. According to a 1591 census of Castile, the nobility represented an inflated 10% of the population, compared to the rest of Europe, whose nobility represented a more modest 3%. It

---

64. Ibid.

65. Ibid pg. 252-254. The legal difficulties went beyond local government, calling for royal decrees and mandates to control the process of conferring noble status. A series of laws were formed to address the process of gaining noble status, beginning with Juan I in the Courts of Burgos in 1379. Also of note are the 1398 laws of Enrique III at Toro, the 1436 laws of Juan II at Medina del Campo, the 1492 laws of Isabel and Ferdinand at Córdoba, and the 1593 laws of Felipe II. The goal of this legislation was to restrict the conference of more titles, as the monarchy relied on taxes to maintain its court.

66. Ibid pg. 252.

is in the context of this inflated noble class that the formal document known as the *carta executoria* emerged, becoming especially relevant for analysis of the state of Spanish identity during the early modern period. Within the illuminations of such documents emerges Santiago Matamoros, author of the myth of Christian Spain.
Chapter 4

The carta executoria de hidalguía

In the event of a successful plea for noble status in the tribunals of Valladolid or Granada, a hidalgo was permitted to commission two copies of an official document, called a carta executoria de hidalguía, to record the affirmation of his noble status.68 Such documents were produced in Iberia and in New Spain between the end of the fifteenth century and the beginning of the eighteenth century.69 Unfortunately, no catalogue or inventory of this body of manuscripts exists. However, scholars have identified certain patterns in production and ornamentation through study of these documents in special collections in Europe and the U.S. Most notable among these historians is Elisa Ruíz García, whose 2006 essay remains the most complete study of the type thus far.70

The Purpose of the Document

The carta executoria de hidalguía is both a legal document and a personal manifesto. In its legal function, the carta executoria served to distinguish formally between the estates, or class levels, of Spanish society. In its latter function, the document is both aspirational and affirmational, enabling its patron to pursue an elevated social arena by affirming an elite

68. One copy was left unadorned and was intended to be kept by the hidalgo’s local authorities for the purpose of legal record; wealthy hidalgos, however, often chose to send their newly-received patents of nobility to a scriptorium for illumination, a process which took, on average, 60 days to complete. Elisa Ruiz García, "La Carta Ejecutoria De Hidalguía: Un Espacio Gráfico Privilegiado," En La España Medieval Extra 1 (2006): pg. 264.

69. Rosario Marchena, "La iluminación de privilegios y ejecutorias: entre el arte cortesano y el arte local," in El arte en las cortes de Carlos V y Felipe II: IX Jornadas de Arte. (Madrid: Consejo Superior De Investigaciones Científicas, 1999), pg. 127.

ancestral status. According to Elisa Ruíz García, society of the early modern period throughout Europe but especially in Spain was greatly concerned with the legal establishment of class and the juridical distribution of the privileges that such status would provide. The *carta executoria*, in all of its illuminated splendor, gave material expression to these concerns.

**Commissioning Process, cost, and logistics**

As the name implies, the *carta executoria* was commissioned for those seeking the official status of *hidalguía*, or lesser nobility. As I have previously established, the *hidalgo* was not a part of the “great houses” of Spanish nobility, whose lineage was not in question. Instead, an *hidalgo*’s ancestry was incompletely recorded or questionable enough to require investigation and, ideally, confirmation of noble lineage for that individual to be recognized as an integrated member of noble society. Yet apart from the self-gratifying appeal of nobility and its social advantages, there were other, more palpable privileges to be garnered from this rise in status. Most important among these legal and material advantages was that hidalgo status afforded the gentleman and his family exemption from taxes. The eponymous protagonist of Miguel de Cervantes’ *El Ingenioso Hidalgo Don Quixote de la Mancha* famously enjoys this perquisite, which did not necessarily presuppose property ownership. Other advantages included entrée into privileged noble and monastic orders and the privilege to hold administrative offices reserved to

71. Ibid pg. 252.
72. Ibid.
73. Ibid.
74. Ibid pg. 253.
cristianos viejos. Clearly, there was strong impetus for an aspiring hidalgo to seek confirmation of disputed noble status in the legal system.\textsuperscript{75}

**Codicology and Illustrations**

The format, text, and illumination of the *carta executoria* follow a strictly established formula. It was usually produced in the style of a journal in one or more volumes, each of about 50 leaves.\textsuperscript{76} A product of the post-Gutenberg world, the document is nonetheless hand-written in calligraphy with machine-like precision that betrays its genesis in scriptoria and workshops.\textsuperscript{77}

The text of most every *carta executoria* begins with a mention of the King under whose authority the document is produced, enumerating his political virtues and territorial holdings, followed by a description of the chancellery in which the plea was heard. The text goes on to list the motivations for the plea along with the exhaustive evidence spoken in favor of the defendant’s noble status, typically concluding with a list of the date and place of the patent’s issue.\textsuperscript{78}

Customarily, the *carta executoria* is elaborately illustrated in the first opening only, with periodic rubrication found in the rest of the document. In more expensive copies one occasionally notes ornamentation in the second opening as well. Ruiz García divides the subjects of these illustrations into three main categories—judicial, noble, and religious. Illustrations of the first category might include miniatures representing the tribunal courts in which nobility was granted or denied, such as in a 1611 example from Valladolid [fig. 17], or a portrait of the King, under whose authority noble status was conferred, as seen in another detail.

\textsuperscript{75} Interestingly, tensions began to rise between town councils and those petitioning for noble status as their tax exemption took a toll on the municipal purse. See Ibid pg. 253.

\textsuperscript{76} Ibid pg. 265.

\textsuperscript{77} Ibid.

\textsuperscript{78} Ibid pg. 261.
from the same document featuring a portrait of King Phillip III [fig. 18]. Illuminations dealing explicitly with noble status featured genealogical trees, as in the Tree of Jesse style illumination from a 1602 example [fig. 19], family portraits, such as in the illumination depicting the González family from 1613 [fig. 20], and heraldic symbols, such as coats of arms [fig 21]. The third and most important category to our study is that of religious representations. These devotional illuminations occasionally celebrate scenes from the life of Christ, such as the baptism and crucifixion. Lesser saints included in the marginalia were determined by geography, and Mary appears in a respectable number of the illustrations, as in two examples from the Valladolid school in the late 16th century [figs. 22, 23].

However, no figure appears with quite the force and constancy of Santiago Matamoros. In a wide survey of carta executoria examples, one can reasonably expect over half the manuscripts encountered to include Santiago Matamoros as a principal or secondary part of the document’s opening decorations. Whether galloping across an entire leaf, mounted in a small portion of the marginalia, or proudly brandishing a sword within a historiated initial, Santiago’s presence in many ways legitimizes and, to borrow from Javier Domínguez García, “hispanicizes” the claim and the claimant. Typical of the genre is the image that opens a 16th-century carta executoria from the Archivo Histórico Nacional, in which the saint, mounted on his white steed and wielding a sword and banner, cutting the Moorish enemy to pieces [figs. 24-25]. The presence of Santiago Matamoros within the context of the nobility patent raises a number of issues, Self/Other, hegemony/subalternity, just/unjust, and good/evil principal among them.

79. Marchena pg. 131.
Typical examples of this illumination are seen in figures 26-33, images which will be compared in detail with Bridwell’s MS.46 in the following chapter.

Why Santiago Matamoros?

Rosario Marchena proposes several reasons for the inclusion of Santiago Matamoros within the _carta executoria_ genre. First, she argues that illustrators and patrons chose to include Santiago Matamoros in their nobility patents because the Saint is the official champion of the very fight against the infidels from which the concept of nobility springs. This argument permits a smooth union of the concepts of _limpieza de sangre_, _hidalguía_, and Santiago Matamoros.

Second, Marchena cites various events in the late 16th century, including the uncertain situation created by territorial skirmishes with the Ottoman Empire, as reason enough to remind Spanish Christians of the still-existing threat Muslims posed to their national identity, making an illustration of Santiago Matamoros an appropriate acknowledgement of the contemporaneous political climate. Marchena additionally includes a more practical reason for the choice of Santiago Matamoros: hidalgos may have chosen to depict Santiago Matamoros so commonly in the _cartas executorias_ because in the image’s allusions to the Reconquest there is an implicit justification of the tax break afforded to hidalgos, whose sacrifices in battle obviated their financial duties to the crown. For Marchena, the inclusion of Santiago Matamoros in the context of a nobility patent serves to remind the viewer of the military obligations and triumphs, past and future, of the lesser nobility in Spain. Yet I believe that behind this reason lies a more ideologically compelling impetus for the decision to illustrate nobility patents with the image of James as Moor-slayer as of yet unexplored by scholars of Spanish cultural history: that is, the forging of personal and national identity.

---

81. Ibid pg. 133.
The “Spanish Ideology” and the Fashioning of Christian Spain

The discussion of Santiago Matamoros and limpieza de sangre within the context of cartas executorias de hidalguía permits insight into the making of both individual and national identity in early modern Spain. Stanley G. Payne describes the origins of the latter in a manner particularly apt for this study:

Virtually throughout Spanish history there has been an idea or a set of attitudes that can be called the 'Spanish ideology'…[which] refers first of all to the opinions originally established… in the kingdom of Asturias-Leon during the ninth century. According to this, the kingdom (which would be the original nucleus of the eventual Spanish monarchy) was charged with a primordial mission to fight for Christendom, expanding its own frontiers and rescuing land lost to the Muslims. At first the Spanish ideology was a fundamentally minoritarian current that did not triumph completely until the end of the fifteenth century, reaching a climax in the reigns of the Catholic monarchs and Philip II only to fall into decay in the latter part of the seventeenth century.82 [emphasis added]

Payne traces the peak of this ideology—the “primordial mission to fight for Christendom”—to the reign of Philip II (r. 1554-1598), a timeline that coincides with the late-sixteenth century peak in commissioning of cartas executorias in Spain and the production of Bridwell’s MS.46, executed in 1567. That such an ideology was so eagerly accepted during the period most fertile for the production of cartas executorias speaks to their shared objective.

Scholars of wider European history confirm the 16th century as an epoch particularly rich for the tailoring of individual and national identities. Stephen Greenblatt’s 1980 text Renaissance Self-Fashioning examines writing in the English Renaissance in attempts to understand the role of human autonomy in the construction of identity. Greenblatt defines self-

fashioning in 16th-century England as the phenomenon that "occurs at the point of encounter between an authority and an alien," a definition particularly relevant to Spain, where encounter with the real or imagined “alien”—a quotidian experience well into the early modern period—became a source of great anxiety.\(^8^3\) The idea of self-fashioning gathered urgency in the 16th century, not just in Britain but in all of Western Europe, as the impositions of family, state, and religion became more inelastic.\(^8^4\) Greenblatt’s exploration of the phenomenon of constructing self-identity ties well into the concept of *limpieza de sangre* and proof of nobility in early modern Iberia.

Greenblatt's thesis, that “in the sixteenth century there appears to be an increased self-consciousness about the fashioning of human identity as a manipulable, artful process,” is relevant to the question of the legal process of proving nobility through commissioning a *carta executoria de hidalguía*.\(^8^5\) Within the context of this theory, one might view an individual who attempts to prove legally his noble status as in some ways attempting to author himself and his family into the "stable, inherited social world" of established Christian society.\(^8^6\) Among the ten conditions that Greenblatt posits as common to most instances of self-fashioning in the 16th century, three are especially relevant to the *carta executoria de hidalguía* and the official establishment of noble status: first, that self-fashioning must involve a submission to an absolute authority that lies outside the self (such as the Church), second, that self-fashioning is realized through the negation of that which is understood to the threatening Other, which "must be


\(^8^4\) Ibid pg. 1.

\(^8^5\) Ibid pg. 2.

\(^8^6\) Ibid pg. 8.
discovered or invented in order to be attacked and destroyed," and third, that because the Other is in many ways needed to define the Self, the destruction of said Other always results in some loss of Self.\textsuperscript{87}

In the context of these three conditions, it becomes clear why Santiago Matamoros was so popular in the marginal illuminations of cartas executorias. First, self-fashioning in the search to prove noble status appealed to no fewer than three formal authorities: the Church in attempt to prove Christian lineage, the courts and Crown in attempts to receive official documentation of such status, and finally divine patronage in the form of God, Mary, and the saints to assure favor. Second, a petition for noble status was realized precisely through negation of a relationship with or descent from the threatening Other—in the case of nobility patents and early modern Spanish culture in general, the Moor, who represented the universal, threatening Other. And finally, in its representation of Santiago’s battle against a Moor who was in fact long gone from Spain, the image of the Matamoros actually helps preserve the existence of the non-Christian Other, without whom Christian identity would be so much harder to define.

A discussion of self-definition and alterity would not be complete without mention of the theories proposed by Edward W. Saïd’s seminal 1978 book Orientalism. In his text, Saïd argues that the West defines the Orient as “other than” itself, a rhetoric that permits the West to caricaturize the Orient while, more importantly, defining itself. Although his text primarily focuses on the West’s exoticizing of the East in the 19\textsuperscript{th} and 20\textsuperscript{th} centuries, I will cautiously apply a part of his framework to our discussion of Santiago Matamoros in the 16\textsuperscript{th} century. Saïd describes “Orientalism” as “the corporate institution for dealing with the Orient…a Western style for dominating, restructuring, and having authority over the Orient.”\textsuperscript{88} This phenomenon derives

\textsuperscript{87} Ibid pg. 9.
\textsuperscript{88} Ibid pg. 9.
from what Saïd describes as a “particular closeness” experienced between Britain, France, and their colonies.\(^8^9\) I propose that the visual language offered by Santiago Matamoros images also springs from a situation of closeness and yet results in a statement that is quite unique. After over seven centuries of coexistence, it is precisely the *particular closeness* between Christian and Semitic Spain that encourages the creation of a visual formula to fulfill the ideological desire to deal with the past.\(^9^0\) Unlike post-colonial British and French Orientalism, however, this Matamorian ideology is not meant to “dominate, restructure, or have authority over the Orient” or the Other but rather, through rejection of the physical and historical ties with the Other, to have *authority* or authorship over the self.\(^9^1\)

\(^8^9\) Ibid, p. 4.
\(^9^0\) This is not to suggest that the “particular closeness” of convivente Spain, in which Christians and “Moors” struggled for centuries to exchange control and power, and Britain and France with their colonial holdings, in which the Colonizer was in constant control and domination of the Colonized, are in any way comparable.

\(^9^1\) Ibid, p. 3.
Chapter 5

The Bridwell Example

Executed in 1567, the Bridwell manuscript [figs. 34-38] was commissioned at the late 16th-early 17th century peak of production of the *carta executoria.* As its text reveals, this nobility patent was commissioned in favor of Miguel de Carabeo of Ciudad Rodrigo to illustrate the purity of his line after having been granted official hidalgo status by the tribunal courts of Valladolid. Each leaf of this 54-leaf manuscript measures 34 centimeters tall and 24.5 centimeters wide, an average length and size for this type of document. The document is bound in a single gathering and covered in gold-tooled leather of a deep brown. Surrounding the text of the first opening are 14 centimeters of illustration length-wise and 12 centimeters of illustration width-wise, the rest of the document ornamented only by initials in gold on red or blue. The entire text is delivered in a single column of even Gothic rotunda and is signed and dated on the final leaf 23 October, 1567.

The first opening of the interior of the manuscript is lavishly illuminated in splendid hues of crimson, azure, gold, and green [fig. 34]. The overall decorative scheme for the work is comprised of religious, heraldic, and floral motifs. In the upper left quadrant of the first leaf, the letter D from the document’s opening line “Don Felipe” is historiated, with Miguel de Carabeo’s family crest displayed on a field of blue [fig. 35]. The left, right, and bottom borders of the left leaf along with the right and bottom borders of the right leaf depict insects, birds, and flowering vines on a ground of gold leaf. The left and upper borders of the right leaf boast delicate gold

93. Ibid, pg. 265.
filigree on a red ground. In a circular niche at the bottom of the left leaf stands an allegorical figure in robes of pale orange, rose, and green carrying scales and wielding a sword in a field of greenery, perhaps representing Justice in an allusion to the proceedings of the tribunal in Valladolid that legalized Miguel de Carabeo’s noble status [fig. 37]. This figure finds its match on the opposite leaf in a similar cartouche, where a mythical figure, likely Orpheus, charms a variety of beasts and birds with his *vitula* [fig. 37]. The top of the border of this page is crowned by a gold-on-blue christogram [fig. 38]. A series of three smaller cartouches inhabit the right border of the left leaf and the left and right border of the right leaf, depicting the Latin phrase *Veritas Vincit*, St. Michael slaying a wild man or devil, and Santiago Matamoros respectively [figs. 34, 36].

Most interesting to this argument is the interplay between the coat of arms within the historiated D and the cartouche depicting the equestrian St. James. Let us begin our exploration of this iconography with a closer look at the Carabeo arms, found in detail in figure 35. A reader accustomed to the language of heraldry will recognize the illumination as depicting the full achievement with a helm at the chief, with mantling forming backdrop and support for the escutcheon, party per pale. Half I is divided again per pale, with dexter sable charged with bend vert, sinister divided per fess vert and gules, in the chief a single tower argent, in the base a lion rampant or. Half II is divided per fess, in the chief gules charged with five heads of Saracens couped, four in profile one affronté, with a helm atop, base per pale argent and azure, five trefoils vert adextré, five bezants or pierced gules senestré. A reader less familiar with the genre will find the illustrations at the end of this paper extremely useful.

Each segment of the escutcheon charged with an image serves to represent a branch of Miguel’s family tree, an illustration appropriate in the context of a document which traces the
Carabeo Christian line through several generations. The most striking segment of these particular arms for this paper is the upper-right quadrant, which depicts the severed heads of five turbaned Saracens, or *moros*. What makes these figures Moors is neither their complexion nor their facial hair, for each is as white as the saints depicted in the borders of the manuscript, but their turbans and, more importantly, their lack of bodies. The moor’s head is among the most common examples of human anatomy depicted as heraldic charges, usually used as a manifest of proven success in the Crusades, and Miguel’s arms are no exception. Indeed, including the severed head of a Moorish or black figure in a family crest is common throughout Europe, even appearing in the current crest of Pope Benedict.94

Traditional studies of Heraldic symbolism, such as the work of W. Cecil Wade, do not dare delve into the complex ideological implications of the moor’s head within coats of arms. However, modern scholarship, particularly the work of Inés Monteira Arias, confronts the phenomenon with a more critical perspective. Monteira Arias considers the inclusion of such symbols as trophy-heads, reminders of past military success in the battle against Muslims and thus *limpieza de sangre*. She highlights the inexplicitness of the reference—for her, the lack of gore in such illustrations serves to create diluted and stylized reminders of past violence, barely obscuring their bloody history.95 The appearance of the five Moors’ heads in the arms of Miguel de Carabeo surely suggests the purity of the Carabeo family and its past commitment to fight for Christendom.

The ideological heart of the Carabeo *carta executoria* illustration lies in the dialogue between these headless Saracens and the small depiction of *Santiago Matamoros* riding in the

---


95. Ibid, p. 141.
right-most margin of the opening. Enclosed in a small cartouche is James, robed and haloed on his steed, with a single, turbaned head rolling under his feet [fig. 36]. Like the Moors depicted in the family crest, the Moor here has only a head; his body is excluded from the illumination. This combination of Santiago illustration and coats of arms in *cartas executorias* was not unexpected for the genre. Of all the illustrations included in this study of *cartas* depicting Santiago Matamoros, all five include coats of arms as an accompaniment to the illuminations. Yet none of the crests encountered in this study depict moor’s heads as part of their heraldry, suggesting that the Carabeo arms are, in relative terms, unique.

Let us combine Monteira Arias’ observation, the lack of gore in the Moors’ head symbol, and my own, the lack of bodies in both heraldic Moor’s heads and in Santiago Matamoros scenes, particularly those in *cartas executorias*. I have already argued that the choice to illustrate a nobility patent with Santiago Matamoros defeating moors in battle serves both as a statement of blood purity and an attempt to distance Christian Spain from its *convivente* past. But what of the style of such representation in the Carabeo example? I read the “cleanliness” of these images, the relative lack of blood and removal of the body, along with the allowance of a holy, non-earthly figure in Santiago to serve as the agent of violence and expulsion, as a further and final attempt to argue for *limpieza de sangre* and to make physical an ideological distance. The ultimate statement of separation from the Other, a bloodless, bodiless, and, arguably, humanity-less enemy is defeated by the Divine, leaving the Christian body unsullied and free from the anxiety-inducing physical interaction with the Other that was once a quotidian reality.
Chapter 6

Making Meaning out of Santiago Matamoros

In the context of the *carta executoria*, it would seem that James as Moor-Slayer acts as the iconographic bowdlerizer of a murky genealogical past. Thematically compatible with most of the rest of the history of Spain, the presence of Santiago Matamoros as a standard type in the nobility patent is simultaneously an act of acute denial and extreme self-awareness; Santiago Matamoros both annihilates the possibility of a Jewish or Moorish stain on the family tree, and yet exonerates the hidalgo for its likely presence. For the purposes of proving purity of blood, the Moor, in accordance with the theories of Greenblatt and Saïd, is both discovered and invented only to be attacked and destroyed. The Moor’s head, cleaned and removed from the context of battle, preserves the existence of the enemy, allowing Christian identity a perfect foil. Simultaneously and perhaps paradoxically, the denial of a physical and historical relationship, a source of great anxiety to early modern Spain, is permitted through this stylization.

The abundance of such a violent image within such a supremely personal document ultimately raises more questions than answers. This study represents a small but needed contribution to an as of yet prematurely explored field, examining a phenomenon thus far largely overlooked by scholarship. I end it here in hopes of soon having the freedom to survey a larger body of *cartas executorias*, a study that permit more tested conclusions on the relationship between Santiago, nobility, and blood purity in early modern Spain.
Bibliography


Fernández Fernández, Laura. "Imagen e Intención. La Representación de Santiago


de Vega, Lope. La Prueba De Los Amigos, Comedia Inédita. Madrid: M. Rivadeneyra, 1873.
Figures

Figure 1. José Gambino, Santiago Matamoros, 18th century, Cathedral of Santiago de Compostela. Statue in original state. Photo: Cris Tobio and Antonio Hernández for El Correo Gallego.

Figure 2. José Gambino, Santiago Peregrino, 18th century, Cathedral of Santiago de Compostela. Photo: Associated Press.

Figure 3. José Gambino, Santiago Matamoros, 18th century, Cathedral of Santiago de Compostela. Lower elements of statue covered with floral arrangement. Summer 2006. Photo: Cris Tobio and Antonio Hernández for El Correo Gallego.

Figure 4. Detail from a nave mosaic depicting the Last Supper, Sant’Apollinare Nuovo, Ravenna, Italy, 6th century

Figure 5. Saint James the pilgrim, manuscript illumination on parchment from a French Book of Hours, c. 1500.

Figure 6. Antonio and Piero del Pollaiolo, Altarpiece of the Three Saints (Vincent, James, and Eustace), tempera on wood, Galleria Uffizi, 1446-1447.

Figure 7. St. James sculpture from interior of Capilla del Condestable, begun 1482, Cathedral of Santa Maria, Burgos.
Figure 8. Outside of Burgos, Spain, a stylized scallop shell adorns a marker, guiding the pilgrim towards Galicia.

Figure 9. A scallop shell sign marks a sundries shop catering to pilgrims along the route in Vézelay, France. Photo: author, 2009.

Figure 10. Santiago as Warrior from the Pilgrim’s Guide, Salamanca Codex, 14th century.

Figure 11. Santiago, relief over tympanum, South portal of Cathedral of Santiago de Compostela, completed 12th century.

Figure 12. Santiago Matamoros, oil on canvas, Cuzco School, late 17th century.

Figure 13. Martin Schongauer, St. James and the Saracens, also known as St. James and the Turks or St. James at the Battle of Clavijo, engraving, 15th century.
Figure 14. The ensiform cross of the Military Order of Santiago.

Figure 15. Trajan fighting the Dacians, from the Great Trajanic Frieze, Arch of Constantine, Rome, 312-315 CE, frieze c. 117-120.

Figure 16. Equestrian figure on the façade of Saint-Pierre at Parthenay-le-Vieux, c. 1110.

Figure 17. Detail from an illumination depicting the Tribunal Court of the Salon of the Gentlemen in Valladolid. From the *carta executoria* in favor of don Juan Gutiérrez de Solórzano, Valladolid 1611. National Historical Archive, Madrid.

Figure 18. Detail from an illumination depicting King Felipe III of Spain. From the *carta executoria* issued for don Juan Gutiérrez de Solórzano, Valladolid 1611. National Historical Archive, Madrid.

Figure 19. Detail depicting a genealogical tree in the style of a Tree of Jesse, from the *carta executoria* issued for don Juan de Ballesteros Saavedra, Granada 1602. Municipal Museum, Madrid.
Figure 20. Detail of illumination showing marriage portrait with children (smaller figures) in attitude of prayer, from carta executoria issued for Alonso González, Valladolid, 1613. Private collection, Madrid.

Figure 21. Detail of an illumination depicting the Palomeque family crest, from the carta executoria issued for Cristoval Palomeque, Valladolid, 1577. Bodleian Library, University of Oxford.

Figure 22. Detail of an illumination depicting the Palomeque family before the Virgin and Child, from the carta executoria issued for Cristoval Palomeque, Valladolid, 1577. Bodleian Library, University of Oxford.

Figure 23. Detail of illumination depicting the Virgin and Child and a coat of arms, carta executoria issued for the brothers Pablo and Bartolome Gascon, Valladolid, 1569. Private collection, Spain.

Figure 24. Opening illumination depicting Santiago Matamoros at left and the Annunciation at right, first half of the 16th century, National Historical Archive, Madrid.

Figure 25. Detail of Santiago Matamoros, from a carta executoria from the first half of the 16th century, National Historical Archive.
Figure 26. Opening illumination from the *carta executoria* in favor of Juán García y la Puente, Granada, 1543. Collection of Lawrence J. Schoenberg.

Figure 27. Detail of Santiago Matamoros from illumination for the *carta executoria* in favor of Juán García y la Puente, Granada, 1543. Collection of Lawrence J. Schoenberg.

Figure 29. Detail of Santiago Matamoros from the illumination for a *carta executoria*, c. 1575-1599. Free Library of Philadelphia, Lewis E 058.

Figure 30. Opening illumination for a *carta executoria*, c. 1585-1599. Free Library of Philadelphia, Lewis E 059.
Figure 31. Detail of Santiago Matamoros, from a *carta executoria*, c. 1585-1599. Free Library of Philadelphia, Lewis E 059.

Figure 32-33. Opening illumination for the *carta executoria* in favor of Alonso Gallego and detail of Santiago Matamoros, 1592. New York Public Library, Spencer Collection, NYPL Spencer 163.
Figure 34. *Carta executoria* in favor of Miguel de Carabeo, 1567. Bridwell Library Special Collections, MS.46.
Figures 35-38. Details depicting the Carabeo coat of arms, Santiago Matamoros, mythological figures, and a Christogram from the *Carta executoria* in favor of Miguel de Carabeo, 1567. Bridwell Library Special Collections, MS.46.