

Southern Methodist University

SMU Scholar

Graduate Liberal Studies Theses and
Dissertations

Graduate Liberal Studies

Spring 5-15-2020

Forgotten: A Study of the Long-Term Economic Ramifications Suffered by Survivors of Violence Against Females Sustained During State-Terror such as Genocides

Natasha Holmark Andersen
natashaholmark@gmail.com

Follow this and additional works at: https://scholar.smu.edu/simmons_gls_etds



Part of the [Domestic and Intimate Partner Violence Commons](#), [Family, Life Course, and Society Commons](#), [Gender and Sexuality Commons](#), [Holocaust and Genocide Studies Commons](#), [Other Feminist, Gender, and Sexuality Studies Commons](#), [Other International and Area Studies Commons](#), [Political Economy Commons](#), [Political History Commons](#), [Political Science Commons](#), [Social History Commons](#), [Women's History Commons](#), and the [Women's Studies Commons](#)

Recommended Citation

Andersen, Natasha Holmark, "Forgotten: A Study of the Long-Term Economic Ramifications Suffered by Survivors of Violence Against Females Sustained During State-Terror such as Genocides" (2020). *Graduate Liberal Studies Theses and Dissertations*. 4. https://scholar.smu.edu/simmons_gls_etds/4

This Thesis is brought to you for free and open access by the Graduate Liberal Studies at SMU Scholar. It has been accepted for inclusion in Graduate Liberal Studies Theses and Dissertations by an authorized administrator of SMU Scholar. For more information, please visit <http://digitalrepository.smu.edu>.

4/16/2020

Forgotten

A Study of the Long-Term Economic Ramifications
Suffered by Survivors of Violence Against Females
Sustained During State-Terror such as Genocide

Natasha Holmark Andersen
SMU GLS THESIS

Table of Contents

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	ii
<i>Abstract</i>	iii
<i>Executive Summary</i>	iv
<i>Introduction</i>	1
<i>An Introduction to State Terrorism</i>	2
<i>An Introduction to Genocide as State Terrorism</i>	8
<i>Comparisons to Other Forms of State Terror</i>	17
<i>Violence Against Women in State Terrorism</i>	18
<i>Commonly Known Ramifications of Violence Against Women</i>	37
<i>Economic Ramifications of Violence Against Women</i>	42
<i>Conclusion</i>	68
<i>Bibliography</i>	77

Acknowledgements

A master's thesis does not just happen, it takes determination, dedication, and a lot of help! Therefore, there are some people that I would like to acknowledge for what they have done to enable me to write this thesis.

First and foremost, I would not have been able to write this thesis, let alone take a master's degree, if not for my loving and supporting family. Through the nervous breakdowns and the late-night writing sessions my family has been there to help me through it all.

I would also like to acknowledge Dr. Rick Halperin, who walked me through the extensive process of creating a master's thesis. Supportive of my ideas from the very start and a constant rock throughout the process, Dr. Halperin has been a most needed guide through the uncertainties involved in this process.

Last, but not least, I need to acknowledge those individuals that have most helped my research, primarily being Mr. Tom Petrowski, Dr. Elizabeth Wheaton, and Dr. John Cox. Each of these individuals have been invaluable through the process of writing my thesis and have shown enthusiasm about my project.

Abstract

In an attempt to answer the question: What are the long-term economic ramifications of sexual violence against females in state terror such as genocide? This paper explores the thematic elements and the conducive factors to the existence of sexual violence in state-terror genocides, as well as enlightens the reader of the following effects upon women survivors.

To do this, the paper first explores the elements of terrorism and apply them directly to state terror. The notion that states are immune from the blame of terrorism is acknowledged and debunked, thereby furthering the association between terrorism and acts of state terror. Next, genocide is defined as the most atrocious act of state terror, and its elements and effects are discussed with the purpose of providing some background information as to the setting discussed in the inquiry. For those wondering about the exclusion of war crimes and crimes against humanity there is a short explanation of why those will not be covered in the paper.

The paper then changes focus to specific violence against women committed during genocides. Several examples are used in an attempt to provide a wide-reaching and comprehensive analysis of the atrocities committed specifically against women during state-run genocides. Briefly, the paper then acknowledges the many other implications and conditions brought on through the violence inflicted. Thereafter, the paper attempts to answer its central question by providing examples of various economic costs incurred by both survivor and state and attempts to explain the wide-reaching impacts those costs entail. Lastly, the paper notes that there is room for further research into this area of study.

Executive Summary

This paper attempts to answer the question: What are the long-term economic ramifications of sexual violence against females in state terror such as genocide? It does so by taking a comprehensive look at the phenomena of state terror, genocide, specific violence towards women, other ramifications of that type of violence, and the economic costs incurred by survivors of it.

The main arguments of the paper are as follows:

- State terrorism is any premeditated act or threat of violence against non-combatant civilians for a political purpose with the result of an atmosphere of fear among the targeted group
- Genocide is the most atrocious form of state terror, largely defined through mass murder and mass graves but includes many different types of violence that should be noted
- Violence against women takes many forms: physical, verbal, psychological, spiritual, financial, and sexual. Sexual violence against women is by far the most dangerous.
- Violence against women is a widespread and systematic weapon used throughout multiple genocides with detrimental effects.
- Women survivors continue to suffer after the violence through physical injuries, psychological damage, societal stigmas, repression, disease, and sometimes from unwanted children
- There are multiple, far-reaching, and long-term economic effects that are inflicted through the use of violence against women in state-run genocides.

The findings of this paper are that women suffer an immense plethora of economic costs due to experiencing severe violence at the hands of the state. Some of these costs include health care costs, unemployment, exploitation, and many more.

As the research done for this paper is part of a new up-and-coming perspective on genocides, it barely scratches the surface of the issue, despite showcasing the multitudes of challenges faced by survivors. There is further research needed post-thesis which should look closer at the specific economic costs, as opposed to the general costs, and the long-term impact of those costs.

Readers who are interested in learning more about terrorism should consider Cynthia Combs's *Terrorism in the Twenty-First Century*, those interested in genocides should consider Adam Jones's *Genocide: A Comprehensive Introduction*, those interested in violence against women should see Pamela Hogan's *I Came to Testify*, and those interested in economic ramifications will find a good read in Dr. Elizabeth Wheaton's *The Economics of Human Rights*.

Introduction

State terrorism, genocide, and violence against women are not new phenomena. State terror and genocides have been occurring for centuries, if not millennia, and women have often been targets of both, particularly with regards to the use of sexual violence. What has not been taken into account throughout history, however, is the accounts of survivors of sexual violence after the state-run genocides have ended. Researchers and historians alike tend to talk about the atrocities of genocides as occurring during a set period of time with nary a thought given to how these people are faring post-genocide; the few times that survivors are mentioned, it is only through the lens of mental and physical well-being. As such, this paper asks the question: What are the long-term economic ramifications of sexual violence against women in state terror such as genocide?

Despite the copious amounts of research done on terrorism, on genocides, and even on the methods of violence against women, there has been little to no research done on the economic effects of such violence with regard to how women cope post-attack nor how it affects businesses and even nations. Therefore, to answer this question of effects, this paper will first provide a thorough background of state terrorism as well as genocide followed by a few clarifications concerning war crimes and crimes against humanity. Thereafter, this paper will delve into the types of violence that women experience during state terror and the immediate effects that follow this type of violence. Lastly, this paper will provide a coherent analysis of the economic effects that follow women after being exposed to and victimized by sexual violence during state terrorism, or more specifically, genocides.

An Introduction to State Terrorism

One must first have a working definition of what terrorism is to be able to discuss it. This becomes quite a daunting task as there are over one hundred definitions of terrorism available¹ from governments, non-governmental organization, intergovernmental organizations, and even amongst scholars. The United States of America alone have at least five different definitions depending on what part of government or law enforcement is asked. The U.S. Department of State relies on an aspect of “premeditated” acts by “subnational groups or clandestine agents” for political purposes against noncombatants², whereas the U.S. Department of Defense, in their definition, does not note the who nor premeditation but includes both property as a target as well as religious and ideological motives for the violence³. The U.S. Department of Homeland Security has a third notion of terrorism that includes intent as well as the tactics of assassination and kidnapping⁴ which are not present in the other definitions. Furthermore, dictionaries are of little use when trying to obtain a comprehensive definition as many, including the Oxford English Dictionary, do not delve into the details that set terrorism apart from other fear-mongering tactics⁵.

This still leaves the question, what is terrorism? Broader definitions, generally designed by scholars, consider the following elements in their definitions: intent, usage and/or threat of

¹ Wheaton, Elizabeth M.. *The Economics of Human Rights*. Routledge, New York, NY, 2019. Print. p156

² Combs, Cynthia C.. *Terrorism in the Twenty-First Century*. 8th ed. Routledge, New York, NY, 2018. Print. p7

³ Ibid.

⁴ Howard, Russell D., and Bruce Hoffman. *Terrorism and Counterterrorism: Understanding the New Security Environment*. 4th ed. McGraw-Hill, New York, NY, 2012. Print. p26

⁵ Howard, p4

violence, fear as an outcome, a political purpose, and civilian targets⁶. For the purposes of this paper it is important to have a broader definition of terrorism as many state definitions of terrorism narrows down the potential perpetrators to non-state actors in an attempt to save their own hides. Therefore, this paper's working definition of terrorism will be as follows: premeditated acts or threats of violence against noncombatant civilians for a political purpose with the outcome of fear amongst the targeted population. Moreover, as terrorism inherently involves a disregard for the human rights of its targets⁷, it is important to note that those committing terrorism are either in a position of great power and have access to resources, or are in a position of acute despair providing no alternative to acts of terror. Terrorism can be utilized as a tactic by anyone, particularly those who carry a specific grievance against a population⁸, and therefore it is not unlikely to see state terrorism as governments can carry grievances against groups within their nations⁹.

One of the biggest flaws of modern definitions of terrorism is that they limit the actors to non-state or individual actors. States have historically committed horrendous acts of terrorism and continue to commit these acts against their own citizens¹⁰. Thus, modern day terrorists are seemingly more willing to use weapons of mass destruction because states have done so before them¹¹, thereby indicating that modern terrorists have been inspired by government actions. Furthermore, many of the definitions that do highlight state terrorism do so only in the financial

⁶ Wheaton, p156; Howard, p5; Paust, Jordan J. "Human Rights, Terrorism, and Efforts to Combat Terrorism". In Mertus, Julie A., and Jeffrey W. Helsing. *Human Rights & Conflict: Exploring the Links Between Rights, Law, and Peacebuilding*. USIP, Washington DC, 2006. Print. p240

⁷ Mertus, Julie A., and Jeffrey W. Helsing. *Human Rights & Conflict: Exploring the Links Between Rights, Law, and Peacebuilding*. USIP, Washington DC, 2006. Print. p15

⁸ Payne, Richard J.. *Global Issues*. 4th ed. Pearson Education, Upper Saddle River, NJ, 2013. Print. p93

⁹ Ibid.

¹⁰ Combs, p8 & p24

¹¹ Combs, p81

sense, meaning that the funding of terrorism¹² can be contributed to state governments but not the acts themselves. This can also be seen through the 1999 International Convention for the Suppression of the Financing of Terrorism which leaves all control of punishment and regulation to the state governments and without making terrorism a direct crime to be punished¹³. When terrorism can be committed by anyone and modern terrorists are inspired by previous state terror, why then do international documents refuse to list states as actors in their definitions of terrorism?

The answer may lie in the concept of sovereignty. For centuries the concept of sovereign immunity has embodied international relations from the divine right of kings¹⁴ and up through today. Sovereign immunity posits that states cannot interfere in other states' domestic affairs as they are sovereign rulers of what goes on within their own nations¹⁵. This notion has proven to hold throughout several instances of state terror, and it even interferes with regard to the universality of human rights as state advocates of cultural relativism refuse to incorporate certain rights into their country's law and practice¹⁶. Sovereign immunity has been upheld for this long as states are concerned that once they interfere in the domestic affairs of another state, they open themselves up to be interfered with¹⁷. Therefore, states are very reluctant to intervene in other countries despite knowing of the atrocities that occur there. Concerns over interfering remain to

¹² Wheaton, p162

¹³ Robertson, Geoffrey. *Crimes Against Humanity: The Struggle for Global Justice*. 3rd ed. The New Press, New York, NY, 2006. Print. p556

¹⁴ Robertson, 342

¹⁵ Frieden, Jeffrey A., David A. Lake, and Kenneth A. Schultz. *World Politics: Interests, Interactions, Institutions*. 3rd ed. W. W. Norton & Company, Inc, Canada, 2016. Print. p71

¹⁶ Callaway, Rhonda L., and Julie Harrelson-Stephens. *Exploring International Human Rights: Essential Readings*. Rienner, Boulder, CO, 2007. Print. p109

¹⁷ Frieden, p492

this day as many nations worry that human rights violations are occurring in places like Myanmar and China¹⁸, but little is done as interference invites interference.

The notion of sovereign immunity, however, is being challenged. Newer notions of accountability have produced institutions such as the International Criminal Court (ICC) which will prosecute state leaders for crimes they have committed against their people¹⁹. The ICC's founding document, which is still used today as the Court's Charter, the Rome Statute, was created in 1998²⁰ as the international community realised that they needed a judicial branch to help moderate the prosecution and sentencing of the serious state-run atrocities that had been ongoing in the 1990s. The Statute, and by extension the Court, were later ratified and established in 2002. The remarkable thing about the International Criminal Court, when it was established, was that in its documentation it defined the crimes of genocide, war crimes, and crimes against humanity which was hitherto unheard of²¹ as such grave crimes were mainly committed by states who had, up until 2002, largely enjoyed the impunity offered under sovereign immunity. In practice, the ICC undertakes investigations and trials where the gravest atrocities have been committed, no matter who perpetrated those injustices, as the ICC believes that international justice to be the key to lasting peace and equitable development²². Though, as will be shown later, the sentencing of perpetrators is not enough to constitute peace and spark equitable development, it is a step in the right direction against impunity and in the newly emerging campaigns for human rights.

¹⁸ Frieden, p492

¹⁹ Chong, Daniel P. L.. *Debating Human Rights*. Rienner, Boulder, Co, 2014. Print. p96

²⁰ International Criminal Court. "*About the International Criminal Court*". International Criminal Court. Web.

²¹ Ibid.

²² Ibid.

The same notions that saw to the creation of the ICC have also enabled vast legislation and treaties within intergovernmental organizations attempting to hold accountable those who abuse their power²³. Furthermore, perpetrators of human rights violations and of terrorism are less frequently being granted amnesties or safe passage by any nations specifically due to that new notion of accountability²⁴. However, despite these progressive steps, international organizations remain highly apolitical as legislation is written to suit sovereign states and sovereigns can add reservations to the legislation which only affects them²⁵. Moreover, the system of state reporting available in the United Nations (UN) that is supposed to be a tool of accountability ends up being almost useless as the reports are to leave out “hurtful criticism” as the UN must not be seen as taking sides where state sovereignty is involved²⁶.

However, as there is legislation controlling the actions of international armed conflict – protecting civilians, banning sexual violence, protecting critical infrastructure, etc. – it follows that there should also be accountability in internal conflict²⁷. Therefore, this paper reasserts the need for the concept of state terrorism, or terrorism committed by a state, as it pertains to the actions of a government against its own people and should be held accountable regardless of the notion of sovereign immunity.

State terrorism, or “exterminatory mass violence” as some describe it, is committed by the agents of a state including, but not limited to, military, police, and bureaucratic

²³ Callaway, p4

²⁴ Buergenthal, Thomas. “*The Normative and Institutional Evolution of International Human Rights.*” In Callaway, Rhonda L., and Julie Harrelson-Stephens. *Exploring International Human Rights: Essential Readings.* Rienner, Boulder, CO, 2007. Print. p80

²⁵ Robertson, p192

²⁶ Robertson, p177

²⁷ Tadić Case (Prosecutor v. Duško Tadić) (1995), ICTY, The Hague, HRLJ 16, p426 (Trial Chamber), p437 (Appeals Chamber). In Robertson, p382

administrators²⁸, with the intent to subdue certain groups within the nation²⁹. Generally, there is an element of power in the decision of a government to abuse its own citizens, specifically as abuses are often directed at political dissidents³⁰, persons of differing religious or ethnic backgrounds, and those seen as a threat to the governments continued power. Within the definitions that take into account state terrorism, it is generally agreed that there are levels of severity involved when the state is the actor³¹. The first level of state terror is called intimidation and involves discouragement of opposition and dissent through state media and increases in police activity³². Examples of this include the use of propaganda by a government to sway opinions of a group in both Nazi Germany and Rwanda leading up to their respective genocides. The next level of severity is coerced conversion which involves government changes to national life and forcing behavioural changes upon its people³³. This particular type of state terrorism is most often seen post-revolution when governments are enforcing a new way of life upon a nation. The last, and most severe, level of state terrorism is genocide, or the deliberate extermination of groups within the state by those in power, such as was seen in Nazi Germany, Rwanda, Bosnia, Cambodia, and Sudan³⁴.

For the purposes of this paper, only the most severe form of state terrorism will be considered: Genocide. It should, however, be noted that less severe levels of state terror may well be indicators of an impending genocide as states may restrict civil liberties, ban political parties, and/or round up individuals of certain groups prior to committing the actual genocide³⁵,

²⁸ Jones, Adam. *Genocide: A Comprehensive Introduction*. 2nd ed. Routledge, New York, NY, 2011. Print. p64

²⁹ Combs, p98

³⁰ Frieden, p505

³¹ Combs, p98; Payne, p107

³² Ibid.

³³ Ibid

³⁴ Ibid.

³⁵ Jones, p571

as such lower levels of state terror should be noted and acted upon should new cases of state terror arise in present day. State terrorism, particularly when at the level of genocide, is far more deadly than regular terrorism as it is not just one act, but instead it is systematic and widespread acts of terror that are specifically designed to eliminate a group's present and future existence³⁶. Moreover, state terror genocides are often based on the notion of "other" particularly with respect to the targets of the genocide. Governments utilize racial analogies when ostracizing a religious or ethnic group from what they consider their own group³⁷. Lastly, it is essential that not only official government declarations be considered state terror, but rather the actions of any government, de facto government, police, military, secret service, or authoritative figure all be considered as government actions³⁸ due to their proximity to government and their overarching authority over the people they are terrorizing.

An Introduction to Genocide as State Terrorism

Before delving into the specifics of genocide and the ways in which it constitutes state terror, it is important to note that the phenomenon of genocide is far older than the study of it³⁹. The large-scale extermination and destruction of groups and peoples has been around for millennia, but the study of it did not feature until recent decades. Simply the term, genocide, was not invented until the early 1940s and was not used until the 1950s, sometime after the world had seen a massive systematic eradication of a people and deemed it inhumane. Raphaël Lemkin,

³⁶ Combs, p107; Howard, p13; Balakian, Peter. *The Burning of the Tigris: The Armenian Genocide and America's Response*. Harper Perennial, New York, NY, 2003. Print. p65

³⁷ Weitz, Eric D.. "A Century of Genocide." In Meierhenrich, Jens. *Genocide: A Reader*. Oxford University Press, Oxford, 2014. Print. p71

³⁸ Rummel, R. J.. "Death by Government." In Meierhenrich, Jens. *Genocide: A Reader*. Oxford University Press, Oxford, 2014. Print. p77

³⁹ Meierhenrich, Jens. *Genocide: A Reader*. Oxford University Press, Oxford, 2014. Print. p19

inventor of the term ‘genocide’, wanted the word to not only mean the extermination of a people, but also the deportation, the starvation, the suppression, and the control over procreation that came with a genocide⁴⁰. To date, the most important document in the field of genocide is the United Nations Convention on the Prevention and Punishment of the Crime of Genocide which, though signed in 1948, first came into effect in 1951⁴¹. This document outlined not only the acts which constitute genocide, but also the acts which were punishable concerning genocide as well as affirming that genocide, whether committed during conflict or peace, is a crime⁴².

The Convention, which is the leading document on genocide, lists “national, ethnical, racial or religious” groups as potential targets of genocide⁴³. However, that excludes the potential targets of political, social, sexual, and economic groups⁴⁴ within a nation which sets the latter groups at risk for severe violence without international recognition or intervention. Furthermore, the document creates a focus on proven intent to commit genocide as a factor when considering whether a state terror atrocity actually is genocide, however, this creates a host of problems as states are generally covering their true intent with cover stories in order to obscure their true intents from the rest of the world⁴⁵. State terrorism, and genocide in particular, is generally done in secret so as to avoid other the pressure asserted by other states at the gross human rights violations that are committed⁴⁶, as such intents are not often noted in writing and become very hard to prove in a court of law.

⁴⁰ Power, Samantha. *‘A Problem from Hell’: America and the Age of Genocide*. Basic Books, New York, NY, 2002. Print. p40

⁴¹ Convention on the Prevention and Punishment of the Crime of Genocide. United Nations General Assembly, 1951.

⁴² Ibid.

⁴³ Ibid.

⁴⁴ Cox, John. *To Kill A People: Genocide in the Twentieth Century*. Oxford University Press, Oxford, 2017. Print. p6

⁴⁵ Cox, p9

⁴⁶ Combs, p99

It is pertinent to understand what genocide actually is and what it entails before moving on to the specifics of the violence against women committed during this type of state terror.

As former UN Secretary-General Kofi Annan stated: “A genocide begins with the killing of one man – not for what he has done, but because of who he is”⁴⁷. Now, the killing of one man does not warrant a declaration of genocide, but the principle that the targeted groups are killed not for anything that they have done, but rather because of who they are or what they believe in is essential to the concept of genocide. In the most basic description of the concept, genocide is the mass murder of essentially defenseless and helpless human beings⁴⁸, and while this is without a doubt a true statement, it fails to signify the utter destruction of the targeted group and the malicious tactics used against them in the pursuit of their destruction. According to Raphaël Lemkin, genocide is not solely the mass murder of a group but any systematic actions taken against them with the specific aim of exterminating the group⁴⁹; this can involve the destruction of that group’s culture, politics, religion, economic capabilities, their security, health, and dignity⁵⁰. An important thing to remember with the targeting of culture and language is that those things take centuries to create but can be almost instantly destroyed beyond any hope of regaining them⁵¹. Perhaps most important is the fact that these destructive acts are sustained by and purposeful for the perpetrator⁵², meaning there is a policy that is carried out over a length of

⁴⁷ Jones, p25

⁴⁸ Charny, Israel W.. “*Toward a Generic Definition of Genocide.*” In Meierhenrich, Jens. *Genocide: A Reader.* Oxford University Press, Oxford, 2014. Print. p85

⁴⁹ Lemkin, Raphaël. “*Genos and Cide.*” In Meierhenrich, Jens. *Genocide: A Reader.* Oxford University Press, Oxford, 2014. Print. p58

⁵⁰ Lemkin in Meierhenrich, p58; Power, p43

⁵¹ Power, p43

⁵² Fein, Helen. “*Genocide: A Sociological Perspective.*” In Meierhenrich, Jens. *Genocide: A Reader.* Oxford University Press, Oxford, 2014. Print. p74

time making this form of terrorism much more destructive than what is considered terrorism in present day.

There are many tactics that states use when committing genocide. Aspects of political, social, cultural, and economic life are altered, biological factors are highlighted and the undesired are marginalized, physical destruction, religious persecution, and attacks centered on the morality of a group take place⁵³. Structural violence and politically induced discrimination often precede the more severe episodes of state terror⁵⁴. More specifically, genocide entails “murder, mutilation, rape, kidnapping, property destruction, land seizure, economic restriction... control of reproduction”, torture, and deportation⁵⁵. These tactics, though deadly in their own respect, would be nowhere near as impactful without political opportunities such as external wars, civil wars, or decolonization⁵⁶. Political opportunities can also help to create fear of ‘others’ amongst a national population as there is an implied, if not a real, threat⁵⁷, which can single out entire groups within a nation for ostracization by the population as well as make it easier for the government to impose their reign of terror over the now helpless group.

When looking through history, it is clear that political opportunity plays a large part. The Nazis in Germany would not have gotten their hands on nearly as many Jews as they did without some impressive military conquests – 95% of the Jews slaughtered in the Holocaust resided outside of Germany proper⁵⁸. Likewise, in Rwanda, there was evidence of political opportunity

⁵³ Lemkin in Meierhenrich, p59-61

⁵⁴ Jones, p47

⁵⁵ Wheaton, p220; Robertson, p383

⁵⁶ Krain, Matthew. “*State-Sponsored Mass Murder: The Onset and Severity of Genocides and Politicides.*” In Meierhenrich, Jens. *Genocide: A Reader*. Oxford University Press, Oxford, 2014. Print. p481

⁵⁷ Frieden, p506

⁵⁸ Bergen, Doris L.. *War & Genocide: A Concise History of the Holocaust*. 2nd ed. Rowman and Littlefield, Lanham, MD, 2009. Print. p172

as decolonization had left two ethnic groups at each other's throats⁵⁹ as the Tutsis had been favoured over the Hutus by the Belgians, which led to the Hutu overthrowing the Tutsi government post-independence in 1962⁶⁰. This disequilibrium of political favour and power has subsequently caused severe resentment and lingering feelings of ethnic hatred which enabled the genocide. Similarly, in western Sudan, a political opportunity arose for President Omar al-Bashir when a civil war enabled him to arm militia groups and send them into Darfur to eliminate civilians⁶¹. And lastly, if it had not been for the First World War, then the situation leading to the Armenian genocide would not have caused as severe an outcome as it became, and likely would not have led to genocide⁶².

Once political opportunity has been established by the reigning government, there are many preliminary steps taken at the beginning of genocides that may not be quite as visible as the genocide itself. Social and cultural violence are generally considered measures that impose a national judicial system and limit the interactions of the targeted group within the larger 'national' group⁶³. These types of actions were quite prevalent in Nazi Germany in the form of racial laws against those considered undesirable as well as the Jews. The Nazis first created laws regarding the limitation of their undesirables such as the Sterilization Law of 1933 which gave Nazi Germany the right to sterilize anyone deemed genetically defective against their will⁶⁴. Forced sterilization, as will be discussed later, also constitutes sexual violence. Furthermore, later in 1935, the Nazi government would introduce the Nuremberg Laws that effectively

⁵⁹ Chernotsky, Harry I., and Heidi H. Hobbs. *Crossing Borders: International Studies for the 21st Century*. SAGE Publications, Thousand Oaks, CA, 2013. Print. p201

⁶⁰ Frieden, p243

⁶¹ Chong, p66

⁶² Cox, p53

⁶³ Lemkin in Meierhenrich, p59

⁶⁴ Proctor, Robert N.. *Racial Hygiene: Medicine Under the Nazis*. Harvard University Press, Cambridge, MA, 1988. Print. p96

stripped Jews of their citizenship⁶⁵, thereby enabling state persecution. In addition, in 1938 the Nazi government in Germany introduced laws that would cut Jews out of public life and would destroy monuments and rename any and all things with Jewish names⁶⁶. Essentially, these laws effectively swept any trace of the Jewish people from German life and made the Jews completely stateless, thereby enabling the quiet gathering and mass murder of millions. Social and cultural violence are often precursors to full genocide, particularly as the laws and changes made enable other types of violence, however, they are often overlooked in favour of the generic focus on mass murder and massacres that so cling to genocide studies.

The outright killing of many genocides tend to overshadow the economic aspects of these atrocious systems of state terror. Economic aspects, however, are very important to consider as they include the lowering of the standard of living, depriving people of their means of existence, and confiscation of property⁶⁷. A vivid example of these kinds of tactics can be seen in the deportation of Armenians. The Armenians were given little notice of their imminent deportation and as such they suddenly lost their jobs, thereby depriving them of their existence, they no longer had anywhere to live, thereby lowering their standard of living, and they were forced to dispossess as they could not bring all of their possessions with them when deported⁶⁸. U.S. Consul Leslie Davis wrote that the Turkish reaction to the dispossession of the Armenians was like “vultures swooping down on their prey” as they exploited the opportunity to “get-rich-quick” at the expense of the Armenians⁶⁹.

⁶⁵ Proctor, p131

⁶⁶ Lemkin in Meierhenrich, p59

⁶⁷ Lemkin in Meierhenrich, p60

⁶⁸ Jones, p157

⁶⁹ Ibid.

Biological measures are present in almost all genocides, especially when considering that most genocidal regimes have to specify an “other” and has to make a case for why those people specifically have to go, meaning there has to be a process of dehumanization; biological measures also include undernourishment of the oppressed, and policies aimed at decreasing the birthrate of the “other” population⁷⁰. In the case of Rwanda, the colonizing Belgians took care of distinguishing the two dominant ethnic groups as they favoured the Tutsi specifically because of their supposed better eugenics, i.e. their larger skull size and their lighter skin⁷¹. Furthermore, the undernourishment and the separation of genders experienced during the deportations of Armenians created a situation in which the Armenians had been so biologically dehumanized as to be compared to “dust-covered skeletons” driven insane and scrambling for any food scraps they could find⁷². It is also interesting to note that biology is the reason for different treatment during a genocide, as men are more likely to be targeted for outright murder, and women are targeted for sexual violence.

Physical destruction is probably the most evident part of genocides, particularly as many definitions of genocides involve the words ‘mass murder’ which would probably not be the case if violence was not as prominent. There are countless examples of murder, starvation, liquidation, deportation, and many other methods of killing throughout the world’s history of genocides, but some of the more significant ones include the terrorization of the Polish Jews by the German police and military⁷³; the massacre of approximately 200,000 people during the event known as the Rape of Nanking, and the subsequent murder of somewhere between 4 to 6

⁷⁰ Lemkin in Meierhenrich, p60

⁷¹ Chernotsky, p203

⁷² Jones, p158

⁷³ Bergen, p106

million people during the Japanese occupation of China through World War II⁷⁴, through means such as forced labour, sexual slavery, and horrific medical experiments⁷⁵; the 1994 Rwandan genocide, which rivaled the Nazi Holocaust in efficiency despite being carried out through more primitive means⁷⁶, but managed to murder over 800,000 people in just 100 days⁷⁷; the 300,000 people wiped out in Darfur in 2003⁷⁸, while others were raped or made to flee through the burning of villages⁷⁹; approximately 200,000 Armenian men were killed early on in the 1915 genocide through extermination by forced labour or outright murder⁸⁰, a new method of massacre was also introduced through the Armenian genocide – specifically the deportations that were used as means of robbery and destruction⁸¹; Bosnia, between 1992 and 1995, saw nearly 200,000 killed through atrocities such as the Srebrenica massacre⁸², and mainly of battle-aged men to the point where of the people listed as missing after the war, 92% were men⁸³; and last, but not least were the massacres in the Cambodian killing fields of the 1970s wherein one to two million people died of starvation, overwork, and executions⁸⁴ in a country of only seven million at the time⁸⁵.

Physical violence is such a prevalent and obvious form of violence that it is the main thing that stands out when outsiders look into what went on during the violent period. Mass graves and the amount of bodies that have piled up are much more visible and much more

⁷⁴ Cox, p29

⁷⁵ Ibid.

⁷⁶ Cox, p100

⁷⁷ Chong, p65

⁷⁸ Chong, p66

⁷⁹ Jones, p372; Combs, p101

⁸⁰ Jones, p156

⁸¹ Ibid.

⁸² Chernotsky, p201

⁸³ Jones, p323-324

⁸⁴ Cox, p122

⁸⁵ Cox, p144; Combs, p99

striking than the destruction of specific buildings or the atrocities that have been committed against those that survived. Invisible scars and traumas are not physically visible and as such are often ignored or overlooked in deference to amass a death toll. Therefore, genocide, and the study of genocide, has been focused on mass murder and massacres neglecting many other of the forms of violence present during a genocide, at least until recent studies.

Genocides are often wrought with religious undertones both in the ideologies that are proliferated by the governments perpetrating genocide and in the choosing of targets that impact the groups being eliminated. In the Armenian genocide, churches were blown up and graveyards with generations of families were plowed over to make room for new fields for the Turks to grow corn and wheat⁸⁶. During the Holocaust, synagogues were burned to the ground on Kristallnacht while German firefighters looked on but did nothing⁸⁷. The targeting of religious symbols for destruction, and the use of religious buildings for atrocities like the mass rapes in Bosnia and Rwanda⁸⁸, serve not only to cause despair among the targeted group, but also as a tool for demoralization of the targeted group.

Demoralization is, in and of itself, a tool of genocides utilized by states to break the will of the targeted groups and a way to ensure that the future of the group is uncertain within the country. Through the radical and swift elimination of men, the remaining Armenians were so thoroughly demoralized that they were rendered helpless and therefore became easy targets for the Turks' genocide against them⁸⁹. Armenian women and children were then rounded up and offered up to Turks, Kurds, or anyone else interested in them either as sexual labour, servants, or

⁸⁶ Jones, p157

⁸⁷ Bergen, p85-86

⁸⁸ MacKinnon, Catherine quoted in Fox, Nicole. *Memory in Interaction: Gender-Based Violence, Genocide, and Commemoration*. Signs: Journal of Women in Culture and Society 45, no 1 (Autumn 2019): 123-148. p136

⁸⁹ Jones, p156

‘wives’ and ‘children’⁹⁰. In Bosnia, the Serb genocide strategies and demoralization of the Muslims was supposed to render the country so ethnically pure that never again would Muslims and Serbs be able to live together⁹¹. When an ethnic group has been made to believe that even if the violence stopped they wouldn’t be able to live in the country they’re from, they have been demoralized to the point where they will not put up much of a fight to stay there.

These are only a few of the tactics that have been utilized by states throughout the genocides of the twentieth and twenty-first centuries, and many more that have yet to be mentioned. However, in the interest of this paper, the very specific genocidal tactic of sexual violence, particularly against women, will be discussed at great length. First, though, there are some distinctions that need to be made and some terms that need to be established before continuing through to the widespread use of sexual violence and violence against women that is rampant in state-run genocides.

Comparisons to Other Forms of State Terror

Genocide is not the only form of state terror. Both war crimes and crimes against humanity are forms of state terror, and they constitute many of the same atrocities as genocide does: murder, destruction, enslavement, and extermination⁹². What distinguishes the three types of severe state terror is the environment in which it happens. War crimes are confined to atrocities that take place during times of international war against either the enemy or civilians⁹³. Crimes against humanity, a concept that predates that of genocide, is confined to widespread and

⁹⁰ Jones, p158

⁹¹ Jones, p322

⁹² Payne, p55

⁹³ Robertson, p383

systematic attacks against civilians not necessarily in times of conflict⁹⁴, though what sets it apart from genocide is the fact that genocide has the specific goal of eradicating a specific group, whereas crimes against humanity can be against entire populations or specific groups⁹⁵.

Having made this distinction and emphasizing that this paper specifically focusses on the state terror of genocide, there is one common clause to each of these state terrors that is of specific significance to this paper. Each one of these distinct state terrors include the crimes of rape and sexual violence in their definitions, though they were not included officially in any of their definitions until 1993⁹⁶, highlighting that even the acknowledgments of the crimes are relatively new, and, as such, the study of them remain recent as well.

Violence Against Women in State Terrorism

In the study of genocide most attention has been focused on the experiences of men, particularly men of ‘battle-age’ which generally means any man between the ages of sixteen and sixty⁹⁷. As genocide often occurs within the parameters of some form of conflict, be it international or domestic, ‘battle-age’ men are those who may be able to serve in the military, meaning they are the largest threat to the governments committing genocide, and therefore, they are the ones who are targeted for immediate slaughter⁹⁸. While this aspect of genocide is undoubtedly true and has been documented for decades, this focus on genocide as solely being

⁹⁴ Robertson, p383; Mertus, p222

⁹⁵ Jones, p539

⁹⁶ Mertus, 227

⁹⁷ Jones, p323

⁹⁸ Jones, p465

mass-murder has an unfortunate and undesirable effect in the field of genocide studies. The focus on mass-murder during genocides suggests that women are exempt from the violence and suffering that a genocide imposes purely because they survived it, however, nothing could be further from the truth⁹⁹. The sole focus of mass murder leaves out the horrifying experiences that women suffer during a genocide and overlooks those women who are killed¹⁰⁰. This exclusion may have been, in large part, due to the fact that women have historically been seen as lesser than, or irrelevant to history, and to include their stories of suffering would have given relevance to the experiences of women, which was frowned upon¹⁰¹.

More recently, however, the study of women has begun to surface, though it has not been an easy journey. Bringing relevance to women's stories and experiences has been an uphill struggle as, at the start, gendered studies were seen as unseemly given the nature of horror inflicted on all during a genocide¹⁰². When gender studies had gained more of a foothold within academic scholarship, gender scholars were accused of ignoring or belittling the experiences of men during genocides¹⁰³. When that had then been remedied, gender studies were accused of ignoring the fact that women could be perpetrators too¹⁰⁴. These criticisms have placed the studies of women's experiences in direct competition with those of men for severity and importance, and also seem to indicate that men suffer the worse fate because they are the ones who are outright killed¹⁰⁵. However, as previously stated, the incessant insistence by prior research to focus solely on the mass murder aspect of genocide leaves out important and

⁹⁹ Jones, p469

¹⁰⁰ Jones, p470

¹⁰¹ Joeden-Forgey, Elisa von. *Gender and the Future of Genocide Studies and Prevention*. Project Muse. Genocide Studies and Prevention, vol 7 no 1, spring 2012 (p89-107). Article. p89

¹⁰² Ibid.

¹⁰³ Joeden-Forgey, p90

¹⁰⁴ Ibid.

¹⁰⁵ Ibid.

significant stories of suffering induced by genocide. Focusing only on the killing aspect of genocides completely ignores the horrific crimes of sexual violence and the life-long effects that that type of violence can, and does, have on women¹⁰⁶. Fortunately, it has come to light that gendered studies are not trying to compete for importance, but rather to provide a more complete analysis of these atrocious state crimes¹⁰⁷.

Despite the fact that gendered approaches to the study of genocide are becoming more mainstream and better accepted, it is vital to underline that though the focus here is almost solely on the experiences of females during genocide, the experiences of men are no less important nor degrading. The sole focus on female's experiences is not meant to proclaim that men do not suffer as much as women during genocides, nor that men's experiences are invalid. However, as the suffering of females has been neglected for centuries, the intent here is to highlight the gross human rights violations that women suffer during genocides that many men are not subject to, and to emphasize that those types of violence has long lasting effects for the survivors.

Genocidal assaults by governments tend to have an inherently gendered approach. Members of the targeted group are targeted, again not for what they have done, but rather for who they are. As such, the perceived gender roles and the symbolic statuses of the targeted members are taken into account when genocides are perpetrated¹⁰⁸. Men are targeted as protectors, warriors, leaders, and patriarchs; women are targeted as mothers, providers, and as bearers of life¹⁰⁹. These roles are quintessentially gendered, and the methods used against them in a genocide are equally as gendered. Therefore, it is important to understand that equally

¹⁰⁶ Joeden-Forgey, p90

¹⁰⁷ Ibid.

¹⁰⁸ Joeden-Forgey, p95

¹⁰⁹ Ibid.

significant to mass murder of men is the systematic use of rape as a weapon of genocide against women.

“An act which is wicked in itself becomes especially wicked... when deployed systematically and for political ends”¹¹⁰. Violence against women is a common feature amongst genocides whether through rape, sexual torture, forced maternity or forced abortion, sexual exploitation, or any other type of sexual violence¹¹¹. It is a weapon of war that has long been overlooked despite its demeaning nature and many ill-effects. Sexual violence as a tool of genocide falls under multiple factors as it attacks women for the cultural value, because of their biology, it is physically destructive, and it is demoralizing not only to the women but to the community as well. Specifically, genocidal sexual violence and genocidal rape is committed under orders¹¹². Rape is used as a tool to kill, to exile, to degrade, to terrorize, to destroy a people, and to shatter lives for a specific political end, usually annihilation of the targeted group¹¹³. The use of systematic rape is often meant to hurt the broader society of the targeted group as, in many societies, the sexual virtue and fidelity of the women is emphasized and prized, therefore, through rape they degrade and devalue the women of that society to the point where those closest to the women are humiliated by their victimization¹¹⁴. Therefore, the brutalization of the women is compounded with the humiliation of the entire group and the marginalization of the women post-genocide¹¹⁵.

¹¹⁰ Robertson, p393

¹¹¹ Joeden-Forgey, p90; Wheaton, p224

¹¹² Fox, p123

¹¹³ MacKinnon in Fox, p123; Cox, p166

¹¹⁴ Cox, p166

¹¹⁵ Ibid.

It is for these reasons that women's experiences should not be ignored nor forgotten. Too much focus on mass murder would overshadow the deleterious effects that mass rape and sexual violence have both for the women and for the society. By destroying a group's ability to reproduce, one destroys that group's chance of a future¹¹⁶. Sexual violence, particularly when systematic and widespread, destroys a group's capacity to rebuild and to restart¹¹⁷. This means that not only does the sexual violence hurt the women and the society during the genocide, it has the lasting effect of limiting the targeted group in the long-term. Moreover, sexual violence, especially early in the genocides, is often committed in front of a family member in order to humiliate and devalue the entire family in one foul, malicious swoop¹¹⁸. Though it is often believed that genocidal ideology takes precedence over systematic violence against women, the sheer malevolence inherent in debasing a woman in front of her family implies that the violence committed against women is as important to the perpetrators as the genocidal ideology¹¹⁹. This is further evidenced by the fact that the systematic rape of women was ordered by the governments in power during the genocides as a tactic for the genocide itself¹²⁰.

There are many factors that lead to the use of sexual violence as a tool of genocides. Cultural and historical norms have created certain roles and confines that women are forced into, some of which cause an economic dependence on men as well as fewer social protections for the women¹²¹. Hatred and misogyny also play a part in the use of sexual violence specifically to exert the maximum amount of damage to the women and to the societies with respect to life-

¹¹⁶ Joeden-Forgey, p94

¹¹⁷ Joeden-Forgey, p95

¹¹⁸ Joeden-Forgey, p103

¹¹⁹ Joeden-Forgey, p92

¹²⁰ Ibid.

¹²¹ Callaway, p177

giving capacities¹²². Misogyny and sexism also play a large part in assessing the threat level toward women in the targeted group. High levels of sexism amongst the perpetrators indicates that the actions and insults directed against one woman are a threat to all the women of that group¹²³. Religion also plays a role, though mainly in the post-genocide phase, which was particularly evident after the Bosnian genocide when the Serb Orthodox Church tried to stop medical supplies from reaching refugees because of its dogmatic beliefs¹²⁴. Some scholars suggest that the prevalence of sexual violence in genocide is manifested in a trifecta of beliefs: the view of a woman as part of her community group, the view of a woman as a commodity, and the view of a woman as an enemy¹²⁵. No matter the reason or reasons why, sexual violence is as pervasive as mass murder in genocides to the point where it is difficult to estimate just how many women are or have been affected¹²⁶.

Moving on from the whys of violence against women and the facts around the systematic use of such violence, it is important to know what is included under the headings ‘violence against women’ and ‘sexual violence’, and how it is perpetrated.

Violence against women, as the overarching concept, involves physical, psychological, economic, and sexual abuse towards women specifically for the feeling of control that the perpetrator gains¹²⁷. Wheaton discusses six types of violence that are often aimed at women both in genocides and in domestic settings¹²⁸ – though the domestic setting is not considered in this

¹²² Joeden-Forgey, p93

¹²³ Warren, Mary A.. *“Gendercide: The Implications of Sex Selection”*. In Meierhenrich, Jens. *Genocide: A Reader*. Oxford University Press, Oxford, 2014. Print. p79

¹²⁴ Robertson, p624

¹²⁵ Gangoli, Geetanjali. *Engendering Genocide: Gender, Conflict and Violence*. Women’s Studies International Forum 29 (2006) 534-538. Article. p535

¹²⁶ Cox, p167

¹²⁷ Wheaton, p97 & p112

¹²⁸ Wheaton, p98-100

paper, it is interesting to note that the violence that appears on a large scale during genocides is also perpetrated in peacetime in people's homes. The first type of violence is physical violence and involves actions meant to inflict pain or injury such as hitting, using objects or weapons to inflict pain, withholding medical treatment, and forced weather exposure¹²⁹. Wheaton does make the distinction that terroristic violence has a more severe connotation as it is the "systematic, serious, and frequent" use of violence to ensure complete deference to the perpetrators¹³⁰. Verbal violence is specific to what the perpetrators say and how they say it, meaning anything from demeaning slurs to threats on the victims' lives¹³¹. Emotional, or psychological, violence is actions targeted toward the mental state of the victim including manipulation, isolation, and harassment¹³². Spiritual violence involves prohibiting victims from practicing their religion or using it against them¹³³. Sexual violence, which is very prevalent in genocides, occurs when the victim is forced or coerced into sexual activity against her will. This particular kind of violence can take many forms such as, but not limited to, rape, transmitting sexual diseases, and sexual slavery¹³⁴. Last, though no less important, is the notion of financial abuse which can either consist of the perpetrator inhibiting financial independence of the victim, or it can be the perpetrator abusing the financial assets of the victim¹³⁵. Each of these types are prevalent during genocides and are (with the exception of physical violence) largely directed toward women only.

Sexual violence and abuse are by far the most pervasive forms of violence against women in genocides. When speaking about this type of violence, however, it would be wrong to simply

¹²⁹ Wheaton, p98

¹³⁰ Ibid.

¹³¹ Wheaton, p99

¹³² Ibid.

¹³³ Ibid.

¹³⁴ Wheaton, p99; Adams, Adrienne, et. al.. *Development of the Scale of Economic Abuse*. Violence Against Women Vol 14 no. 5, Sage Publications, May 2008 (p563-588). Article. p564

¹³⁵ Wheaton, p99; "Development of the Scale...", p565-566

call it rape, even systematic rape, as it consists of so much more. Sexual violence during genocides appear through “systematic rape, forced maternity, rape as a means of murder, and sexual torture, gang rape, coerced rapes between family members, sexual mutilation, forced prostitution, sexual slavery, rape in rape camps, women forced to ‘marry’ genocidaires,” etc.¹³⁶. The more of these that are perpetrated in a period of time, the clearer the genocidal intent becomes, particularly when reflecting upon the effects that sexual violence can inflict upon the women victimized by it. Sexual violence, in itself, is a characteristic of the most dangerous and violent relationships¹³⁷. Add to that the physical injuries a woman can sustain through involuntary sexual activity, particularly at the hands of a physically abusive perpetrator, such as broken bones and severe bruising, the gynecological problems that may follow such as infertility and miscarriages, as well as the psychological effects such as depression, anxiety, and suicidal tendencies¹³⁸. These details indicate that the specific use of sexual violence during genocides is specifically chosen to inflict the most damage possible on the women of the target group.

When considering different types of violence, there are certain indicators that need to be taken into account, namely prevalence, severity, and impact. Prevalence, being the spread and/or frequency of a certain type of violence¹³⁹, is a key indicator of genocide and of genocidal intent as there needs to be a significant number of victims before an event of state terror can be called a genocide. Severity, being the consideration of the harshness of a specific outbreak of violence¹⁴⁰, indicates the seriousness of an event of state terror. For example, if mass murder of men along with the sexual violence against and exploitation of women are prevalent together, severity

¹³⁶ Joeden-Forgey, p92

¹³⁷ “*Development of the Scale...*”, p564

¹³⁸ Ibid.

¹³⁹ Wheaton, p98

¹⁴⁰ Ibid.

would be considered high, meaning the genocide was quite serious and highly detrimental to the survival of the group. Impact, being the measurement of how a type of violence affects people¹⁴¹, is a good indicator for how a targeted group might either be able to rebuild or have no chances of returning to life after the genocide.

Furthermore, it is important to note that these tactics of sexual violence, and for that matter the genocides themselves, happen despite the copious amounts of international legislation banning them. Legal protections concerning women's rights have only recently been made available in the latter decades of the twentieth century and, as such, are severely lacking in both reach and enforcement¹⁴². This is particularly true of the legislation that is supposed to protect women and children against targeted violence, which includes both the 1974 U.N. Declaration on the Protection of Women and Children in Emergency and Armed Conflict and the 1993 U.N. Declaration on the Elimination of Violence Against Women. Simply the fact that not even two decades passed between the first and the second declaration showcases that violence against women was, and still is, a major concern as neither document is enforced. Going further back, the 1948 Universal Declaration of Human Rights (UDHR), which is supposed to guarantee the rights of all, was ignored to the point where two more documents had to be added simply to underline that women had those same rights.

Taking into account only the most recent document, that of the 1993 Declaration on the Elimination of Violence Against Women, it is clear that there is was severe deficit in the practice of protections concerning women. The entire first page dedicated to reminding states and organizations that the rights of the UDHR apply to everyone and that women and women's

¹⁴¹ Wheaton, p98

¹⁴² Chernotsky, p247; Callaway, p177; Power, p485; Wheaton, p102; *United Nations Declaration on the Elimination of Violence Against Women*, United Nations, 1993.

groups should be taken seriously in all aspects of modern state life¹⁴³. Not only that, but Article Four of the declaration which proclaims that states should take all immediate efforts to eliminate violence against women includes the assertion that “states... should not invoke any custom, tradition or religious consideration to avoid their obligations,”¹⁴⁴ indicating that many states, and indeed many governments, are quick to dismiss violence against women simply as something that happens in their culture and nothing worth noting. Moreover, the fourth article of the declaration has no less than seventeen subclauses intended to ensure that no state or government has any loopholes to utilize¹⁴⁵. However, despite this declaration, many instances of genocidal violence against women still occurred while the declaration was published, as well as in many instances after its acknowledgment.

In order to fully understand the brutality and the utter destruction caused by violence against women, and sexual violence in particular, it is pertinent to examine specific examples throughout various state-run genocides. The first exploration of sexual violence within genocide was done by Susan Brownmiller’s book ‘Against Our Will’ in 1975 and focused mainly on the treatment of Bengali women in the Bangladeshi genocide of 1971¹⁴⁶. However, despite her work, the notion of genocidal rape and sexual violence as a weapon did not garner international attention until the genocides of the 1990s. As is the case, that nothing can be deducted from a single event, and in order to get a complete picture of the horrific atrocities, the systematic spread and usage of sexual violence, and to better understand the effects of the usage of violence against women, multiple genocides must be examined.

¹⁴³ *United Nations Declaration on the Elimination of Violence Against Women*

¹⁴⁴ *Ibid.*

¹⁴⁵ *Ibid.*

¹⁴⁶ Jones, p470

The Armenian genocide, though still officially denied by the Turkish government, which saw the corralling and extermination of hundreds of thousands of Armenians by the Turks through mass murder and death marches, was one of the first where the use of sexual violence against women during the genocide became public knowledge¹⁴⁷. Firsthand accounts through letters revealed the gruesome realities that the Armenian women faced; recollections of women being shut in a church and gang raped for days until they died, hundreds of women forced to submit to soldiers only to be dragged away after and hacked to pieces by sword, and the evisceration of pregnant women all documented within the letters¹⁴⁸. An Armenian poet by the name of Siamanto documented through his poems such scenes as women being forced to dance while on fire, and mothers forced to watch soldiers nail their children to crosses¹⁴⁹. Tens of thousands of women were raped or abducted into harems¹⁵⁰. All over the country and throughout most of the deportation marches, sexual, physical, and religious violence were commonplace, though there are three recollections worth noting: that of the German railway engineers, that of U.S. Consul to Aleppo J. B. Jackson, and that of Aurora Mardigianian.

German railway engineers in the western Middle-East, being eyewitnesses to the horrific crimes, wrote reports on what they saw. Engineers near a refugee camp in Ras-ul-Ain, Syria reported that they saw hundreds of women arriving there completely naked¹⁵¹; another engineer reported massacres beside the railway tracks leading to Ras-ul-Ain and noted that the victims showed signs of severe brutalities¹⁵²; and an engineer, who went by the name Spieker, described the systematic slaughter of the Armenians through murder and death marches, noted that the

¹⁴⁷ Balakian, p65

¹⁴⁸ Balakian, p65-66

¹⁴⁹ Balakian, p155

¹⁵⁰ Balakian, p180 and p192

¹⁵¹ Balakian, p192

¹⁵² Ibid.

Ottomans raped the women, and even recollected one sergeant who bragged about raping children¹⁵³. Consul Jackson's reports not only confirm those of the railway engineers, but also adds to them. Jackson, in 1915, reported that a group of 1,000 women and children had been sent on a death march whereupon Chetes abducted those of them they wanted and the rest were beaten, stripped, presumably raped, and forced to continue on their death march through the desert naked¹⁵⁴. Only three hundred of the original thousand made it to Aleppo where the consul saw their condition and reported that their skin had miscoloured and was severely burnt due to weather exposure and that they carried marks from severe beatings¹⁵⁵. Aurora Mardiganian's story is one worthy of particular note as she was a survivor of the genocide and experienced sexual violence first-hand. Aurora was one of thousands of girls who had been raped in harems and though she escaped from the establishment that held her, she was raped again after a religious conversion that was supposed to save her from persecution and then sent on a death march¹⁵⁶. Mardiganian was a witness to torture, sexual violence, the selling of women into slavery and harems, as well as 'the game of swords' which consisted of Chetes throwing women and girls from horses onto up-turned swords embedded in the ground¹⁵⁷.

Armenia was far from the only genocide to feature violence against women. During the Holocaust of World War II, a period of severe persecution and annihilation of almost the entire European Jewish population through outright executions and gas chambers, there were reports, such as those from German General Johannes Blaskowitz, of isolated cases. The General, stationed in Poland, wrote the reports on the behaviours of German police and military, giving

¹⁵³ Balakian, p192

¹⁵⁴ Balakian, p253

¹⁵⁵ Ibid.

¹⁵⁶ Balakian, p254

¹⁵⁷ Balakian, p314-315

examples such as a German policeman who drunkenly beat a Polish man to death and forced a woman to bury him, and of a Jewish girl gang raped by German soldiers in a cemetery¹⁵⁸. However, these were ‘only’ isolated cases. Moreover, the concentration camps built by the Nazis forced female inmates to staff brothels and made a point of assigning lesbian and criminal women to those brothels¹⁵⁹. This use of forced labour constitutes sexual slavery and is included as a crime of genocide. Furthermore, the Nazi Germans were not the only ones to commit sexual violence against women in Europe during the Second World War. Soviet troops, upon their advance into East Germany, began mass raping German women and children¹⁶⁰. This was not just soldiers “‘having fun with a woman’” as Stalin dismissed it, but rather the widespread and systematic rape of any woman or girl, generally over the age of twelve, to the point where an estimated two million were violated¹⁶¹. Though the Soviets were technically liberators within the framework of the genocide, they were also perpetrators against a group that they deemed should be targeted, however, as the Soviets were on the victorious side of the conflict, their horrendous acts were smoothed over. This goes to show that sexual violence and violence against women runs rampant not only in the genocide itself, but also following the genocide and occasionally by those who are supposed to be helping.

The Second World War also featured sexual violence and violence against women on the other side of the globe in Japanese occupied Asia, wherein the Japanese were increasing their empire through the slaughter and exploitation of thousands upon thousands. Sexual slavery and mass rape were staples of the eradication seen in China during Japans reign of terror there¹⁶².

¹⁵⁸ Bergen, p110

¹⁵⁹ Bergen, p198

¹⁶⁰ Jones, p89

¹⁶¹ Ibid.

¹⁶² Payne, p56

During the appropriately named Rape of Nanking, an atrocious event in a genocidal campaign, Japanese forces raped and sexually mutilated tens of thousands of women, often murdering their victims after¹⁶³. Eyewitness John Rabe, a German businessman in Nanking stated that “you hear of nothing but rape”¹⁶⁴. Another eyewitness described the bodies left behind after repeated rape, mutilation, and murder: the women were “stripped naked, their breasts cut off, leaving a terrible dark brown hole; some of them were bayoneted in the abdomen, with their intestines spilling out alongside them; some had a roll of paper or a piece of wood stuffed in their vaginas”¹⁶⁵. The Japanese soldiers raped and mutilated any female, from eight years of age to old women¹⁶⁶. What’s worse is the way Japanese soldiers recollect this carnage; they described the official order to kill any woman they raped, as well as their mentality that when raping their victims they thought of them as women, but when they had had their fill, the women were thought of as nothing but pigs¹⁶⁷. This particular incident showcases not only how brutal and violent sexual violence can be, but also how cultural norms play into these atrocities. The raped women were deemed no more than animals, even by those who raped them, to the point where it was seen best to kill them after, whether as a mercy to the victims or as a precaution for the soldiers. Though, one thing is for sure, there was no thought of mercy from the soldiers when they raped, sexually mutilated, and tortured thousands of females before their deaths.

¹⁶³ Cox, p29; Jones, p72; Jones, p470

¹⁶⁴ Jones, p72

¹⁶⁵ Li Ke-hen quoted in Jones, p470

¹⁶⁶ Jones, p470

¹⁶⁷ Ibid.

Furthermore, during the Japanese genocidal occupation of Chinese territories between 1932 and 1945¹⁶⁸ that killed approximately four to six million people¹⁶⁹, an estimated two-hundred-thousand women of various Asian nationalities, though mainly Korean, were forced into sexual slavery by the Japanese soldiers¹⁷⁰. These ‘comfort women’, a term used to hide the malicious nature of the sexual violence these women were put through, were systematically and repeatedly raped at the behest of and through regulation by the Japanese Imperial Army¹⁷¹. Not only was the rape of women regulated, but the women themselves were sorted into a hierarchy depending on their nationality that would determine which rank of soldiers they were to serve; those of European or Japanese nationality were reserved for high-ranking soldiers and officers, whereas those of Korean, Chinese, or other Asiatic nationality were made to serve lower-rank soldiers¹⁷². Kim Haku Soon, a survivor of the sexual violence enforced by the Japanese, revealed in a court hearing that she and other women had been made to serve thirty to forty soldiers a day and that the Japanese soldiers would be queued up outside the room she was in to wait their turn¹⁷³. Tetsuo Aso, a Japanese military doctor, stated that these women were not only used for brothels, as they were also used as blood donors and public toilets because they had been so dehumanized by the Japanese¹⁷⁴. Fewer than 30% of these women survived the war both due to the Japanese killing them throughout the war and due to suicides after the war¹⁷⁵. Women who were subjected to the horrific sexual violence were also violated culturally as Confucianists prize

¹⁶⁸ Cox, p29, Watanabe, Kazuko. *“Trafficking in Women’s Bodies, Then and Now: The Issue of Military ‘Comfort Women’”*. In Callaway, Rhonda L., and Julie Harrelson-Stephens. *Exploring International Human Rights: Essential Readings*. Rienner, Boulder, CO, 2007. Print. p187

¹⁶⁹ Cox, p29

¹⁷⁰ Callaway, p178; Jones, p506

¹⁷¹ Watanabe in Callaway, p187

¹⁷² Ibid.

¹⁷³ Kim Haku Soon quoted by Watanabe in Callaway, p187

¹⁷⁴ Watanabe in Callaway, p187

¹⁷⁵ Watanabe in Callaway, p189

chastity to the point of leading the victimized women to either kill themselves or isolate themselves¹⁷⁶. This showcases that sexual and physical violence during a genocide can have social and cultural implications post-genocide with widespread effects.

The Bosnian genocide saw the widespread rounding up and execution of Bosnian Muslim men by Serb nationalists under Milošević as well as some of the worst cases of systematic and structured sexual violence, so much so that the term ‘genocidal rape’ saw its first internationally accepted usage¹⁷⁷. Serb soldiers and militia utilized widespread and systematic sexual, physical, verbal, and emotional violence against Bosnian Muslim women. Stories from survivors of rape are plentiful and horrific throughout this particular genocide. Women coming forward to testify what was done to them, risking severe retribution, were identified only through numbers or letters so as to allow them the opportunity to share their stories¹⁷⁸. A girl of sixteen, identified only as “E”, testified that she had been beaten and raped by a thirty-year-old soldier who had then invited two of his mates to do the same¹⁷⁹. A woman identified only as “ZR” recalled how an armed Serbian assailant had broken down the door to their house and gathered all the occupants in one room where he proceeded to physically cut off her clothes, beat her, and raped her in front of everyone in that room, and thereafter killed everyone except ZR who had managed to run and hide in the midst of the massacre¹⁸⁰. A forty-five-year-old woman was forced to perform sexual acts on a much younger Serb police officer¹⁸¹. Edina, an adolescent at

¹⁷⁶ Watanabe in Callaway, p189

¹⁷⁷ Jones, p324

¹⁷⁸ Jones, p324; Hogan, Pamela. *“I Came to Testify”*. Women, War and Peace. PBS, 2011. Documentary.; UN Women. *“Protecting Witnesses of Wartime Rape in Bosnia and Herzegovina”*. UN Commission on the Status of Women, Nov 19, 2012.

¹⁷⁹ Jones, p324

¹⁸⁰ Hogan

¹⁸¹ Leydesdorff, Selma. *“Narratives of Survivors of Srebrenica: How do they Reconnect to the World?”*. In *Women and Genocide: Survivors, Victims, Perpetrators*. Ed. Elissa Bemporad and Joyce W. Warren. Indiana University Press, 2018. Print. p257

the time, testified that Serb soldiers, some of which had been her neighbours, had brought a group of girls to a house wherein they were gang raped, beaten, tied up, and raped again¹⁸². Many more stories of rape and gang rape exist, with many women testifying that they lost consciousness or lost count somewhere between being raped by ten to twenty men in one day or night¹⁸³.

However, the truly horrific atrocities during the Bosnian genocide were the rape camps. The most notable rape camp was in Foča where hundreds, if not thousands, of women were locked in various buildings and raped repeatedly over months by Serb forces¹⁸⁴. Though sixteen witnesses testified in the International Criminal Tribunal for the former Yugoslavia, the most famous testimony is that of Witness 99 who stated that she and many other women were locked in buildings and raped repeatedly over months¹⁸⁵. She also testified that the Serb men would tell them that they deserved the treatment they were getting and would encourage new Serb soldiers to “learn to rape Muslim women” while amongst the captive women¹⁸⁶. These statements are perfect examples of the emotional and verbal abuse that can accompany sexual violence as the women were isolated and shut inside like cattle while being degraded and yelled at by their abusive captors. In another part of Foča, a commander by the name of Klanfa brought women to his commandeered apartment where he made them dance naked and would bring soldiers in to rape them; as one survivor testified “I was raped from the first moment I entered his apartment to the last moment”¹⁸⁷. The existence of Foča as only one of the rape camps in Bosnia showcases

¹⁸² Leydesdorff, p259

¹⁸³ Hogan

¹⁸⁴ Hogan; Socolovsky, Jerome. “*Bosnian ‘Rape Camp’ Survivors Testify in The Hague*”. Women’s ENews, July 19, 2000.

¹⁸⁵ Hogan

¹⁸⁶ Ibid.

¹⁸⁷ Ibid.

the extent to which women were abused sexually and physically as part of a strategic movement by the Serb forces.

While rape was used as a tool to demoralize the women in Bosnia, it was a tool of revenge in Rwanda meant to degrade Tutsi women due to their perceived haughty attitudes toward Hutu men¹⁸⁸. The Rwandan genocide was marked by the carnage that ensued post-colonialism through aggressive onslaughts with machetes against former neighbours and the prevalent sexual violence against females. However, prior to the open genocide of Tutsis in 1994, there were propaganda campaigns that hypersexualized Tutsi women thereby manipulating Hutu men into committing rampant sexual violence against them during the genocide¹⁸⁹. It is estimated that at least 350,000, and possibly up to half a million, women were raped during the genocide, meaning that the majority of those women who survived the genocide had experienced sexual violence¹⁹⁰. As with many of the other genocides, the sexual violence was not limited to individual rape, but rather consisted of rape, rape with foreign objects, sexual mutilation, forced marriage, sexual torture, gang rape, evisceration of pregnant women, and sexual slavery¹⁹¹. Many of the survivors are infected with HIV which the perpetrators knew would happen and advertised after rapes by claiming that bullets would not be used on the victims as AIDS would kill them later anyway¹⁹².

¹⁸⁸ Cox, p166

¹⁸⁹ Fox, p131

¹⁹⁰ Fox, p131; Cox, p167

¹⁹¹ Jones, p471; Fox, p136; Burnet, Jennie E.. *Situating Sexual Violence in Rwanda (1990-2001): Sexual Agency, Sexual Consent, and the Political Economy of War*. African Studies Review, vol 55 no 2. Sep 2012 (p97-118). Article. p98 and p108

¹⁹² Cox, p167; Burnet, p108

Women survivors of sexual violence during genocide remain at a high risk of further sexual violence after the genocide particularly by liberators and in refugee camps¹⁹³. Women in internally displaced camps were at the mercy of those protecting them and were often given to soldiers as a “reward” to the soldiers for having saved the women¹⁹⁴. Those women who had been forced to marry were forced to leave their husbands and marry a “liberating” soldier instead as the previous marriage had likely been because of rape¹⁹⁵. Rwandan women in refugee camps were at further risk as Interahamwe and local militias controlled those areas and often came to take advantage of the women¹⁹⁶. In the years following, in Congo, rape of refugees and Congolese women had become almost a cultural phenomenon as men would be inspired by others’ acts of rape and the situation would escalate to brutal and violent rapes of women and children¹⁹⁷. The violence seen in the Rwandan case shows that sexual violence, particularly against those already targeted and victimized, can linger for long periods of time following a genocide due to the dehumanization and social isolation of the victimized women.

The most recent of the genocides examined for their use of sexual violence is Darfur. A religiously charged conflict taken to the extremes by the Arab North Sudanese government in order to exterminate the Christian population. Survivors of the Darfur genocide describe a root-and-branch like approach where able-bodied men are murdered, pregnant women are eviscerated, and women and girls are publicly raped by the militias financed and directed by Omar al-Bashir who was the Sudanese president at the time¹⁹⁸. The women survivors of rape recall their assailants screaming slurs at them while perpetrating the sexual violence and

¹⁹³ Burnet, p110

¹⁹⁴ Ibid.

¹⁹⁵ Ibid.

¹⁹⁶ Ibid.

¹⁹⁷ Jones, p472

¹⁹⁸ Joeden-Forgey, p100; Jones, p372

threatening them with potential of pregnancy through the rape¹⁹⁹. Here, again, verbal abuse is highly visible and contributes to the overall trauma of the targeted women. Furthermore, the way in which the large-scale physical violence accompanies the sexual violence indicates a pattern of genocidal intent despite some claiming this conflict as a civil dispute.

Having gone through the various examples of genocidal sexual violence perpetrated by governments, it is necessary to understand that each of these cases also carried with them murder on a massive scale adding to the trauma of the survivors as they have to grasp a new reality where they have been violated and many of the people they held dear have been murdered in cold blood and made to disappear. On top of this, these women may be displaced and/or socially marginalized because of their experiences. Therefore, before discussing the economic ramifications of these types of violence against women, it is important to understand the other, more commonly known effects that this violence has on a person.

Commonly Known Ramifications of Violence Against Women

As with genocide studies of women's experiences during genocide, the study of what sexual violence does to a woman is a fairly new topic of research. Generally, women's lasting effects have been limited to their roles as grieving mothers, sisters, and relatives²⁰⁰, and only after lobbying and demands by women's groups were women able to testify in tribunals about their experiences during the genocides²⁰¹. As such, many histories and pieces of scholarly

¹⁹⁹ Jones, p372

²⁰⁰ Fox, p128

²⁰¹ Fox, p126

research has entirely overlooked the lasting sufferings of women survivors of genocides. Memorials and museums are no different as they are the subject of collective memory of societies and of governments trying to rebuild their nations after genocide²⁰². Holocaust memorials in Europe, as well as in the United States, have received criticism in the past for the fact that women's stories were left out²⁰³. In the early years of the twenty-first century the Yad Vashem, otherwise the greatest research facility on the Holocaust in the world, had no research on sexual violence or the use of rape in the Holocaust²⁰⁴. Memorials in Bosnia fail to mention any information about the rampant sexual violence that existed in their genocide and even go so far as to inhibit women survivors in erecting their own plaques²⁰⁵. Supposedly, the covering up of sexual violence, and rape in particular, lies in the social desire within these areas to disassociate the image of sexually victimized and stigmatized women from their previous untainted images²⁰⁶. However, this not only reflects on the patriarchal nature of these societies through wanting unspoiled women, but also creates a disregard and ignorance of what women are dealing with post-genocide.

As sexual chastity and fidelity are often prized and cherished in patriarchal societies, the women who have been victimized by sexual violence often face stigmas, marginalization, and ostracization from their own communities²⁰⁷. This silence and isolation that then surrounds these women survivors creates an environment in which women are deterred from speaking out about their experiences and also about their ongoing problems related to those experiences²⁰⁸. Some

²⁰² Fox, p127

²⁰³ Ibid.

²⁰⁴ Ibid.

²⁰⁵ Fox, 127; Hogan; Socolovsky

²⁰⁶ Fox, p128

²⁰⁷ Fox, p129

²⁰⁸ Ibid.

scholars argue that social silence concerning sexual violence against women is both good and bad; good as it helps to preserve the dignity of the women as many of the societies experiencing genocides are patriarchal in nature and helps prevent the reopening of old wounds as well as keeping the peace between the already fractured groups within a nation²⁰⁹; however, the silencing of women's experiences is considered to be bad as it erases entire narratives and leads to the inaccurate understanding of the atrocities associated with a genocide²¹⁰.

The silencing of women's experiences of sexual violence also stem from the notion that mass murder of men is the normative function of a genocide²¹¹. Therefore, experiences of sexual violence are considered unique and arguments are made that, as the end result is often death anyway, there is no need to highlight this suffering²¹². Memorial sites and programs with a focus on reconciliation often see genocide as an equal killer of men and women in order to avoid giving higher priorities to one group over another, and as a precaution against retaliation as rape can often be considered an unforgivable crime and thereby hinder reconciliation²¹³.

However, sexual violence committed against women has some severe consequences, notably trauma, disease, physical disabilities, and children born of rape²¹⁴. As a woman's anatomy is forced to accommodate either a rapist's anatomy or foreign objects such as rods, guns, or even bayonets, physical damage to the woman's anatomy occurs²¹⁵. Tearing, ripping, and internal bleeding are all types of damage that can occur during rape, particularly when rape

²⁰⁹ Burnet, p111

²¹⁰ Ibid.

²¹¹ Fox, p138

²¹² Fox, p129 and p138

²¹³ Fox, p129 and p139

²¹⁴ Fox, p136

²¹⁵ Jones, p472

is repeated, done with foreign objects, or when it is done violently²¹⁶. Furthermore, the muscles and mechanisms of the lower abdomen are likely to be ruined after violent or repeated rape which means that there is a high likelihood of defect functioning of both the bladder and the intestines that can cause severe infections should either organ leak and introduce excrement to the gut²¹⁷. Furthermore, there is the likelihood of disease, particularly HIV, that affects survivors for the rest of their lives²¹⁸.

On top of these physical effects of genocidal rape come the psychological and emotional effects. Women who have been severely abused either through physical violence or through sexual violence are likely to be plagued by battered woman syndrome, a condition similar to post-traumatic stress disorder²¹⁹. Amongst abused women are high levels of depression, anxiety, substance abuse, and suicidality²²⁰. These traits are by nature long lasting, and as such are found in women long after their abuse ends. Furthermore, these psychological inhibitors are detrimental not only to the well-being of the women, but also to their ability to function in a professional setting and for their finances should they wish to be treated.

Another effect that genocidal violence against women can create is an issue of children. Often children born out of rape are unwanted by their mothers, though not in all cases. Some women choose to give children born of rape up for adoption as they do not want to care for a child they had no choice in having²²¹. Other women will keep the children either out of a sense of ownership, of hope for the future, or because they feel they have no other options²²².

²¹⁶ Jones, p472

²¹⁷ Ibid.

²¹⁸ Cox, p167

²¹⁹ Wheaton, p98-99

²²⁰ "Development of the Scale...", p564

²²¹ Gangoli, p535

²²² Cox, p167

However, the children themselves are targeted by the same stigmas and social beliefs that follow their mothers. Children born of rape can face severe discrimination and belittlement by their communities and are on occasion called “Enfants de mauvais souvenir”, meaning children of bad memories, by members of their society or their mothers²²³. It is estimated that there are twenty thousand children born of rape just from the Rwandan genocide²²⁴, and though there are no official numbers on the total amount of children born from genocidal rapes or even from other specific genocides, the number could be exponentially higher if all genocides were to be considered. On the flipside of this is the question of mothers who have lost their children and how that affects them. The effects are worst on those who have seen their children murdered in front of them either from a genocidal perspective that children would not be allowed to grow up to retaliate or from children trying to protect their mothers²²⁵. Regardless, the genocide never ends for those who have seen their own children murdered, nor for those with life-long reminders that they were raped²²⁶.

It is also important to note that women survivors never cease to be victims. Whether it is the upbringing of off-spring born through rape, the knowledge of infertility, living with HIV or AIDS, the societal marginalization and discrimination, or the honour killings and suicides that continue long after the genocides stop²²⁷. These women survivors are often alone in the world, and often have worries and dependents that need constant attention.

²²³ Cox, p167

²²⁴ Fox, p131

²²⁵ Joeden-Forgey, p94

²²⁶ Ibid.

²²⁷ Ibid.

Economic Ramifications of Violence Against Women

The economic effects are an area of state terror, genocides, and human rights that has not been studied in depth by anyone. Particularly essential is the fact that few scholars, and fewer economists, have looked into the prolonged economic effects of violence against women²²⁸. It is baffling to consider that little research has been done on the economic effects of sexual violence considering that it is not only the survivors who are affected. Businesses and countries suffer economic losses pertaining to human capital and resources as well as monetary losses²²⁹. Furthermore, most nations see some form of violence against women whether it is through genocide or through domestic violence²³⁰ and therefore suffer the economic effects, whether they have researched it or not.

In order to fully understand the costs of genocidal sexual violence, it is pertinent to first look at the costs associated with terrorism and the costs associated with genocide in order to compound them with the vast costs of violence against women.

Terrorism carries with it many costs to the people who experience it through the loss of security and physical harm, however, these are only a few of the costs associated with it. Through an analysis that considers the damage to property, to business, and to the monetary economy, it becomes clear that terrorism causes severe and lasting impacts. Boycotting of businesses such as airlines, cinemas, and shopping districts due to fear of future attacks cause severe economic damage to those establishments and may even cause bankruptcy or force those

²²⁸ Wheaton, p24

²²⁹ Wheaton, p18

²³⁰ Wheaton, p112

businesses to establish a dependency on government funds²³¹. The U.S. Department of State, which only takes into account property damage exceeding \$10,000²³², is woefully undercutting the true costs of terrorism in terms of damage, business, and costs to their citizens. Government imposed restriction of rights following terrorist acts (or as terrorist acts), loss of time due to security measures, loss of the usage of or the physical buildings or regions, loss of income if an area is frequently attacked, racism, and the increase in law enforcement activity all constitute costs on an economy²³³. Furthermore, the Institute for Economics and Peace, though it does not include all costs related to terrorism in its estimation, approximates that terrorism had a global cost of about \$84 billion just in the year 2016²³⁴. When considering that staggering number, and then the fact that some state-terror genocides lasted multiple years and all have multi-year effects, it becomes startlingly clear that there are massive costs associated.

Genocide has specific costs and economic considerations associated with it outside of those present for terrorism. One such consideration is the redistribution of wealth that happens before and during a genocide wherein property and material goods are stolen and reassigned through illegal means, money is withheld or forcefully taken, and people are taken as slaves or trafficked²³⁵. All of these redistributions are of particular note as they economically empower one group within a nation but economically inhibit another. Another such redistribution is the redistribution of employment and income, or specifically the removal of one group from employment and income²³⁶, which not only diminishes a country's capabilities to produce, but also limits the amount of monetary circulation within an economy. Enslavement or subjugation

²³¹ Wheaton, p173

²³² Ibid.

²³³ Ibid.

²³⁴ Wheaton, p173 and p154

²³⁵ Wheaton, p237

²³⁶ Ibid.

of people not only harm the people involved, but also restrict the economic transactions²³⁷ that a country's economy needs in order to further its cyclical nature instead of grinding down in gear, or worse to a halt. Add to this that in the process of theft and redistribution, often timer, assets, property, and resources are destroyed rather than utilized²³⁸ causing an economic loss in terms of land and capital.

On top of these, genocide carries with it personal economic losses through the loss of life, the use of sexual violence, and the loss of freedoms²³⁹. The major losses of life significantly reduce a nation's workforce and thereby also its production capabilities which are essential to its economy. Loss of freedoms can include reductions in wages or the withholding of wages which would significantly decrease the spending in a nation and thereby damage its economy or the loss of movement thereby limiting work opportunities for citizens. The costs associated with sexual violence will be discussed in further depth later on, but include the same things as loss of life brings as well as further complications such as health expenses, loss of work capability, and dependents for those who survived the genocides²⁴⁰. There are also certain socio-political effects that surviving women face post-genocide that may have significant economic impacts such as isolation and marginalization which can lead to lack of job opportunities, lack of housing, and lack of ability to care for dependents²⁴¹.

Moreover, nations suffer through genocides as all, or almost all, economic and governmental functions and processes grind to a halt during genocides, international economic aid disappears, the high levels of disruption and uncertainty drive out foreign investors and

²³⁷ Wheaton, p224

²³⁸ Wheaton, p242

²³⁹ Wheaton, p243

²⁴⁰ Joeden-Forgey, p93-94; Wheaton, p242

²⁴¹ Joeden-Forgey, p94

discourages new investors from investing, and causes societal rifts between the various groups within a nation preventing them from working cohesively post-genocide²⁴². Furthermore, there are costs to the international economy as there are increased levels of international humanitarian aid and assistance distributed after a genocide, as well as coordination of refugee centers within neighbouring countries which drives economic costs up²⁴³. It is estimated that international humanitarian assistance after the Rwandan genocide reached upwards of \$1.4 billion²⁴⁴, which calls into question the costs, international and domestic, of the dozens of genocides throughout recent history.

Following this, there are monumental costs associated with violence against women. However, to fully comprehend these costs it is important to factor in certain nuances that have significant impacts on the specific economic impacts of violence against women. Existing economic models make the assumption that the women being violated have the option to stay in or leave the situation they are in²⁴⁵, which is not always the case, particularly when speaking about women being abused in or after a genocide. A woman forced into sexual or domestic slavery because of genocidal violence often does not have the opportunity to leave, and risk losing their lives or endangering others if they even try to do so. These trafficked women are controlled by their owners through physical and psychological violence to the point where they have no choices at all, let alone economic ones²⁴⁶.

Furthermore, as some women do have a choice on whether to escape their violent situation, such as ZR from Bosnia who fled while her assailant was murdering her family, it

²⁴² Wheaton, p242

²⁴³ Wheaton, p243

²⁴⁴ Ibid.

²⁴⁵ Wheaton, p113

²⁴⁶ Ibid.

needs to be stated that there are reasons why women may choose to stay instead of leaving.

Women, for example those who have been forced to marry their assailants, may choose to stay in that marriage either due to physical ties developed throughout their time together, or because she is dependent on him economically despite his violent acts towards her²⁴⁷. It has previously been discussed that women who have survived sexual and physical violence are often marginalized by their own communities and, as such, it is difficult for them to gain economic independence, therefore it is often seen that these women will choose to stay with the man who has abused them so that they are not struggling financially. Moreover, there may be an element of fear that keeps women in violent and abusive relationships as the threat towards their own personal safety, or the safety of their children, may be used to keep them there²⁴⁸. For genocide specifically, as most women are not forced to marry those that committed the genocide or forced into sexual/domestic slavery, it is worth noting that the violent situation in which women may choose to leave or to stay can also be an area or region. Women may choose to stay after a genocide as that region is all they knew before and as the prospect of assimilating into a new country is too daunting after surviving such brutal violence despite the remaining hostilities they may face by staying, or women may choose to flee their country and live as refugees or immigrants in another country.

In general, when accommodating people, post-genocide, who have survived extreme violence, both physical and sexual, tribunals and legislation are often the immediate responses²⁴⁹. However, as the UDHR declares, everyone has the right to a life with dignity, which means that survivors need to get access to clothing, to food, to shelter, to education, to medical treatment

²⁴⁷ Wheaton, p112

²⁴⁸ Ibid.

²⁴⁹ Robertson, p175

and social services, to work, and to cultural and communal life²⁵⁰. Often, these rights are ignored for survivors of state-run genocides, and particularly for women survivors, as their stories are silenced by the states that committed the genocides²⁵¹. For example, in Bosnia, survivors of the massacres and sexual violence are isolated and have gained no acknowledgment of their suffering, past or present, which means that in a country struggling with an economic crisis of its own, there are no employment opportunities, no social welfare for victims, no pensions, no food, and barely enough for education²⁵². If their nation, or the international community for that matter, formally recognized the troubles and struggles these survivors have, then there may have been programs set up to enable the rebuilding of lives, but as their stories are silenced, no one enforces their human rights and so these women suffer further²⁵³.

At this point it has been established that there are costs generic to terrorism (including state terrorism) and to genocides, that women in violent situations do not always have a choice about committing to or leaving their situations, that some women do have that choice and choose to remain in those situations for physical or financial reasons, and that silence around genocidal suffering and particularly around the suffering of women causes a disregard for their situation and minimizes humanitarian help for the victims.

Now it is time to discuss the actual costs of violence against women. Costs are directly linked to the prevalence, severity, and impact of the specific violent situations²⁵⁴, however, as the situations discussed are examples of violence against women in state-run genocide it is safe to

²⁵⁰ Robertson, p175

²⁵¹ Leydesdorff, 252; Fox, p129; Burnet, p111

²⁵² Leydesdorff, p256

²⁵³ Leydesdorff, p252 and p256

²⁵⁴ Wheaton, p110

assume that the violence – physical, psychological, and sexual – was widespread with an extreme severity and has had lasting impacts on the women and the communities they live in.

According to Dr. Wheaton, there are four types of costs associated with violence directed against women: direct tangible costs, indirect tangible costs, direct intangible costs, and indirect intangible costs²⁵⁵. Tangibility, of course, refers to whether the costs is monetary or not, meaning intangible costs are those that affect psychological state and quality of life rather than one's pocketbook²⁵⁶. Directness refers to whether the costs stems directly from the violence or is influenced by but not a direct fault of the violence²⁵⁷. Therefore, the categories line up as follows:

- Direct tangible costs are monetary costs experienced because of the violence itself, such as, but not limited to, medical expenses related to hospitalization, disease, or continued limited mobility²⁵⁸. The U.S. Center for Disease Control estimated that the direct tangible costs of domestic violence alone total upwards of \$5.8 billion in 1995 for the U.S. alone, which seemingly jumped to \$8.3 billion in 2003²⁵⁹. Considering the prevalence of domestic violence, and then considering the prevalence of violence against women in a genocide, the CDC estimate would fall utterly short of the costs associated.
- Indirect tangible costs are those monetary costs seen in society resulting from the violence but not directly due to the violence²⁶⁰. Expenses related to law enforcement

²⁵⁵ Wheaton, p110

²⁵⁶ Ibid.

²⁵⁷ Ibid.

²⁵⁸ Ibid.

²⁵⁹ Wheaton, p110 and p111

²⁶⁰ Wheaton, p110

upkeep and training, to legal and social welfare systems, to hospitals, and to workplaces through loss of productivity or time²⁶¹. U.S. cities reports that between 16-32% of their homelessness is because of domestic violence and between 64-82% of domestic violence victims reported that the abuse had significantly impacted their productivity at work²⁶². When these numbers are then seen in relation to genocide, which factors in destruction of property, refugees, internally displaced people (IDPs), and rampant violence meant to kill or permanently disable the victims, it is clear that those percentages, particularly the ones concerning homelessness, would be higher. When we then also factor in the cost to workplaces due to the loss of workers in general, not just those men and women who have been disabled, it is hard to see how the workplaces stay in business.

- Direct intangible costs consist of the suffering induced by the violence committed such as pain, grief, isolation, battered woman syndrome, and trauma²⁶³. These are life-long conditions that follow the women, and other survivors, after experiencing violence during a genocide. It is pertinent to understand that these conditions have very real effects, for example, a survivor of the sexual slavery enforced by the Japanese confessed that even being near a man made her so afraid that she felt sick²⁶⁴. Aurora Mardiganian expressed similar troubles by having nothing to do with men for decades after her experience of sexual violence²⁶⁵. These types of trauma carry over to regular life and can have impacts on work and communities.

²⁶¹ Wheaton, p110

²⁶² Wheaton, p110 and p111

²⁶³ Wheaton, p111

²⁶⁴ Watanabe in Callaway, p186

²⁶⁵ Balakian, p316

- Indirect intangible costs though mainly psychological, and to some extent physical, can have major monetary costs associated with them²⁶⁶. The problems potentially involved in indirect intangible costs are learned helplessness, substance abuse, and depression²⁶⁷. Women who have been violated physically and/or sexually are four times more likely to have depression and almost six times as likely to attempt suicide²⁶⁸, which is likely to impact their ability to work and their ability to take care of dependents.

It is vital to note that the facts and figures mentioned in the above cost types are representative of domestic violence alone as these costs have not yet been studied in connection to any particular genocides. However, as all types of violence that occur during domestic violence also occur during genocides, only at a more extreme and widespread rate, it can be estimated that the same economic consequences would be present, though exacerbated exponentially as the number of survivors and victims is far greater proportionally in a region ravaged by genocide than those suffering domestic violence, though that number too remains high.

These types of costs are evident throughout areas that have been affected by violence against women and are especially evident post-genocides. The above types, though detailed, can present as a little distant and a little broad, therefore it seems relevant to explore in depth the various costs violence against women impose on women survivors, workplaces, and societies as a whole. It is important to note that violence against women, especially when as widespread and

²⁶⁶ Wheaton, p111

²⁶⁷ *ibid.*

²⁶⁸ *ibid.*

severe as during state-run genocides, is detrimental to the victims, the community, the state, the economy, and even internationally²⁶⁹.

The first potential cost is exploitation. Survivors of violence against women can be targets for their stories if someone believes they can profit off of them. Aurora Mardiganian, a survivor of the sexual and physical violence during the Armenian genocide, was brought to Los Angeles by an upstart screenwriter, Harvey Gates, and a producer, Col. William N. Selig, who wanted to exploit her for her story²⁷⁰. Aurora was paid only fifteen dollars a week, a very low wage even for the time, and was forced to act on a broken ankle under traumatizing conditions²⁷¹ as she was led to relive her darkest days. When the film was finished and shown to the public in the beginning of 1919, Aurora was pushed into the spotlight and paraded in front of elites for special screenings for which she received no reasonable wages²⁷². Furthermore, no attention was given to her psychological state and, therefore, she became isolated within herself and angry at what was being done to her to the point where she threatened suicide²⁷³. However, as there was still profit to be made for Gates and Selig, Aurora was deposited at a convent while they hired look-alikes to continue the exploitation of her story²⁷⁴.

States also exploit survivors for their stories, though for a different perspective. A Bosnian refugee, Tanja, explained how her and other refugee's families were exploited by the Serbian state for their propaganda videos²⁷⁵. A state run television station would stage pieces on

²⁶⁹ Wheaton, p95

²⁷⁰ Balakian, p314

²⁷¹ Balakian, p314-316

²⁷² Balakian, p316

²⁷³ Ibid.

²⁷⁴ Ibid.

²⁷⁵ Korac, Maja. *War, Flight, and Exile: Gendered Violence among Refugee Women from post-Yugoslav States*. In Giles, Wenona and Jennifer Hyndman. *Sites of Violence: Gender and Conflict Zones*. University of California Press, p249-272, 2004. p260

refugees such that they were shown in nice rooms with toys available for the children as a way to manipulate the populace into thinking that the state was providing every comfort to those in greatest need²⁷⁶. However, the reality of abject poverty, hunger, and inadequate shelter that survivors of violence against women are experiencing was hidden away²⁷⁷. Though not as directly exploitative as Aurora's experience, this type is almost worse as these women, and their children, are being oppressed and the misinterpretation of their lives as refugees exploited by the state to eliminate international pressure to care properly for their refugees.

The second, and arguably more impactful, cost of violence against women is related to employment. A U.S. task force on domestic violence estimates that between 25-50% of abused women lose their jobs, which would be equivalent to a couple million workdays per year²⁷⁸. This is a major issue in genocides as well because the targeted group is generally expunged from workplaces, meaning women have no job during or after violence is committed against them, causing fewer opportunities post-genocide due to prejudices and disabilities as well as the potential that women will stay in violent situations as they have no financial means of escaping their situations. Those women that do find employment after experiencing brutal violence often indicate that the actions committed against them make it difficult to focus while at work, contributes to an excess of absences from work, and can result in job loss²⁷⁹. Furthermore, there is evidence suggesting that survivors of violence against women spend less time "gainfully employed", have lower incomes, and experience more economic hardships than those who have

²⁷⁶ Korac, p260

²⁷⁷ Ibid.

²⁷⁸ Wheaton, p100

²⁷⁹ Adams, Adrienne, et. al.. *The Impact of Intimate Partner Violence on Low-Income Women's Economic Well-Being: The Mediating Role of Job Stability*. Violence Against Women vol 18 no 2. Sage Publications, 2013 (p1345-1367). Article. p1346

not been abused²⁸⁰. In a study it was found that 63% of women who had experienced violence within a few years were unemployed, 16% worked only part-time, and 21% had full-time jobs; in addition to this, these abused women reported that over half of them were living on less than \$15,000 a year, and 20% of them were living on less than \$30,000 a year²⁸¹. The average entry-level salary in the United States is approximately \$28,000²⁸², meaning the majority of these women are being paid less than a high-school or college graduate with little experience.

The above figures relate to a study done with survivors of domestic violence, but, as previously stated, all types of violence present in domestic violence are also present in genocidal violence toward females. Therefore, the employment figures are ones worth mentioning as undoubtedly women survivors of genocidal and sexual violence by the state are having the same issues, though likely at a much greater and farther encompassing scale.

Early research on the effects of domestic violence against women focused solely on whether the women were employed or unemployed, however, that led to an inconclusive data set as abused women were just as likely to be employed as non-abused women²⁸³. What distinguished abused women was their lack of job stability, specifically in terms of hours worked and time employed²⁸⁴. It has been shown above that severe genocidal violence against women has significant impacts on both physical and psychological health, which in turn has great impact on the amount of hours a woman survivor can work, and particularly for those still in their violent situations as the abuse is ongoing. The focus on job stability over the question of employment is significant as women survivors are likely to cycle between many jobs in a short

²⁸⁰ *"The Impact of..."*, p1346

²⁸¹ *"Development of the Scale..."*, p571

²⁸² Way Up. *"How Much Should I Be Paid at an Entry Level Job?"*. Accessed 03/19/2020.

²⁸³ *"The Impact of..."*, p1346

²⁸⁴ *Ibid.*

amount of time, whereas those not abused have stable employment or careers²⁸⁵. The cycling between jobs has certain consequences associated such as increased difficulty finding new employment and the lack of employment benefits which only adds to the costs stacking up against women survivors of violence.

Job stability further includes the amount of time actually working. It has been reported that women who have experienced violence – again physical, psychological, and/or sexual – within a three-year range are able to work significantly less than women who have not been abused²⁸⁶. It is also approximated that the more severe the violence, the less work the women are capable of to the point that the more severe the abuse the fewer months spent at work²⁸⁷. In a study done with survivors of domestic violence it was found that one year of physical violence is capable of reducing the amount of hours a woman is capable of working by roughly 137 hours²⁸⁸, which is equivalent to over three weeks of work if the job requires 40 hours a week, and significantly more if working part-time. This is detrimental not only to the woman who is losing income and financial independence, but also to the workplace as they are potentially losing profit and productivity. This phenomenon is not restricted only to during the abuse or immediately after the violence ends. A similar study in Illinois found that women who had been severely abused worked fewer months for two years after the violence ended than women who had not been abused²⁸⁹. This is significant as it implies that the capacity to work does not exponentially increase post-violence, but rather stays at an almost flat rate meaning that violence against women causes inability to sustain full work hours by months long-term and potentially even

²⁸⁵ *"The Impact of..."*, p1347

²⁸⁶ *Ibid.*

²⁸⁷ *Ibid.*

²⁸⁸ *Ibid.*

²⁸⁹ *Ibid.*

permanently. There has been little to no research on the effects of violence against women over more than five years and, as such, there can only be assumptions made about the effects of violence on the amount of hours women are capable of working. Given the similarities between domestic violence and genocidal and sexual violence against females, the above concerns about work ability post-violence also apply to women survivors of genocidal violence.

Violence against women is also a cause of job loss and job turnover. It has been estimated that about 91% of women who had experienced domestic violence either quit or were fired, with 41% of those being dismissals not resignations²⁹⁰. These percentages, particularly of women being fired or dismissed de facto, are much higher during genocides where women are rounded up, killed, sexually exploited, and deported. Keeping a job after having been subjected to violence can also pose some challenges particularly with regard to physical or psychological health problems, irregular attendance, or a distracted mental state while at work²⁹¹. Furthermore, even those able to find work are not always able to maintain their employment. Job turnover is much more frequent and more prevalent among women who have been violated than in women who have not²⁹². This suggests that even those who are able to find work are at risk as complications from violence inflicted inhibits them long-term and perhaps permanently, meaning that they have the potential of becoming burdens on the social welfare systems of nations while contributing little to the economy or the workforce.

Difficulty maintaining or finding work causes severe implications for the women survivors as well. Without stable income, these survivors experience further hardships as they are unable to afford basic necessities, moreover, without basic necessities it becomes harder for

²⁹⁰ *"The Impact of..."*, p1348

²⁹¹ *ibid.*

²⁹² *"The Impact of..."*, p1349

survivors to find new employment or to sustain the employment that they have. Furthermore, it is estimated that survivors of violence against women make an average of almost \$4,000 less than women who had not been exposed to severe violence²⁹³. In addition to lost income and material hardship, job turnover causes difficulties with employment benefits. Benefits are generally aimed at helping maintain the health and overall well-being of employees, however, many places of employment, particularly those of lower pay, require employees to have worked at the company for some time before benefits apply²⁹⁴. Therefore, when survivors of domestic violence either quit because of the unachievable demands of the job or are fired, they not only lose the benefits of the previous job, but have to work their way to gaining benefits for the next job, putting them in a position of limbo wherein their health could rapidly deteriorate as many of the women who have been abused do not have their own health insurance²⁹⁵. On top of the health risk comes the lack of savings as the survivors are often living hand to mouth and the lack of retirement funds as they have difficulty obtaining employment benefits²⁹⁶. For these reasons, it is important to consider job instability when looking at the long-term effects of violence against women regardless of whether it happened in relation to domestic violence or genocide as many of the same effects are expected to appear after both incidents. Furthermore, it is strongly discouraged, by advocates, to impose sanctions on women survivors for failing to meet work requirements as this jeopardizes the women's chances of gaining normality in work and for obtaining financial independence²⁹⁷. This is difficult, however, as certain types of violence can severely inhibit a person's ability to meet work requirements and may end up increasing costs for employers.

²⁹³ *"The Impact of..."*, p1349

²⁹⁴ *"The Impact of..."*, p1350

²⁹⁵ *ibid.*

²⁹⁶ *ibid.*

²⁹⁷ *"The Impact of..."*, p1346

Job instability, job loss, and the lack of access to employment benefits are major factors in the statistic that 45% of domestic violence survivors' financial assets fall below the poverty line²⁹⁸, a percentage that has not been studied among women survivors of genocidal violence but one that is presumably much worse given the prevalence and severity of that type of violence. Poverty and insufficient finances are root causes of problems of hunger, homelessness, lack of education, and obtaining necessities²⁹⁹. These are material and economic hardships that are directly due to the violence experienced by women and are a major reason for the continued hardships both in employment and in economic stability. These economic problems have been studied to some extent within the field of domestic violence research, though only in depth over a five year period, but are applicable to those suffering from the violence directed against them in genocides as the types of violence endured are the same only on a different scale³⁰⁰. There is a need to study, in depth, the economic consequences of violence against women in a genocidal setting, especially considering the scope and scale of the violence they have suffered and the long-term effects that can have.

Furthermore, there is evidence that women whose financial situation has been compromised through violence directed against them have a harder time financially after the violence ends than those who were 'only' physically abused³⁰¹. This indicates that the more severe the violence endured is, the more difficult it becomes for a woman to recuperate afterward. In terms of genocides, this means that through the widespread violence and the marginalization from society severely impacts women's ability to regain independence and to

²⁹⁸ *"The Impact of..."*, p1354

²⁹⁹ *"The Impact of..."*, p1355

³⁰⁰ Wheaton, p224

³⁰¹ *"Development of the Scale..."*, p577

regain their lives. Advocates against violence against women worry that, given the general limitations on welfare and the struggles women survivors have sustaining work, survivors will find it near impossible to gain enough financial independence to become self-sufficient and that the survivors may return to a violent situation to meet their financial needs despite knowing that they will be abused³⁰². This would not only further limit the workforce and potential productivity of a nation, but it would also add further health care costs, to both nation and survivor, and potentially also law enforcement costs depending on how far after a genocide the survivors return to their violent situation. Furthermore, it would simply be a continuation of the loop of struggles they have already endured once and would further inhibit their chances of breaking free from that loop.

As a third potential cost comes the cost to families who have been targeted during the genocides. Women suddenly find themselves being single parents wherein they are responsible for family finances and necessities as well as securing a livelihood to provide those things³⁰³. This means that women survivors, and especially those whose dependents survived the genocide as well, are shoved into new roles and responsibilities that they did not anticipate ever having nor are prepared to perform. Therefore, there is a trend towards the perpetuation of violence post-genocide as mothers under duress become abusive of their children, or unintentionally neglect certain needs causing children, boys and men in particular, to grow up with hostile attitudes toward their situation without the knowledge or the role-model to bring themselves out of their situation causing massive unemployment and crime issues years after the genocide ends³⁰⁴. An older woman by the name Aiša who survived the Bosnian genocide laid out her problems to

³⁰² *"The Impact of..."*, p1346

³⁰³ Leydesdorff, p253

³⁰⁴ *Ibid.*

include the loss of men for hard physical labour, no financial help from the government, indebted for housing but with no money to pay the KM15,000 she owes, and the loss of her entire family including six siblings, her husband, and her children³⁰⁵. This is only one story from one genocide. There are hundreds of thousands of women with stories like hers and no way to change their narratives.

Another familial issue in relation to genocides is the question of inheritance. When property has not been destroyed but the laws of a nation restrict property ownership to men only, women survivors suddenly find themselves without housing and with no way of obtaining it other than through marriage or living family. This is an issue that AVEGA, the Association of Widows of the Genocide in Rwanda, is aiming at tackling. In mid-2011, AVEGA, with the support of UN Women, launched a program called “Property and Inheritance Legal Support for Genocide Women Survivors Infected and Affected by HIV/AIDS” which is meant to provide access to legal and medical support for widows so that they may obtain property ownership and HIV/AIDS medicine and start to rebuild their lives³⁰⁶. This program is aiming to educate women survivors on their legal rights and possibilities concerning inheritance procedures, as well as to provide advice to those seeking redress and those involved in disputes concerning property and inheritance and to act as consultants and liaisons on those cases³⁰⁷. This project is an attempt to help the more than 400,000 widows who reached out to the government almost immediately after the genocide asking for help to become self-sufficient and to be allowed certain rights they had not had before³⁰⁸. Despite an early legislative change in 1999 allowing women to inherit their

³⁰⁵ Leydesdorff, p256

³⁰⁶ UN Women. “UN Women-Supported Project to Provide Legal and Medical Services to Rwandan Widows”. UN Commission on the Status of Women, Jul 26, 2011.

³⁰⁷ Ibid.

³⁰⁸ Ibid.

late husband's property, women survivors are still marginalized in society and therefore find it difficult to obtain that right, and it is estimated that, in 2005, just over 50% of women survivors infected with HIV were living on less than 1 USD per day which constitutes the international acknowledgment of extreme poverty³⁰⁹. Considering this initiative, it is interesting to note that property ownership actually deters violence against women as the women survivors gain the ability to leave their situation³¹⁰. Being able to own and inherit land increases independence and the possibility to become either financially independent or to produce food for personal needs keeping hunger at bay while the finances are worked on.

Also in Rwanda, multiple memorial sites have social outreach projects that aim to help survivors, and women survivors in particular. At the Center for Genocide Prevention and Education (CGPE) there was, in 2019, an upcoming expansion to one of their social outreach programs that would not only increase the center's archives, but also increase funding for outreach projects and enable a mobile education system that could reach rural and isolated areas³¹¹, which is especially needed as women survivors are often ostracized and forgotten within nations that committed genocide against them. This outreach project is meant to assist HIV positive survivors in obtaining medication and counseling to support their health, as well as to provide job training which would allow women survivors to assimilate back into a productive environment that would allow them to support themselves³¹². Though the program is good and will assist many women survivors, it cannot be overlooked that this expansion did not come until 2019, twenty-five years after the genocide took place... This is a strong indication that thousands

³⁰⁹ *"UN Women-Supported..."*

³¹⁰ Wheaton, p113

³¹¹ Fox, p139

³¹² Fox, p140

of women are still living in poverty, are still marginalized, and are still in dire need of help even decades after being subjected to severe violence, making the comparisons to the effects of domestic violence relevant but inferior in severity.

A fourth economic cost to consider is that of the women forced to live as refugees after having been subjected to severe violence. Displaced people are at the mercy of national governments but have little to no direct access to centers of power³¹³ meaning they have no means of bettering their situation. Refugees of such violent crimes are hard pressed in their attempts to reconstruct their daily lives as conditions are deplorable, particularly for those refugees in countries hostile towards their ethnicity or religious affiliation³¹⁴. Some regimes housing refugees are not accepting of political dissent nor freedom of speech, meaning those dependent on the government's support are in danger of getting cut off if they speak out against the government or associate with known dissenters³¹⁵. From refugees across multiple states come stories of neglect, of stigmas, and of personal losses that affect their chances of gaining economic independence³¹⁶. Refugees are a reminder of a past that many governments want to forget, and therefore neglect³¹⁷.

Before becoming refugees, many of these women had lives, families, and careers, all of which were annulled during the genocides and remained so in refuge. A woman, in her late forties at the time of the Bosnian genocide, had fled to Croatia as a refugee whereupon her law degree and title as director of a firm became null and void, and her personal identity was

³¹³ Leydesdorff, p252

³¹⁴ Ibid.

³¹⁵ Korac, p254

³¹⁶ Korac, p254-267

³¹⁷ Leydesdorff, p252

disregarded in favour of simply treating her as one of the many refugees³¹⁸. Another woman lamented that she too had been stripped of her identity upon becoming a refugee and her middle management position before the genocide was completely overlooked³¹⁹. No matter their age, their background, their nationality, or their socio-economic standing, refugees of violence against women in state-run genocides are all made into no one and nothing. This has some larger implications, however, as these women have known better lives and as such know that the situations they now find themselves in is one of helplessness. One refugee woman noted that having to go to the Red Cross Office for supplies was a humiliating experience as she had been relatively well-off prior to the genocide, particularly as the women who had gone there were grabbing at the clothes and wresting each other out of the way for a shot at better choices³²⁰. Becoming a refugee, and especially a refugee in a hostile nation, is a process of degradation, dehumanization, and exclusion from daily economic life.

Assimilation seems to be the key out of refugee status: learning the language, the culture, getting job training, and essentially creating a new identity for oneself³²¹. However, this is often not the case for refugees in hostile nations as no matter how hard refugees try to assimilate or create a new identity they will never be able to change their ethnicity nor will they be seen as proper religious converts³²². These are factors that are completely out the women's control, but it limits their possibilities for work, for government aid, and for independence. Women refugees in Serbia relate that the centers they are in do not help them in the way they need to be helped³²³;

³¹⁸ Korac, p255

³¹⁹ Korac, p256

³²⁰ Ibid.

³²¹ Korac, p257

³²² Korac, p258

³²³ Ibid.

they are told “be happy you’re still alive” and “keep quiet, you have food”³²⁴, which. While essential, are not enough for a person to create a life for themselves, let alone an economically self-sufficient life. Refugee women are told to dress and act a certain way simply because they are refugees, they are told that they are on a lower level of society regardless of where they were before violence was inflicted upon them³²⁵. From this forced lower socio-economic level come several inhibitors to gaining economic independence as well as challenges to gaining jobs, which in turn means that the nation hosting the refugees is not as productive as it is missing out on a willing labour force and instead have to pay out of pocket to feed and shelter those unfortunate enough to be in refugee camps. Many women refugees, despite their enforced lower standards, have dependents that they need to take care of, however, many of those women barely see how to make a future for themselves let alone how to create a future for their children³²⁶. This indicates that there are economic costs not only associated with the women who have experienced violence, but also for the lives of their children, especially those born of rape.

Children of genocide are subject to the continuation of the trauma associated with the violence their mothers experienced. Some are given up for adoption, others are ostracized by their own mothers, and most of the rest face social discrimination and belittlement³²⁷. Sometimes mothers will not tell their children how they were conceived nor who their fathers are for fear that the discrimination will be worse³²⁸. Ajna Jusić recalls that her mother and she frequently moved around in Bosnia as she was bullied in school because of the stigma surrounding her,

³²⁴ Korac, p258

³²⁵ Korac, p259

³²⁶ Korac, p261

³²⁷ Gangoli, p535; Cox, p167

³²⁸ Jusić, Ajna. *I am Generation Equality: 'A am a Child Born out of Wartime Rape.'* UN Commission on the Status of Women, Nov 18, 2019.

though she was unaware of the reasons at the time³²⁹. Her mother had been afraid to tell her that she was born of rape as she feared Ajna would reject her and discriminate her³³⁰, showing that other children of rape have had adverse reactions to their own mothers because of the violence committed against them. In 2015, about twenty years after the genocide, a group of those born from genocidal rape met for the first time only to realise that they were not alone in their continued suffering³³¹. Ajna now works in an association that aims to help children born of rape to get educational grants and social protections³³², showing that these children are suffering economic costs due to the violence committed against their mothers and which they had no control over. Limited access to education leads to limited employment opportunities and limited economic independence meaning reliance on government aid, and without social protections these children face discrimination severe enough to affect their health which further limits employment capabilities.

The prevalence of social programs and international programs further indicates a need for help and empowerment, while suggesting that there are significant economic costs that the women survivors face that have yet to be addressed decades after the genocides. An organization called Maja Kravica, working in Bosnia, is providing entrepreneurial and social support to women so that they may create their own work and their own workspace³³³. It has been noted that Bosnian women survivors, of sexual violence in particular, are quite isolated in the rural parts of Bosnia and have very few options concerning employment and gaining income to support themselves and their children³³⁴. Therefore, this organization is facilitating access to

³²⁹ Jusić

³³⁰ Ibid.

³³¹ Ibid.

³³² Ibid.

³³³ Marković, Nada. *From Where I Stand: Nada Marković*. UN Commission on the Status of Women, Oct 18, 2016.

³³⁴ Ibid.

financial and physical capital which will allow women survivors to build up their own employment and, thereby, giving them not only the tools to financial independence but also a way in which to overcome social stigmas and their own psychological inhibitors³³⁵. The work and the effects of this organization has been recognized by the government of Bosnia and Herzegovina who have deemed the economic benefits to the country great enough to allow a measure of the budget to assist the organization in reaching and empowering more women as it will help productivity and economic financial movement in the national economy³³⁶.

The work of Maja Kravica is not the first case of female empowerment to have reached Bosnia-Herzegovina. Much earlier, during the genocide in 1993, a transnational advocacy coalition fought with and for Bosnian rape victims to not only get perpetrators sentenced and locked away, but, more importantly, to get rape recognized as a war crime³³⁷. The ad hoc coalition consisted of groups and Non-Governmental Organizations (NGOs) such as Equality Now, Amnesty International, the Fund for a Feminist Majority, the Women's Action Coalition, the Center for Women's Global Leadership, the Center for Reproductive Policy and Law, amongst many others³³⁸. These groups, in conjunction with rape survivors in refugee camps and abroad, fought tooth and nail to push international bodies to react to the violence being committed³³⁹ with the explicit goal to stop the ongoing violence against women and girls while the genocide was occurring³⁴⁰. Taking action during a conflict is a weak point for international

³³⁵ Marković

³³⁶ Ibid.

³³⁷ Haddad, Heidi N.. *Mobilizing the Will to Prosecute: Crimes of Rape at the Yugoslav and Rwandan Tribunals*. Human Rights Review, vol 12, 2011 (109-132). Article; Lewin, Tamar. "The Balkans Rapes: a Legal Test for the Outraged." New York Times, Jan 15, 1993. Web.

³³⁸ Haddad; Lewin

³³⁹ Lewin

³⁴⁰ Ibid.

law as those bodies almost always take retroactive action rather than proactive action³⁴¹. From the activists' incessant action – which involved protests, demonstrations, and the distribution of pamphlets and stickers in Bosnia as well as in the United States – came the response in the form of an International Criminal Tribunal for the former Yugoslavia (ICTY)³⁴².

This international judicial body was greatly influenced by the ad hoc coalition to the point where the coalition was directly responsible for the tribunal's establishment of a Victim's and Witness' Protection policy, as well as several of the ICTY Charter's Rules, including the infamous Rule 96³⁴³; this Rule did away with the need for corroboration of victim testimony, prohibited the use of 'consent' as a defense if the victim was forced or coerced into a sexual act, and created mandatory credibility screenings for any cases where defendants wanted to claim consent as their defense³⁴⁴. This rule, amongst others, stemmed directly from the work of women's rights activists at the International Women's Human Rights Law Clinic of City University of New York's Law School and Harvard Law School's Human Rights Program³⁴⁵. The hard work and empowerment advocated by the various groups in the coalition paid off when, in 1996, the ICTY announced eight indictments of Bosnian Serbs in connection with war-time rape, thereby marking the first time rape was defined as a war crime instead of a by-product of war³⁴⁶. Defining rape as a war crime in 1996 gave wartime and systematic rape, and the perpetrators thereof, their "due place in international law"³⁴⁷.

³⁴¹ Lewin

³⁴² Haddad

³⁴³ Ibid.

³⁴⁴ Ibid.

³⁴⁵ Ibid.

³⁴⁶ Simons, Marlise. "U.N. Court, for the First Time, Defines Rape as War Crime." New York Times, Jun 28, 1996. Web.

³⁴⁷ Ibid.

Furthermore, a 2014 summit on ending sexual violence in conflict released a guidance statement meant to facilitate reparations with respect to women survivors³⁴⁸. These new guidelines highlighted the need for reparations focused on helping the victims of violence, which was the most neglected part of post-genocide justice in preference for perpetrator conviction³⁴⁹. Reparations such as gender-specific healthcare, victim education, land restitution and inheritance, apologies by states and perpetrators, commemorations for victims, and acknowledgment of the suffering these women went through are all suggested to be incorporated in peacebuilding after violence against women has been committed³⁵⁰. These principles were meant to emphasize the need for equal opportunity in reparations with specific clarifications toward long-term, in-depth, transformative solutions as opposed to male-only and once-off procedures³⁵¹. The fact that this guidance was needed as late as 2014 showcases that violence against women is still occurring on a large scale and that there is a need for change in how violence against women is addressed post-fact. This guidance indicates that there are serious flaws in many legal systems that exclude the suffering of women and therefore do not address the many economic, physical, and psychological costs that women suffer because of the violence committed against them.

On a final note, there are certain things to be said for initiating methods of preventing violence against women in both a domestic and a genocidal setting. Prevention does impose costs on governments as it would involve legislative processes, training and maintenance of law enforcement, education centered around violence against women and its effects, and the

³⁴⁸ UN Women. *“Press Release: Turning the Tide on Sexual Violence in Conflict, New UN Guidance on Reparations Launched”*. UN Commission on the Status of Women, Jun 11, 2014.

³⁴⁹ *Ibid.*

³⁵⁰ *Ibid.*

³⁵¹ *Ibid.*

provision of social and welfare programs to those women already victimized³⁵². However, there are also benefits to governments for preventing violence against women, specifically in reducing health care costs, decreasing the stress on law enforcement over time, securing women stay in the work force and contribute to economic productivity and circulation³⁵³. Women are an important part of all nations' economies, therefore when mass atrocities are committed against them not only do the women suffer, so does the government and the economy.

Conclusion

Having gone through the essential elements in great detail, it is crucial to provide a slight overview prior to discussing the findings of the paper. It was established early on that terrorism, for the purposes of this paper, constituted any premeditated act or threat of violence against noncombatant civilians for a political purpose with the outcome of fear amongst the targeted population. Next it was stated that this definition of terrorism was applicable to acts of state terror against their own citizens despite many official definitions excluding states as possible actors due to the antiquated, though still prevalent, notion of sovereign immunity. These two facts combine to create the prerequisite for the remainder of the paper as genocide is later defined as the most atrocious and horrific type of state terror.

Genocide is the most notorious and the most violent state terror act, most notably known for the mass murders and massacres that are staples of an annihilation process. However, through the sole focus of physical violence, a plethora of other violent acts are ignored such as those of

³⁵² Wheaton, p95

³⁵³ Ibid.

religious persecution, political violence, and demoralization³⁵⁴. These types of violence are committed against a specific targeted group with the intent of extermination generally because of a grievance the government carries toward that group. Genocide then needed to be made distinct from other acts of state terror, namely war crimes and crimes against humanity. War crimes specify that the atrocities need to be committed during international conflict, and crimes against humanity lack the clause specifying a specific ethnic, religious, or socio-economic group³⁵⁵, therefore, genocide was the term used to depict the situations in which violence was committed by the state against its people.

A main point in the paper is that violence against women, and specifically sexual violence, is one of the most dangerous and damaging forms of violence during genocides, and that it is systematically used as a weapon against women of a targeted group. Research into the specific atrocities of sexual violence, and violence against women in general, is fairly new as women's stories and experiences have only recently been deemed worthy of note³⁵⁶. However, once breached into, the research shows that there are multiple methods and acts that constitute sexual violence and that they are usually accompanied by at least one other type of violence be it physical, verbal, psychological, spiritual, or financial³⁵⁷. In any case, it is important to note that though sexual violence is typically committed against females, there are men who have suffered through it as well, however, in genocides, generally, men and women are targeted for specific types of violence based on perceived gender roles such as men being warriors and protectors whereas women are mothers and nurturers³⁵⁸.

³⁵⁴ Lemkin in Meierhenrich, p59-61

³⁵⁵ Robertson, p383; Jones, p539

³⁵⁶ Joeden-Forgey, p89

³⁵⁷ Wheaton, p98-99

³⁵⁸ Joeden-Forgey, p95

Various examples of sexual violence were given from a multitude of genocides to provide the full spectrum of atrocities as well as to show that the use of sexual violence during genocides is widespread, systematic, and done throughout time. Examples from Armenia showed the use of mass rapes, sexual slavery, and sexual torture. Sexual slavery by genocidaires and mass rapes by supposed liberators were seen in Europe during the Holocaust. During the Holocaust, Japan's reign of terror in China featured the mass rape, sexual enslavement, and sexual mutilation of thousands of women. There was evidence and stories of rape camps in Bosnia and the evisceration of pregnant women. The Rwandan genocide showed the use of mass rape to degrade and dehumanize, as well as forced marriages. And lastly, Darfur showed mass rapes and the threats of forced impregnation.

To not make light of the many ramifications inflicted by violence against women, and specifically sexual violence, a section was dedicated to the many other effects of such violence. These included the repression and silencing of women's experiences, the stigmas and discrimination that survivors are subject to post-genocide, trauma and psychological disorders such as depression and battered woman syndrome, severe physical injuries, life-long diseases, and children born of rape. The point of including these ramifications was to show that women never cease to be victims after severe violence committed against them. Each of the mentioned ramifications carry with it personal, societal, and economic costs that these women have to deal with throughout the remainder of their lives.

Through comprehensive research of survivor accounts and studies done on the smaller scale of violence against women known as domestic violence, the paper found that there were many significant economic ramifications both to the women survivors and to the states they reside in. It should, however, be noted that research into the economic ramifications experienced

by women survivors of genocide is a very new subject and as such has not yet been researched in depth nor over long periods of time and that this paper is therefore only scratching the surface of the potential effects. In any case, costs experienced by women include, but are certainly not limited to: exploitation, unemployment or employment instability leading to issues with economic hardship and no employment benefits, extreme poverty, single-parenthood meaning women are suddenly the only provider of income as well as the only disciplinary figure, perpetuation of violent situations, inheritance battles, medicinal costs, costs associated with raising children, deplorable living conditions (particularly for refugees and social outcasts), limited opportunities of gaining financial independence, limited international governmental and local government humanitarian aid, lowered standard of living, lack of access to education, and lack of social protections. Many of these costs are compounded which makes the hope for future change in economic situation unreachable for most of the women survivors and can even impact the future chances for their children.

National governments and economies experience costs associated with the upkeep of refugee camps, limited workforces, limited productivity, appalling economic devastation from the period of violence, costs associated with social welfare, costs associated with health care, and costs incurred through the lack of economic independence of the violated women and their children. Therefore, it should be in a governments interest to prevent the violence against women, and indeed all of their people, particularly through such severe measures as state-run genocide. The prevalence of non-governmental organizations' social outreach programs, often decades after the genocides have ended, indicate that there were never good enough measures set in place after the genocide ended which further suggests that the governments who instigated the violence did not care for the reintegration of the violated due to lingering stigmas and prejudices.

Moreover, the prevalence of NGO programs indicates a continued need, and an immediate need, for economic and medical assistance to women survivors of genocides.

The economic costs of violence against women to both the victims and the states are immeasurable and continuous. After genocides have been committed by states, the suffering of women victims is soon forgotten or undermined through social silence, and as such these women do not get the help that they need to become financially independent and active members of their states, whether in the perpetrating state or in a hostile host state. That is outrageous in today's modern world so focused on human rights, and particularly on the need to strengthen women's rights. It is also surprising that the states housing women victims do so little to help them as these women are undoubtedly using government resources that could be used elsewhere if these women were helped to become financially stable. Furthermore, it has been shown that NGO programs have helped to make significant differences in the lives of women survivors and through that help have also significantly reduced the burden on the state to care for these survivors.

In addition to being forgotten on an international and economic level, female survivors of sexual violence are often overlooked in the international legal system. As mentioned earlier, Bosnian women along with a coalition of NGOs had to fight to get recognition, and in other places, such as Rwanda, the communities formed local courts to sort out their troubles themselves as international tribunals were not much help³⁵⁹. Despite the progress made at international tribunals in getting rape recognized as both a war crime and a crime of genocide, little has been done to enforce those findings³⁶⁰. Yes, Jean-Paul Akayesu was held responsible

³⁵⁹ Jones, p544

³⁶⁰ Jones, p538; Simons

for his crimes against females in Rwanda³⁶¹, and Kunarac, Kovač, and Furundžija were sentenced to 28, 20, and 10 years imprisonment, respectively, in Bosnia³⁶², however, there are many more perpetrators walking around freely than are sentenced. The woman identified as ZR, a survivor of rape in the Bosnian Genocide, knows that despite the statement she gave and despite showing the remnants of her family and home to prosecutors, her assailant has never been arrested³⁶³. The reason given for the lack of an arrest was that the Tribunal needed time to find her assailant, but ZR sees him walking around in Foča as a free man³⁶⁴. In 2010, over a decade after the Bosnian genocide's end, only 28 people have been prosecuted for their crimes against females, while 20,000 or more victims still wait on their assailants' judgment to come³⁶⁵.

The neglect of responsibility to prosecute violence against females is still an issue today. It was not until March of 2016 that the ICC convicted their first case of rape as a war crime³⁶⁶ despite having operated since 2002. Furthermore, though genocides are not as prevalent in recent years as they were in the early 1990s, the same issue of lack of accountability is applicable to UN peacekeepers committing violence against females. Though the United Nations have only publicized records from 2015 forward, allegations of violence against women and children have followed UN peacekeeping missions throughout their history³⁶⁷. Everywhere from Haiti to the Ivory Coast to the Central African Republic to the Democratic Republic of Congo to South Sudan to anywhere peacekeepers are stationed, stories of sexual exploitation and abuse spring

³⁶¹ Jones, p538

³⁶² ICTY Legacy. "Landmark Cases." International Criminal Tribunal for the former Yugoslavia. Web.

³⁶³ Hogan

³⁶⁴ Ibid.

³⁶⁵ Ibid.

³⁶⁶ Premium Official News. "UN Welcomes ICC's First Conviction for Rape as a War Crime." Business Insights: Global, Mar 27, 2016. Web.

³⁶⁷ Essa, Azad. "Why do Some Peacekeepers Rape? The Full Report: Al Jazeera Examines the Accusations of Sexual Abuse and Exploitation Against the UN and What is Being Done to Stop Them." Al Jazeera, Aug 10, 2017. Web.

forth³⁶⁸. Some of these reported rapes have resulted in children³⁶⁹ causing the same issues to arise as with children born of genocidal rape. What is worse is that the peacekeepers, much like genocidaires, rape not only women, but children too, as the perpetrators take advantage of the vulnerabilities of their victims' situations – vulnerabilities of poverty and unequal power distribution apply to victims of rape by peacekeepers, whereas victims of genocidal sexual violence are vulnerable due to the death and organized sexual violence surrounding them³⁷⁰.

Up until recently, the immunity clause protecting UN peacekeepers has been an inhibitor to legal justice, much as sovereign immunity has been concerning state actors committing terrorist acts against their own civilians³⁷¹. Though the UN has taken some action to hold accountable those committing violence against females, they are largely failing to do so. The majority of, if not almost all, cases brought to the attention of the United Nations since 2015 remain in a limbo stage³⁷² and are simply listed as 'pending' on the UN's own table of allegations³⁷³. A few cases are listed as 'repatriated', meaning the peacekeeper(s) responsible has/have been sent home to potentially face legal justice, and fewer still have been jailed or received official punishment for their atrocious crimes³⁷⁴. This lack of action against perpetrators of violence against females suggests either that immunity – whether sovereign or peacekeeper's – is still an inhibitor to legal justice, or, more likely, that female survivors are purposefully repressed and forgotten.

³⁶⁸ Essa; Agence France-Presse. "UN Peacekeepers Accused of Child Rape in South Sudan: Nepalese Troops Serving in UN Mission Alleged to Have Raped Two Teenage Girls." *The Guardian*, Apr 23, 2018. Web.

³⁶⁹ Essa; Wheeler, Skye. "UN Peacekeeping has a Sexual Abuse Problem." Human Rights Watch, Jan 11, 2020. Web.

³⁷⁰ Essa; Wheeler; Cox, p166

³⁷¹ Essa

³⁷² Ibid.

³⁷³ Conduct in UN Field Missions. "Sexual Exploitation and Abuse: Table of Allegations." United Nations. Web.

³⁷⁴ Ibid.

Through this in-depth analysis of the atrocity of state-run genocide, the sexual violence specifically targeting females, and the many lasting economic effects experienced by survivors it becomes clear that there is a pattern. It does not matter the decade, the continent, the country, the government, the weaponry used, the perpetrator, the victim group, etc., the observation of male behaviour of violence toward ‘enemy’ – and occasionally even their own – females remains a constant throughout genocides. No matter what genocide is called into focus, there is bound to be evidence of sexual violence against females as a genocidal strategy, and, depending on how thorough the genocide, some survivors who will need help to piece together their lives after such horrific tragedies. Moreover, it is remarkable that more has not been done to help these women, particularly as their ongoing suffering has lasting economic effects for them as well as for the states they reside in. One of the main reasons for this is undeniably that little research has been done in the area of economic effects of genocide for women and therefore nothing is known about what needs to be done. The translation of the effects of domestic violence to those likely to appear after sexual and physical violence against women in genocides should serve to provide a little insight into the vast complications women face after such atrocious acts during genocides and to highlight the need for further research.

As stated throughout the paper and its argument, this research is very new, incomplete, and more than likely leaves out economic costs that have not been highlighted but have severe impacts on the lives of survivors of violence against women in state-run genocides. That being said, this paper has made its best effort at providing a comprehensive understanding of the various economic costs incurred by survivors as well as costs imposed on governments through the costs to the survivors. There is a need for further research in this area, particularly with respect to the specific economic costs that women survivors experience, as well as long term

studies looking at whether these costs are life-long or whether there is hope for future improvement for these survivors.

It is unfortunate and outrageous that women survivors of such unspeakable violence through state terror are forgotten, and therefore it is important to bring to light the conditions through which these survivors still suffer.

Bibliography

Adams, Adrienne, et. al.. *Development of the Scale of Economic Abuse*. Violence Against Women Vol 14 No 5. Sage publications, May 2008 (p563-588. 10.1177/1077801208315529) Article.

Adams, Adrienne, et. al.. *The Impact of Intimate Partner Violence on Low-Income Women's Economic Well-Being: The Mediating Role of Job Stability*. Violence Against Women vol 18 no. 12. Sage Publications, 2013 (p1345-1367. 10.1177/1077801212474294) Article

Agence France-Presse. "UN Peacekeepers Accused of Child Rape in South Sudan: Nepalese Troops Serving in UN Mission Alleged to Have Raped Two Teenage Girls." The Guardian, Apr 23, 2018. Web. <https://www.theguardian.com/world/2018/apr/24/un-peacekeepers-accused-of-child-in-south-sudan>

Balakian, Peter. *The Burning of the Tigris: The Armenian Genocide and America's Response*. Harper Perennial, New York, NY, 2003. Print.

Bergen, Doris L.. *War & Genocide: A Concise History of the Holocaust*. 2nd ed. Rowman and Littlefield, Lanham, Maryland, 2009. Print.

Buergenthal, Thomas. "The Normative and Institutional Evolution of International Human Rights." In Callaway, Rhonda L., and Julie Harrelson-Stephens. *Exploring International Human Rights: Essential Readings*. Rienner, Boulder, CO, 2007. Print.

Burnet, Jennie E.. *Situating Sexual Violence in Rwanda (1990-2001): Sexual Agency, Sexual Consent, and the Political Economy of War*. African Studies Review, Vol 55 no 2. Sep 2012 (p97-118). Article.

- Callaway, Rhonda L., and Julie Harrelson-Stephens. *Exploring International Human Rights: Essential Readings*. Rienner, Boulder, CO, 2007. Print
- Charny, Israel W.. “*Toward a Generic Definition of Genocide.*” In Meierhenrich, Jens. *Genocide: A Reader*. Oxford University Press, Oxford, 2014. Print. p85-86
- Chernotsky, Harry I., and Heidi H. Hobbs. *Crossing Borders: International Studies for the 21st Century*. SAGE Publications, Thousand Oaks, CA, 2013. Print
- Chong, Daniel P. L.. *Debating Human Rights*. Rienner, Boulder, CO, 2014. Print
- Combs, Cynthia C.. *Terrorism in the Twenty-First Century*. 8th ed. Routledge, New York, NY, 2018. Print
- Conduct in UN Field Missions. “*Sexual Exploitation and Abuse: Table of Allegations.*” United Nations. Web. <https://conduct.unmissions.org/table-of-allegations>
- Convention on the Prevention and Punishment of the Crime of Genocide. United Nations General Assembly, 1951. Document.
- Cox, John. *To Kill A People: Genocide in the Twentieth Century*. Oxford, Oxford University Press, 2017. Print
- Essa, Azad. “*Why do Some Peacekeepers Rape? The Full Report: Al Jazeera Examines the Accusations of Sexual Abuse and Exploitation Against the UN and What is Being Done to Stop Them.*” Al Jazeera, Aug 10, 2017. Web. <https://www.aljazeera.com/indepth/features/2017/08/peacekeepers-rape-full-report-170804134221292.html>

- Fein, Helen. “*Genocide: A Sociological Perspective.*” In Meierhenrich, Jens. *Genocide: A Reader*. Oxford University Press, Oxford, 2014. Print. p73-75
- Frieden, Jeffrey A., David A. Lake, and Kenneth A. Schultz. *World Politics: Interests, Interactions, Institutions*. 3rd ed. W. W. Norton & Company, Inc, Canada, 2016. Print
- Fox, Nicole. *Memory in Interaction: Gender-Based Violence, Genocide, and Commemoration*. *Signs: Journal of Women in Culture and Society* 45, no 1 (Autumn 2019): 123-148. Article.
- Gangoli, Geetanjali. *Engendering Genocide: Gender, conflict and violence*. *Women’s Studies International Forum* 29 (2006) 534-538. Article Review
- Haddad, Heidi N.. *Mobilizing the Will to Prosecute: Crimes of Rape at the Yugoslav and Rwandan Tribunals*. *Human Rights Review*, vol. 12, 2011 (109-132). Article.
- Hogan, Pamela. “I Came to Testify.” *Women, War and Peace*. PBS, 2011. Documentary
- Howard, Russell D., and Bruce Hoffman. *Terrorism and Counterterrorism: Understanding the New Security Environment*. 4th ed. McGraw-Hill, New York, NY, 2012. Print.
- ICTY Legacy. “*Landmark Cases.*” International Criminal Tribunal for the former Yugoslavia. Web. <https://www.icty.org/en/features/crimes-sexual-violence/landmark-cases>
- International Criminal Court. “*About the International Criminal Court*”. International Criminal Court. Web. <http://www.icc-cpi.int/about>
- Joeden-Forgey, Elisa von. *Gender and the Future of Genocide Studies and Prevention*. Project Muse. *Genocide Studies and Prevention* vol 7 no 1, spring 2012 (p89-107). Article

Jones, Adam. *Genocide: A Comprehensive Introduction*. 2nd ed. Routledge, New York, NY, 2011. Print

Jusić, Ajna. *I am Generation Equality: 'I am a child born out of wartime rape'*. UN Commission on the Status of Women, Nov. 18, 2019. Web.

<https://www.unwomen.org/en/news/stories/2019/11/i-am-generation-equality-ajna-jusic-forgotten-children-of-war>

Korac, Maja. *War, Flight, and Exile: Gendered Violence among Refugee Women from post-Yugoslav States*. In *Sites of Violence: Gender and Conflict Zones* by Wenona Giles and Jennifer Hyndman, University of California Press, p249-272, 2004. Print.

Krain, Matthew. "State-Sponsored Mass Murder: The Onset and Severity of Genocides and Politicides." In Meierhenrich, Jens. *Genocide: A Reader*. Oxford University Press, Oxford, 2014. Print. p480-483

Lemkin, Raphaël. "Genos and Cide." In Meierhenrich, Jens. *Genocide: A Reader*. Oxford University Press, Oxford, 2014. Print. p57-61

Leydesdorff, Selma. *Narratives of Survivors of Srebrenica: How do they Reconnect to the World?*. In *Women and Genocide: Survivors, Victims, Perpetrators*, ed. Bemporad, Elissa and Joyce W. Warren. Indiana University Press, 2018. Print

Lewin, Tamar. "The Balkans Rapes: a Legal Test for the Outraged." New York Times, Jan 15, 1993. Web. <https://www.nytimes.com/1993/01/15/news/the-balkans-rapes-a-legal-test-for-the-outraged.html>

- Marković, Nada. *From Where I Stand: Nada Marković*. UN Commission on the Status of Women, Oct. 18, 2016. Web. <https://www.unwomen.org/en/news/stories/2016/10/from-where-i-stand-nada-markovic>
- Meierhenrich, Jens. *Genocide: A Reader*. Oxford, Oxford University Press, 2014. Print
- Mertus, Julie A., and Jeffrey W. Helsing. *Human Rights & Conflict: Exploring the Links between Rights, Law, and Peacebuilding*. USIP, Washington DC., 2006. Print
- Paust, Jordan J. "Human Rights, Terrorism, and Efforts to Combat Terrorism". In Mertus, Julie A., and Jeffrey W. Helsing. *Human Rights & Conflict: Exploring the Links Between Rights, Law, and Peacebuilding*. USIP, Washington DC, 2006. Print.
- Payne, Richard J.. *Global Issues*. 4th ed. Pearson Education, Upper Saddle River, NJ, 2013. Print
- Power, Samantha. *'A Problem from Hell': America and the Age of Genocide*. Basic Books, New York, NY, 2002. Print
- Premium Official News. "UN Welcomes ICC's First Conviction for Rape as a War Crime." Business Insights: Global, Mar 27, 2016. Web. <https://bi-gale-com.proxy.libraries.smu.edu/global/article/GALE%7CA571038029?u=txshracd2548>
- Proctor, Robert N.. *Racial Hygiene: Medicine Under the Nazis*. Harvard University Press, Cambridge, MA, 1988. Print.
- Robertson, Geoffrey. *Crimes Against Humanity: The Struggle for Global Justice*. 3rd ed. The New Press, New York, NY, 2006. Print
- Rummel, R. J.. "Death by Government." In Meierhenrich, Jens. *Genocide: A Reader*. Oxford University Press, Oxford, 2014. Print. p76-78

Simons, Marlise. "U.N. Court, for the First Time, Defines Rape as War Crime." New York Times, Jun 28, 1996. Web. <https://www.nytimes.com/1996/06/28/world/un-court-for-first-time-defines-rape-as-war-crime.html>

Socolovsky, Jerome. "Bosnian 'Rape Camp' Survivors Testify in The Hague." Women's ENews, July 19, 2000. Web Article. <http://womensenews.org/2000/07/bosnian-rape-camp-survivors-testify-the-hague/>

United Nations Declaration on the Elimination of Violence Against Women, United Nations, 1993. (UNDEVAW). Document.

UN Women. *Press Release: Turning the Tide on Sexual Violence in Conflict, New UN Guidance on Reparations Launched*. UN Commission on the Status of Women, Jun 11, 2014. Web. <https://www.unwomen.org/en/news/stories/2014/6/new-un-guidance-on-reparations-launched>

UN Women. *Protecting Witnesses of Wartime Rape in Bosnia and Herzegovina*. UN Commission on the Status of Women, Nov 19, 2012. Web. <https://www.unwomen.org/en/news/stories/2012/11/protecting-witnesses-of-wartime-rape-in-bosnia-and-herzegovina>

UN Women. *UN Women-Supported Project to Provide Legal and Medical Services to Rwandan Widows*. UN Commission on the Status of Women, Jul 26, 2011. Web. <https://www.unwomen.org/en/news/stories/2011/7/un-women-supported-project-to-provide-legal-and-medical-services-to-rwandan-widows>

Warren, Mary A.. "Gendercide: The Implications of Sex Selection". In Meierhenrich, Jens. *Genocide: A Reader*. Oxford University Press, Oxford, 2014. Print. p78-80

Watanabe, Kazuko. “*Trafficking in Women’s Bodies, Then and Now: The Issue of Military ‘Comfort Women’*”. In Callaway, Rhonda L., and Julie Harrelson-Stephens. *Exploring International Human Rights: Essential Readings*. Rienner, Boulder, CO, 2007. Print. p186-190

Way Up. “*How Much Should I Be Paid at an Entry Level Job?*”. Web. Accessed 03/19/2020. <https://www.wayup.com/guide/much-paid-entry-level-job/>

Weitz, Eric D.. “*A Century of Genocide.*” In Meierhenrich, Jens. *Genocide: A Reader*. Oxford University Press, Oxford, 2014. Print. p70-73

Wheaton, Elisabeth M.. *The Economics of Human Rights*. Routledge, New York, NY, 2019. Print

Wheeler, Skye. “*UN Peacekeeping has a Sexual Abuse Problem.*” Human Rights Watch, Jan 11, 2020. Web. <https://www.hrw.org/news/2020/01/11/un-peacekeeping-has-sexual-abuse-problem#>