# Table of Contents

## Articles

The *West Caribbean Conundrum*: The United States Versus France on the Availability of *Forum Non Conveniens* Under the Montreal Convention of 1999  
*David Cluxton*  
3

Avoiding Pyrrhic Victories in Orbit: A Need for Kinetic Anti-Satellite Arms Control in the Twenty-First Century  
*Captain Cort S. Thompson*  
105

## Casenotes

The Not So Friendly Skies: Pilots’ Attempt to Claim Employer Collusion with Rival Pilots Union During Collective Bargaining Fails in *Beckington*  
*Drew Baker*  
167

Air Ambulances and State Contract Claims: The Opening to Avoid ADA Preemption  
*John David Janicek*  
177

The Ninth Circuit’s Left Hook: Criminal Venue in the Skies and Why *Lozoya* Hits the Mark  
*Christopher Thomson*  
189

Unfair Disclosure—Adopting a Limited Consultant Corollary for FOIA’s Exemption 5 in Attorney Work–Product Cases Preserves Litigation Parity for Agencies Like the FAA  
*Ellen Smith Yost*  
199

Minimum Wage Requirements: Seventh Circuit Perpetuates Employer-Friendly FLSA Interpretation  
*Ashley Jo Zaccagnini*  
209
The *Journal of Air Law and Commerce* (ISSN 0021-8642) is published four times a year, (1) Winter, (2) Spring, (3) Summer, and (4) Fall, by the SMU Law Review Association. Subscription rates are $43.00 per year, domestic, and $50.00 per year, foreign. Single issues are available at $16.00 per copy. Add 8.25% tax on all single issue orders within the State of Texas. Tax exempt institutions must include a copy of their exemption certificate with orders. An additional charge will be made for postage and handling. Periodicals postage paid at Dallas, Texas, and at additional mailing offices. Prior issues (vols. 1-82) available from William S. Hein & Co., 2350 North Forest Road, Getzville, New York 14068. Volumes 83–84 are available from the *Journal of Air Law and Commerce*, Southern Methodist University School of Law, P.O. Box 750116, Dallas, Texas 75275. POSTMASTER: Send address changes to *Journal of Air Law and Commerce*, Southern Methodist University, Dedman School of Law, P.O. Box 750116, Dallas, Texas 75275. Printed by Joe Christensen, Inc., P.O. Box 81269, Lincoln, Nebraska 68501.

Citations conform with *The Bluebook: A Uniform System of Citation* (20th ed. 2018) and *Texas Rules of Form* (14th ed. 2018). Please note that due to the justification of the articles, citations to internet sources may contain an additional space between double backslashes.

Please address all manuscripts electronically to the Editor in Chief, *Journal of Air Law and Commerce*, Southern Methodist University School of Law, P.O. Box 750116, Dallas, Texas 75275 or by email at jalceic@smu.edu. Submitted manuscripts should be double-spaced. Footnotes rather than endnotes should be used and should also be double-spaced. Word processing capabilities and requirements are available on request. A brief autobiographical statement should accompany the submission. Unsolicited manuscripts will not be returned unless return postage or a stamped, self-addressed envelope is enclosed.

Replacement copies are sent to subscribers upon prompt notification of non-receipt or defective copies. Subscriptions are cancelled automatically upon expiration. All notifications of change of address should include old address, including zip code, and new address, including zip code. Please notify one month in advance to ensure prompt delivery.

Address inquiries to the *Journal of Air Law and Commerce*, Southern Methodist University School of Law, P.O. Box 750116, Dallas, Texas 75275.

Published quarterly by the SMU Law Review Association.

© Copyright 2020 by the Southern Methodist University Dedman School of Law.
ADVISORY BOARD

Gary W. Allen  
Attorney at Law  
Williamsburg, VA

John J. Nance  
Aviation Author & Attorney at Law  
Friday Harbor, WA

Dr. P. Nikolai Ehlers  
Ehlers, Ehlers & Partners  
Munich, Germany

David T. Norton  
Shackelford, Bowen, McKinley & Norton, LLP  
Dallas, TX

Elizabeth Mireya Freidenberg  
Freidenberg, Freidenberg & Lifsc  
Buenos Aires, Argentina

John F. Pritchard  
Holland & Knight  
New York, NY

Eileen M. Gleimer  
Crowell & Moring, LLP  
Washington, DC

Don G. Rushing  
La Jolla, CA

H. Norman Kinzy  
SettlePou  
Dallas, TX

Mark R. Shaw  
Executive Vice President  
Chief Legal & Regulatory Officer  
Southwest Airlines  
Dallas, TX

Paul B. Larsen  
Attorney at Law  
Bainbridge Island, WA

Charles H. Smith  
Cantey Hanger LLP  
Dallas, TX

Robert Lawson  
Quadrant Chambers, Quadrant House  
London, England

Charles A. Tarpley  
Attorney at Law  
Dallas, TX

Allan I. Mendelsohn  
Attorney at Law  
Washington, DC

Windle Turley  
Turley Law Firm  
Dallas, TX

Pablo M.J. Mendes de Leon  
Professor of Air & Space Law  
University of Leiden  
The Netherlands

William R. Wyatt  
Sheppard, Mullin, Richter & Hampton, L.L.P.  
New York, NY

Marc S. Moller  
Kreindler & Kreindler  
New York, NY
### SMU Law Review Association Announces Its 2019-2020 Staff

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Name</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Alexa Acquista</td>
<td>Shannon McKelvie</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Daniel Alexander</td>
<td>Nolan McQueen</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Drew Baker</td>
<td>Morgan Mendicino</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>West Bakke</td>
<td>Jack Milligan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>John Behan</td>
<td>Emily Nguyen</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eli Brook</td>
<td>Drew Nunn</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jordan Brownlow</td>
<td>Garrett Parish</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Haley M. Caradonna</td>
<td>Katherine Perry</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wyatt Z. Conoly</td>
<td>Leah Powers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clifford M. Dunman</td>
<td>Evan Rios</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parker Embry</td>
<td>Elizabeth Sanders</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Madison George</td>
<td>John Sasso</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Joseph Blake Glatstein</td>
<td>Austin Schley</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shelby Greaves</td>
<td>Sara Scully</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kyle Gromann</td>
<td>Kala Simpson</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jay Harper</td>
<td>Heather Sims</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Robert Hill</td>
<td>Morgan Smith</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Michael Boyce Holleman</td>
<td>Jason Spotts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>John David Janicek</td>
<td>Haley Steinman</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chaitu Jayanti</td>
<td>Autumn Stewart</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emily Kelly</td>
<td>Laura Sundin</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>James Kemp</td>
<td>Christopher Thomson</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Carter Kristek</td>
<td>Brooke Vaydik</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mary Love</td>
<td>Ryan Wynne</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Meagan Maloney</td>
<td>Ellen Yost</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lilian Marrs</td>
<td>Austin Young</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stephanie Mason</td>
<td>Ashley Jo Zaccagnini</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jacob Matthew</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
SOUTHERN METHODIST UNIVERSITY DEDMAN
SCHOOL OF LAW

OFFICERS OF THE UNIVERSITY
R. Gerald Turner, President
Elizabeth Loboa, Provost and Vice President for Academic Affairs
Brad E. Cheves, Vice President for Development and External Affairs
Christine C. Regis, Vice President for Business and Finance and Treasurer
Harold W. Stanley, Vice President for Executive Affairs
Paul J. Ward, Vice President for Legal Affairs and Government Relations, General Counsel, and Secretary
Kenechukwu (K.C.) Mmeje, Vice President for Student Affairs
Michael H. Hites, Chief Information Officer
Rakesh Dahiya, Chief Investment Officer
Rick Hart, Director for Athletics

DEDMAN SCHOOL OF LAW
FACULTY AND ADMINISTRATIVE STAFF
Jennifer Collins, B.A., J.D. Judge James Noel Dean and Professor of Law
Lolita Buckner Inniss, A.B., J.D., LL.M., Ph.D., Sr. Associate Dean for Academic Affairs and Professor of Law
Nathan Cortez, B.A., J.D., Associate Dean for Research, Adelfa Botello Callejo Endowed Professor of Law in Leadership and Latino Studies, and Gerald J. Ford Research Fellow
Mary B. Spector, B.A., J.D., Associate Dean for Clinics, Co-Director of the Civil Clinic, Director of Consumer Advocacy Project, and Professor of Law
Greg Ivy, B.B.A., M.A., J.D., Associate Dean for Library & Technology, Underwood Law Library
Martin L. Camp, B.A., J.D., Assistant Dean for Graduate and International Programs
Becca Henley, B.A., J.D., Assistant Dean for Administration
Jill Nikirk, B.A., J.D., Assistant Dean for Admissions
Karen C. Sargent, B.B.A., J.D., Assistant Dean and Executive Director for Career Services
Stephen B. Yeager, B.B.A., J.D., Assistant Dean for Student Affairs
Anne G. Beard, Director of Development
Laura G. Burstein, B.A., J.D., Director of Public Service and Director of Academic Success
Lynn McVicker Dempsey, B.B.A., Director of External Relations
Erica Fadel, Director of Career Services
Natalie Thompson Greco, Director of Programs and Operations, Tsai Center for Law, Science, and Innovation
Kristy Offenburger, Director of Communications and Marketing
Michelle A. Ray, Director of Admissions
Rey Rodriguez, B.B.A., J.D., Director of Career Services and Diversity and Inclusion Initiatives
Jerchel Anderson, E.M.B.A., Director of Financial Services
Laura Amberson, B.S., Registrar

FACULTY
Roy R. Anderson, B.A., J.D., LL.M., Professor Emeritus of Law
Hillel J. Bavli, B.A., J.D., LL.M., M.A., Ph.D., Assistant Professor of Law
Maureen N. Armour, B.A., M.S.W., J.D., Professor Emeritus of Law
Misty Birdsong, B.A., J.D., Clinical Professor of Legal Research, Writing, and Advocacy
Lackland H. Bloom, Jr., B.A., J.D., Larry and Jane Harlan Senior Research Fellow and Professor of Law
Chanté Brantley, B.S., M.S.S.W., J.D., Director of the VanSickle Family Law Clinic and Assistant Clinical Professor
William J. Bridge, B.S.F.S., J.D., Professor Emeritus of Law
Brook Busbee, B.A.S., J.D., Adjunct Clinical Professor of Law, Criminal Justice Clinic
Regis W. Campfield, B.B.A., LL.B., Professor Emeritus of Law and Marilyn Jeanne Johnson Distinguished Law Faculty Fellow Emeritus
Beverly M. Carl, B.S.L., J.D., LL.M., Professor Emeritus of Law
Dale Carpenter, B.A., J.D., Judge William Hawley Atwell Chair of Constitutional Law and Professor of Law
Michaela E. Cashen, B.A., J.D., Clinical Professor of Legal Research, Writing, and Advocacy
Eric Cedillo, B.S., J.D., Adjunct Clinical Professor of Law, Consumer Advocacy Project
David J. Cho, B.A., J.D., Adjunct Clinical Professor of Law, Trademark Clinic
Anthony J. Colangelo, B.A., J.D., LL.M., J.S.D., Gerald J. Ford Research Fellow and Professor of Law
James W. Coleman, B.A., J.D., Associate Professor of Law
Gregory S. Crespi, B.S., M.S., Ph.D., J.D., Homer R. Mitchell Endowed Professor of Law in Commercial and Insurance Law, and Professor of Law
Ruth A. Cross, B.A., J.D., Director of Legal Research, Writing, and Advocacy Program and Senior Lecturer in Law
Gail Daly, B.A., M.A., J.D., Professor Emeritus of Law
William V. Dorsey, III, B.A., J.D., Chief Justice John and Lena Hickman Distinguished Faculty Fellow and Professor of Law
Beverly C. Duréus, B.A., J.D., Homer R. Mitchell Endowed Professor of Law in Commercial and Insurance Law, and Professor of Law
Linda S. Eads, B.A., J.D., Professor Emeritus of Law
Jeffrey M. Gaba, B.A., J.D., M.P.H., M.D. Anderson Foundation Endowed Professor in Health Law, and Professor of Law
JoAnna A. Hubbard, B.S., J.D., Clinical Professor of Legal Research, Writing and Advocacy
Marc Hubbard, B.S., J.D., Adjunct Clinical Professor of Law, Patent Clinic
Greg Ivy, B.B.A., M.A., J.D., Associate Dean for Library & Technology, Underwood Law Library and Senior Lecturer
Christopher M. Jenkins, B.S., J.D., Ph.D. Candidate, Director of the Criminal Justice Clinic and Associate Professor of Law
Larry Jones, B.B.A., J.D., LL.M., Adjunct Clinical Professor of Law, Federal Tax Clinic
Jeffrey Kahn, B.A., M.Phil., D.Phil., J.D., Gerald J. Ford Research Fellow and Professor of Law
Ndiva Kofele-Kale, B.A., M.A., J.D., Professors Emeritus of Law
Julie Lesser, B.A., J.D., Adjunct Clinical Professor of Law, Innocence Clinic
Henry J. Lischer, Jr., B.B.A., J.D., LL.M. in Taxation, Professor Emeritus of Law
John S. Lowe, B.A., LL.B., George W. Hutchison Chair in Energy Law and Professor of Law
George A. Martinez, B.A., M.A., J.D., Professor of Law
Pamela R. Metzger, B.A., J.D., Director of the Deason Family Criminal Law Reform Center and Professor of Law
Charles J. Morris, B.A., LL.B., Professor Emeritus of Law
Frederick C. Moss, A.B., J.D., LL.M., Professor Emeritus of Law
John J. Mylan, B.S., J.D., LL.M. in Taxation, Professor Emeritus of Law
Natalie Nansasi, B.A., J.D., Director of the Judge Elmo B. Hunter Legal Center for Victims of Crimes Against Women and Assistant Professor of Law
Joseph Jude Norton, A.B., LL.B., LL.M., J.D., D.Phil., L.L.D., James L. Walsh Distinguished Faculty Fellow and Professor in Financial Institutions Law
Anna Oliff, A.B., M.Phil., Ph.D., Assistant Professor of Law
Victoria Palacios, J.D., Professor Emeritus of Law
Kenneth L. Penegar, A.B., J.D., LL.M., Professor Emeritus of Law
Carla L. Reyes, B.A., J.D., LL.M., M.P.P., Assistant Professor of Law
W. Keith Robinson, B.S., J.D., Altshuler Distinguished Teaching Professor, Co-Director of the Tsai Center for Law, Science and Innovation and Associate Professor of Law
C. Paul Rogers III, B.A., J.D., LL.M., Marilyn Jeanne Johnson Distinguished Faculty Fellow, Professor of Law, and Former Dean
Julia P. Rogers, B.S.E.E., J.D., Professor of Law
Eric M. Rubin, B.A., J.D., Assistant Professor of Law
Meghan Ryan, A.B., J.D., Gerald J. Ford Research Fellow and Professor of Law
Eliot Shavin, B.A., J.D., Adjunct Clinical Professor of Law, Civil Clinic
Walter W. Steele Jr., LL.B., Professor Emeritus of Law
Marc I. Steinberg, A.B., J.D., LL.M., Rupert and Lillian Radford Chair in Law and Professor of Law
Heather L. Stobaugh, B.A., M.A., J.D., Clinical Professor of Legal Research, Writing and Advocacy
Diane M. Sumoski, B.A., J.D., Director of the W.W. Caruth, Jr. Child Advocacy Clinic, Director of the W.W. Caruth, Jr. Institute for Children’s Rights, and Lecturer in Law
Joshua C. Tate, B.A., M.A., M.Phil., J.D., Ph.D., Professor of Law
David O. Taylor, B.S., J.D., Co-Director of the Tsai Center for Law, Science and Innovation and Associate Professor of Law
Walther Theiss, A.B., M.B.A., J.D., Adjunct Clinical Professor of Law, Small Business Clinic
Elizabeth G. Thornburg, B.A., J.D., Richard R. Lee Endowed Professor, Altshuler University Distinguished Teaching Professor, and Professor of Law
Jenia Iontcheva Turner, B.A., J.D., Amy Abboud Ware Centennial Professor in Criminal Law
Jonni Walls, B.A., J.D., Clinical Professor of Legal Research, Writing and Advocacy
Jessica Dixon Weaver, B.A., J.D., Associate Professor of Law
Harvey Wingo, B.A., M.A., J.D., Vinson & Elkins Distinguished Teaching Fellow Emeritus and Professor Emeritus of Law
Peter Winship, B.A., LL.B., LL.M., J.S.D. Professor Emeritus of Law