



Volume 71

Issue 3 *Texas Gulf Sulphur 50th Anniversary*
Symposium Issue

Article 1

2018

Front Matter

Follow this and additional works at: <https://scholar.smu.edu/smulr>



Part of the [Law Commons](#)

Recommended Citation

Front Matter, 71 SMU L. Rev. i (2018)
<https://scholar.smu.edu/smulr/vol71/iss3/1>

This Front Matter is brought to you for free and open access by the Law Journals at SMU Scholar. It has been accepted for inclusion in SMU Law Review by an authorized administrator of SMU Scholar. For more information, please visit <http://digitalrepository.smu.edu>.

SMU Law Review

VOLUME 71

SUMMER 2018

NUMBER 3

© 2018 by Southern Methodist University

SMU LAW REVIEW
TEXAS GULF SULPHUR
50TH ANNIVERSARY SYMPOSIUM ISSUE

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ARTICLES

- Texas Gulf Sulphur* at Fifty—A
Contemporary and Historical Perspective *Marc I. Steinberg* 625
- Equal Access to Information: The Fraud
at the Heart of *Texas Gulf Sulphur* *Stephen M. Bainbridge* 643
- From *TGS* Conservatorships to Sarbanes–
Oxley Fair Funds *Richard M. Buxbaum* 653
- Texas Gulf Sulphur*: A Case Study on
Responding to Market Rumors *Wendy G. Couture* 675
- Seeking an Objective for Regulating Insider
Trading Through *Texas Gulf Sulphur* *James D. Cox* 697
- Texas Gulf Sulphur* and Information
Disclosure Policy *Onnig H. Dombalagian* 713
- From Equality to Duty: On Altering the
Reach, Impact, and Meaning of the
Texas Gulf Legacy *Lisa M. Fairfax* 729
- Constructive Ambiguity and Judicial
Development of Insider Trading *Jill E. Fisch* 749
- Personal Benefit Has No Place in
Misappropriation Tipping Cases *Merritt B. Fox* 767
& George N. Tepe
- Insider Trading *Tamar Frankel* 783

Will Fifty Years of the SEC's Disgorgement Remedy Be Abolished?	<i>Roberta S. Karmel</i>	799
From <i>Texas Gulf Sulphur</i> to <i>Laudato Si'</i> : Mining Equitable Principles from Insider Trading Law	<i>Michael J. Kaufman</i>	811
From <i>Texas Gulf Sulphur</i> to <i>Chiarella</i> : A Tale of Two Duties	<i>Donald C. Langevoort</i>	835
Thinking Fast and Slow About the Concept of Materiality	<i>Mark J. Loewenstein</i>	853
<i>Martoma</i> and <i>Newman</i> : Valid Corporate Purpose and the Personal Benefit Test	<i>Jonathan Macey</i>	869
Taming Rule 10b-5-1: The Unfinished Business of <i>Texas Gulf Sulphur</i>	<i>Daniel J. Morrissey</i>	883
The Statutory Authority for Court-Ordered Disgorgement in SEC Enforcement Actions . .	<i>Donna M. Nagy</i>	895
<i>Texas Gulf Sulphur</i> and the Genesis of Corporate Liability Under Rule 10b-5	<i>Adam C. Pritchard</i> & <i>Robert B. Thompson</i>	927
Unintended Consequences: The Link Between Judge Friendly's <i>Texas Gulf Sulphur</i> Concurrence and Recent Supreme Court Decisions Misconstruing Rule 10b-5	<i>Margaret V. Sachs</i>	947
The Coasian Firm and Insider Trading, Revisited	<i>James C. Spindler</i>	967
A Birthday Toast to <i>Texas Gulf Sulphur</i>	<i>Manning G. Warren III</i>	987
Disgorgement in Insider Trading Cases: FY2005-FY2015	<i>Verity Winship</i>	999

The *SMU Law Review* (ISSN 1066-1271) is published four times a year, (1) Winter, (2) Spring, (3) Summer, and (4) Fall, by the SMU Law Review Association, Storey Hall, Dallas, Texas 75275. Domestic subscription price, \$42.00 per year. Foreign subscription price, \$49.00 per year. Single copies: Regular issues, \$18.00 (add 8.25% tax on single issue orders within the state of Texas. Tax exempt institutions must include copy of exemption certificate with order.) An additional charge will be made for postage and handling of each order of single copies. Prior issues, volumes 1-69, are available from: William S. Hein & Co.; 2350 North Forest Road; Getzville, NY 14068. Volumes 70-71 are available from: *SMU Law Review*; Southern Methodist University; Dedman School of Law; P.O. Box 750116; Dallas, TX 75275-0116.

POSTMASTER: Send address changes to: *SMU Law Review*; Southern Methodist University; Dedman School of Law; P.O. Box 750116; Dallas, TX 75275-0116.

Editorial and business offices: *SMU Law Review*; Southern Methodist University; Dedman School of Law; P.O. Box 750116; Dallas, TX 75275-0116. Office: 214.768.2061 or 214.768.2570. Printed by Joe Christensen, Inc.; Lincoln, Nebraska 68521.

Periodicals postage paid at Dallas, Texas and at additional mailing offices.

Citations conform with *The Bluebook: A Uniform System of Citation* (20th ed. 2015) and *Texas Rules of Form* (14th ed. 2018), and *MoUS* (14th ed. 2018).

SMU Law Review

VOLUME 71

SUMMER 2018

NUMBER 3

Member, National Conference of Law Reviews

THE SMU LAW REVIEW ASSOCIATION 2017-2018 BOARD OF EDITORS

President

MICHAEL FECHNER

*SMU Law Review
Editor-in-Chief*
PHILIP SPENCER

Texas Survey Editor-in-Chief
CORY SCANLON

*Journal of Air Law &
Commerce
Editor-in-Chief*
BROOKE DORRIS

*SMU Law Review
Managing Editor*
ELIJAH C. STONE

Texas Survey Senior Editors
SARAH BRIGGS
CAIO FORMENTI

*Journal of Air Law &
Commerce
Managing Editor*
COURTNEY LUSTER

*SMU Associate
Managing Editors*
ANNE MCGINNIS
CHRISTOPHER ROSS
MARY SOMMERS

*Lead Articles
Editors*
RICHARD SALIBA
ANN STEHLING

*JALC Associate
Managing Editors*
JOANNA FIRTH
CATHERINE PARSLEY

ERIK ALLISON
TAMMIE BEASSIE BANKO
MATT CALLISON
SHANNON GLEN
TIMOTHY JOHNSTON
TAYLOR KARA
JUSTIN KELLER
CATHERINE KORDESTANI

Articles Editors
EFREN LEMUS
BRIAN LONG
MASHALL MOMIN
EMILY NASH
VICTORIA PETTY
ALICIA PITTS
STACY REEVES

ADRIENNE ROBERTS
ALEC SCHLINKERT
MICHAEL SCHLINKERT
KATIE SCHROEDER
PENELOPE SHUMWAY
ROBERT UHL
ANDREW UPTON
JUAN FELIPE VELASQUEZ

SMU Comment Editors
TAYLER GREEN
CAROLINE HUNT
SHELBY PERRY

Executive Editors
CHRISTOPHER COCHRAN
JOSEPH O'CONNELL

JALC Comment Editors
ERIN BREWER
ALEXANDER COHEN

*Corporate Counsel
Symposium Editors*
CHRISTOPHER BAILEY
MORGAN FRANCY

*Administrative Managing
Editor*
JORDAN TANOURY

*Air Law Symposium
Editor*
AUBREY EDKINS

*Symposium Technology
Editor*
RAJA CHATTERJEE

Symposium CLE Editors
LINDSEY RATTIKIN
ELIZABETH VINSON

*Air Law
Associate Symposium Editor*
HALEY KING

*SMU Law Review
Faculty Advisors*
THOMAS WM. MAYO
ANTHONY J. COLANGELO

*Corporate Directors Institute
Symposium Editor*
KATLYNE MILLER

*Journal of Air Law and
Commerce Faculty Advisor*
GREGORY S. CRESPI

*SMU Law Review
Administrative Assistant*
TALIBRA FERGUSON

*Journal of Air Law and Commerce
Administrative Assistant*
LISA BROWNING

MEMBER, NATIONAL CONFERENCE OF LAW REVIEWS

THE SMU LAW REVIEW ASSOCIATION PUBLISHES BOTH
THE SMU LAW REVIEW AND THE JOURNAL OF AIR LAW AND COMMERCE

SMU Law Review

VOLUME 71

SUMMER 2018

NUMBER 3

Member, National Conference of Law Reviews

THE SMU LAW REVIEW ASSOCIATION 2018-2019 BOARD OF EDITORS

President

STACY REEVES GULLEDGE

<i>SMU Law Review Editor-in-Chief</i> KELSEY FLORES	<i>Texas Survey Editor-in-Chief</i> AUSTIN BRAKEBILL	<i>Journal of Air Law & Commerce EDITOR-IN-CHIEF</i> ALEC SCHLINKERT
<i>SMU Law Review Managing Editor</i> KYLE MASON	<i>Texas Survey Associate Managing Editors</i> KLAYTON HILAND JAKE WINSLETT	<i>Journal of Air Law & Commerce Managing Editor</i> JEFFREY ALLCORN
<i>SMU Associate Managing Editors</i> RICHARD COCHRANE LARA KAKISH JUAN FELIPE VELASQUEZ	<i>Online Executive Editor</i> EMILY NASH	<i>JALC Associate Managing Editors</i> KATIE MANWORREN CAROLINE REED
<i>Lead Articles Editors</i> ALYSE CICIO BETHANY ECHOLS MACKENZIE FITZGERALD BRIAN LONG JONATHAN PETREE	<i>Administrative Managing Editor</i> MADELEINE GIESE	<i>Casenote & Comment Editors</i> TAMMIE BEASSIE BANKO BROOKE HAUGLID ALICIA PITTS LUKE STREIBER JENNIFER WILT
RACHEL ABOUKHAIR VICTORIA BAHRAMI CLAIRE BURDETTE DEVAN DAL COL TESS DENNIS	<i>Articles Editors</i> ROBIN FEATHERSTON JACKSON LONG MERRITT OWENS ADRIENNE ROBERTS CHANDLER ROGNES	EMILY SEMON DANIEL SEPULVEDA LAURA LINDSAY TATUM JOSEPH THELEN HUNTER WINSAUER
<i>Air Law Symposium Editor</i> TIMOTHY DOYLE	<i>Symposium CLE Editors</i> ELLEN HEIGHTEN AMY STEURER	<i>Corporate Counsel Symposium Editors</i> ANNA KATHERINE BONNET LAUREN MARKS
<i>Air Law Associate Symposium Editor</i> CHELSEA TILL		
<i>Journal of Air Law & Commerce Faculty Advisor</i> GREGORY S. CRESPI		<i>SMU Law Review Faculty Advisor</i> THOMAS WM. MAYO ANTHONY J. COLANGELO
<i>Journal of Air Law & Commerce Administrative Assistant</i> LISA BROWNING		<i>SMU Law Review Administrative Assistant</i> TALIBRA FERGUSON

MEMBER, NATIONAL CONFERENCE OF LAW REVIEWS

THE SMU LAW REVIEW ASSOCIATION PUBLISHES BOTH
THE SMU LAW REVIEW AND THE JOURNAL OF AIR LAW AND COMMERCE

SMU Law Review

VOLUME 71

SUMMER 2018

NUMBER 3

THE SMU LAW REVIEW ASSOCIATION 2017-2018 STAFF

RACHEL ABOUKHAIR
JEFFREY ALLCORN
MARIA G. ALONSO
VICTORIA S. BAHRAMI-NEGAD
ANNA KATHERINE BONNET
AUSTIN BRAKEBILL
CLAIRE BURDETTE
ALYSE CICIO
RICHARD COCHRANE
SALLY COOPER
DEVAN DAL COL
TIFFANY CRAWFORD
TESS DENNIS
TIM DOYLE
BETHANY ECHOLS
ROBIN FEATHERSTON
MACKENZIE FITZGERALD
KELSEY FLORES
MADELEINE GIESE
MATTHEW GROFMAN
BROOKE HAUGLID
ELLEN HEIGHTEN
KLAYTON HILAND

LARA KAKISH
JACKSON LONG
AJ LOZANO
LAUREN MARKS
KYLE MASON
TAYLOR MICHALS
LUKAS MOFFETT
MERRITT OWENS
JONATHAN PETREE
CAROLINE A. REED
KATIE ROBINSON MANWORREN
CHANDLER ROGNES
EMILY SEMON
DANIEL W. SEPULVEDA
AMY STEUER
LUKE STRIEBER
LAURA LINDSAY TATUM
JOSEPH THELEN
CHELSEA TILL
JENNIFER WILT
HUNTER WINSAUER
JAKE WINSLETT

SOUTHERN METHODIST UNIVERSITY DEDMAN SCHOOL OF LAW

OFFICERS OF THE UNIVERSITY

R. Gerald Turner, *President*
Steven C. Currall, *Provost and Vice President for Academic Affairs*
Harold W. Stanley, *Vice President for Executive Affairs*
Brad E. Cheves, *Vice President for Development and External Affairs*
Christine C. Regis, *Vice President for Business and Finance*
Paul J. Ward, *Vice President for Legal Affairs and Government Relations, General Counsel, and Secretary*
Kenechukwu (K.C.) Mmeje, *Vice President for Student Affairs*
Rakesh Dahiya, *Chief Investment Officer and University Treasurer*

DEDMAN SCHOOL OF LAW

FACULTY AND ADMINISTRATIVE STAFF

Jennifer Collins, B.A., J.D., *Judge James Noel Dean and Professor of Law*
Jeffrey M. Gaba, B.A., J.D., M.P.H., *Senior Associate Dean for Academic Affairs and M.D. Anderson Foundation Endowed Professor in Health Law*
Nathan Cortez, B.A., J.D., *Associate Dean for Research, Adelfa Botello Callejo Endowed Professor of Law in Leadership and Latino Studies, and Gerald J. Ford Resesarch Fellow*
Mary B. Spector, B.A., J.D., *Associate Dean for Clinics, Co-Director of the Civil Clinic, Director of Consumer Advocacy Project, and Professor of Law*
Greg Ivy, B.B.A., M.A., J.D., *Associate Dean for Library & Technology, Underwood Law Library*
Martin L. Camp, B.A., J.D., *Assistant Dean for Graduate and International Programs*
Becca Henley, B.A., J.D., *Assistant Dean for Administration*
Jill Nikirk, B.A., J.D., *Assistant Dean for Admissions*
Karen C. Sargent, B.B.A., J.D., *Assistant Dean and Executive Director for Career Services*
Stephen B. Yeager, B.B.A., J.D., *Assistant Dean for Student Affairs*
Anne G. Beard, *Director of Development*
Laura G. Burstein, B.A., J.D., *Director of Public Service and Director of Academic Success*
Lynn McVicker Dempsey, B.B.A., *Director of External Relations*
Erica Fadel, *Director of Career Services*
Natalie Thompson Greco, *Director of Programs and Operations, Tsai Center for Law, Science, and Innovation*
Kristy Offenburger, *Director of Communications and Marketing*
Michelle A. Ray, *Director of Admissions*
Rey Rodriguez, B.B.A., J.D., *Director of Career Services and Diversity and Inclusion Initiatives*
Abby N. Ruth, B.S., J.D., *Director of Alumni Relations*
Jerchel Anderson, E.M.B.A., *Director of Financial Services*
Laura Amberson, B.S., *Registrar*

FACULTY

Roy R. Anderson, B.A., J.D., LL.M., *Vinson & Elkins Distinguished Teaching Fellow and Professor of Law*
Hillel J. Bavli, B.A., J.D., LL.M., M.A., Ph.D., *Assistant Professor of Law*
Maureen N. Armour, B.A., M.S.W., J.D., *Professor Emeritus of Law*
Misty Birdsong, B.A., J.D., *Adjunct Professor of Legal Research, Writing, and Advocacy*
Lackland H. Bloom, Jr., B.A., J.D., *Larry and Jane Harlan Senior Research Fellow and Professor of Law*
William J. Bridge, B.S.F.S., J.D., *Professor Emeritus of Law*
Brook Busbee, B.A.S., J.D., *Adjunct Clinical Professor of Law, Criminal Justice Clinic*
Regis W. Campfield, B.B.A., LL.B., *Professor Emeritus of Law and Marilyn Jeanne Johnson Distinguished Law Faculty Fellow Emeritus*
Beverly M. Carl, B.S.L., J.D., LL.M., *Professor Emeritus of Law*
Dale Carpenter, B.A., J.D., *Judge William Hawley Atwell Chair of Constitutional Law and Professor of Law*

Michaela E. Cashen, B.A., J.D., *Clinical Professor of Legal Research, Writing and Advocacy*
Eric Cedillo, B.S., J.D., *Adjunct Clinical Professor of Law, Consumer Advocacy Project*
David J. Cho, B.A., J.D., *Adjunct Clinical Professor of Law, Trademark Clinic*
Anthony J. Colangelo, B.A., J.D., LL.M., J.S.D., *Gerald J. Ford Research Fellow and Professor of Law*
James W. Coleman, B.A., J.D., *Associate Professor of Law*
Jennifer Collins, B.A., J.D., *Judge James Noel Dean and Professor of Law*
Nathan Cortez, B.A., J.D., *Associate Dean for Research and Adelfa Botello Callejo Endowed Professor of Law in Leadership and Latino Studies*
Gregory S. Crespi, B.S., M.S., Ph.D., J.D., *Homer R. Mitchell Endowed Professor of Law in Commercial and Insurance Law, and Professor of Law*
Ruth A. Cross, B.A., J.D., *Director of Legal Research, Writing, and Advocacy Program and Senior Lecturer in Law*
Gail Daly, B.A., M.A., J.D., *Professor Emeritus of Law*
William V. Dorsaneo III, B.A., J.D., *Chief Justice John and Lena Hickman Distinguished Faculty Fellow and Professor of Law*
Beverly C. Duréus, B.A., J.D., Th.M., D. Min. *Clinical Professor of Legal Research, Writing, and Advocacy*
Linda S. Eads, B.A., J.D., *Professor Emeritus of Law*
Julia P. Forrester, B.S.E.E., J.D., *Associate Provost and Professor of Law*
Jeffrey M. Gaba, B.A., J.D., M.P.H., *Senior Associate Dean for Academic Affairs, M.D. Anderson Foundation Endowed Professor in Health Law, and Professor of Law*
Joanna L. Grossman, B.A., J.D., *Ellen K. Solender Endowed Chair in Women and the Law and Professor of Law*
Christopher H. Hanna, B.S., J.D., LL.M. (in Taxation), *Alan D. Feld Endowed Professor of Law, Altshuler University Distinguished Teaching Professor, and Professor of Law*
Grant M. Hayden, B.A., M.A., J.D., *Professor of Law*
Patricia S. Heard, B.A., J.D., *Clinical Professor of Legal Research, Writing and Advocacy*
JoAnn A. Hubbard, B.S., J.D., *Clinical Professor of Legal Research, Writing and Advocacy*
Marc Hubbard, B.S., J.D., *Adjunct Clinical Professor of Law, Patent Clinic*
Lolita Buckner Inniss, A.B., J.D., LL.M., Ph.D., *Professor of Law*
Greg Ivy, B.B.A., M.A., J.D., *Associate Dean for Library & Technology, Underwood Law Library and Senior Lecturer*
Christopher M. Jenks, B.S., J.D., LL.M., LL.M., Ph.D. Candidate, *Director of the Criminal Justice Clinic and Associate Professor of Law*
Larry Jones, B.B.A., J.D., LL.M., *Adjunct Clinical Professor of Law, Federal Tax Clinic*
Jeffrey Kahn, B.A., M.Phil., D.Phil., J.D., *Gerald J. Ford Research Fellow and Professor of Law*
Ndiva Kofele-Kale, B.A., M.A., J.D., Ph.D., *Professor Emeritus of Law*
Henry J. Lischer, Jr., B.B.A., J.D., LL.M. (in Taxation), *Professor Emeritus of Law*
John S. Lowe, B.A., LL.B., *George W. Hutchison Chair in Energy Law and Professor of Law*
George A. Martinez, B.A., M.A., J.D., *Professor of Law*
Thomas Wm. Mayo, B.A., J.D., *Altshuler University Distinguished Teaching Professor and Professor of Law*
Orly Sulami Mazur, B.B.A., M.P.A., J.D., LL.M. (Taxation), *Assistant Professor of Law*
Michael McCollum, LL.B., *Adjunct Clinical Professor of Law, Criminal Justice Clinic*
Pamela R. Metzger, B.A., J.D., *Director of the Deason Family Criminal Law Reform Center and Professor of Law*
Charles J. Morris, B.A., LL.B., *Professor Emeritus of Law*
Frederick C. Moss, A.B., J.D., LL.M., *Professor Emeritus of Law*
John J. Mylan, B.S., J.D., LL.M. (in Taxation), *Professor Emeritus of Law*
Natalie Nanasi, B.A., J.D., *Director of the Judge Elmo B. Hunter Legal Center for Victims of Crimes Against Women and Assistant Professor of Law*
Joseph Jude Norton, A.B., LL.B., LL.M., S.J.D., D.Phil., LLD, LLD, *James L. Walsh Distinguished Faculty Fellow and Professor in Financial Institutions Law*
Victoria Palacios, J.D., *Professor Emeritus of Law*

Kenneth L. Penegar, A.B., J.D., LL.M., *Professor Emeritus of Law*
Chante Prox, B.S., M.S.S.W., J.D., *Director of the VanSickle Family Law Clinic and Assistant Clinical Professor*
W. Keith Robinson, B.S., J.D., *Co-Director of the Tsai Center for Law, Science and Innovation and Associate Professor of Law*
C. Paul Rogers III, B.A., J.D., LL.M., *Marilyn Jeanne Johnson Distinguished Faculty Fellow, Professor of Law, and Former Dean*
Meghan Ryan, A.B., J.D., *Gerald J. Ford Research Fellow and Professor of Law*
Eliot Shavin, B.A., J.D., *Adjunct Clinical Professor of Law, Civil Clinic*
Mary B. Spector, B.A., J.D., *Associate Dean for Clinics, Director of the Civil Clinic, Director of Consumer Advocacy Project, and Professor of Law*
Walter W. Steele Jr., LL.B., *Professor Emeritus of Law*
Marc I. Steinberg, A.B., J.D., LL.M., *Rupert and Lillian Radford Chair in Law and Professor of Law*
Heather L. Stobaugh, B.A., M.A., J.D., *Clinical Professor of Legal Research, Writing and Advocacy*
Diane M. Sumoski, B.A., J.D., *Director of the W.W. Caruth, Jr. Child Advocacy Clinic, Director of the W.W. Caruth, Jr. Institute for Children's Rights, and Lecturer in Law*
Joshua C. Tate, B.A., M.A., M.Phil. J.D., Ph.D., *Professor of Law*
David O. Taylor, B.S., J.D., *Co-Director of the Tsai Center for Law, Science and Innovation and Associate Professor of Law*
Walther Theiss, A.B., M.B.A., J.D., *Adjunct Clinical Professor of Law, Small Business Clinic*
Elizabeth G. Thornburg, B.A., J.D., *Richard R. Lee Endowed Professor, Altshuler University Distinguished Teaching Professor, and Professor of Law*
Jenia Iontcheva Turner, B.A., J.D., *Amy Abboud Ware Centennial Professor in Criminal Law*
Jonni Walls, B.A., J.D., *Clinical Professor of Legal Research, Writing and Advocacy*
Jessica Dixon Weaver, B.A., J.D., *Associate Professor of Law*
Harvey Wingo, B.A., M.A., J.D., *Vinson & Elkins Distinguished Teaching Fellow Emeritus and Professor Emeritus of Law*
Peter Winship, B.A., LL.B., LL.M., J.S.D. *James Cleo Thompson, Sr., Law School Endowed Professor and Professor of Law*

ADVISORY BOARD

Harvie Branscomb, Jr.
Branscomb P.C.
Corpus Christi, Texas

Deborah G. Hankinson
Hankinson Levinger LLP
Dallas, Texas

The Honorable Nathan L. Hecht
Supreme Court of Texas
Austin, Texas

Gregory S. Crespi
Professor of Law
Southern Methodist University
Dedman School of Law

The Honorable Patrick E. Higginbotham
United States Court of Appeals
Fifth Judicial Circuit

Craig T. Enoch
Winstead P.C.
Austin, Texas

Thomas Wm. Mayo
Associate Professor of Law
Southern Methodist University
Dedman School of Law

Ernest E. Figari, Jr.
Figari & Davenport
Dallas, Texas

R. Gerald Turner
President
Southern Methodist University