SMU Law Review

VOLUME 71  SUMMER 2018  NUMBER 3

© 2018 by Southern Methodist University

SMU Law Review
Texas Gulf Sulphur
50th Anniversary Symposium Issue

Table of Contents

Articles

Texas Gulf Sulphur at Fifty—A Contemporary and Historical Perspective .... Marc I. Steinberg 625

Equal Access to Information: The Fraud at the Heart of Texas Gulf Sulphur .... Stephen M. Bainbridge 643

From TGS Conservatorships to Sarbanes–Oxley Fair Funds ............... Richard M. Buxbaum 653

Texas Gulf Sulphur: A Case Study on Responding to Market Rumors .......... Wendy G. Couture 675

Seeking an Objective for Regulating Insider Trading Through Texas Gulf Sulphur ........ James D. Cox 697

Texas Gulf Sulphur and Information Disclosure Policy ................ Onnig H. Dombalagian 713

From Equality to Duty: On Altering the Reach, Impact, and Meaning of the Texas Gulf Legacy ......................... Lisa M. Fairfax 729

Constructive Ambiguity and Judicial Development of Insider Trading ........... Jill E. Fisch 749

Personal Benefit Has No Place in Misappropriation Tipping Cases ............ Merritt B. Fox & George N. Tepe 767

Insider Trading .................................. Tamar Frankel 783
Will Fifty Years of the SEC's Disgorgement Remedy Be Abolished? ....... *Roberta S. Karmel* 799

From *Texas Gulf Sulphur* to *Laudato Si’*: Mining Equitable Principles from Insider Trading Law ..................... *Michael J. Kaufman* 811

From *Texas Gulf Sulphur* to *Chiarella*: A Tale of Two Duties ............... *Donald C. Langevoort* 835

Thinking Fast and Slow About the Concept of Materiality .................. *Mark J. Loewenstein* 853

*Martoma* and *Newman*: Valid Corporate Purpose and the Personal Benefit Test ....... *Jonathan Macey* 869

Taming Rule 10b-5-1: The Unfinished Business of *Texas Gulf Sulphur* .......... *Daniel J. Morrissey* 883

The Statutory Authority for Court-Ordered Disgorgement in SEC Enforcement Actions .. *Donna M. Nagy* 895

*Texas Gulf Sulphur* and the Genesis of Corporate Liability Under Rule 10b-5 ..... *Adam C. Pritchard* & *Robert B. Thompson* 927

Unintended Consequences: The Link Between Judge Friendly’s *Texas Gulf Sulphur* Concurrence and Recent Supreme Court Decisions Misconstruing Rule 10b-5 ............ *Margaret V. Sachs* 947

The Coasian Firm and Insider Trading, Revisited .................. *James C. Spindler* 967

A Birthday Toast to *Texas Gulf Sulphur* .................. *Manning G. Warren III* 987

The *SMU Law Review* (ISSN 1066-1271) is published four times a year, (1) Winter, (2) Spring, (3) Summer, and (4) Fall, by the SMU Law Review Association, Storey Hall, Dallas, Texas 75275. Domestic subscription price, $42.00 per year. Foreign subscription price, $49.00 per year. Single copies: Regular issues, $18.00 (add 8.25% tax on single issue orders within the state of Texas. Tax exempt institutions must include copy of exemption certificate with order.) An additional charge will be made for postage and handling of each order of single copies. Prior issues, volumes 1-69, are available from: William S. Hein & Co.; 2350 North Forest Road; Getzville, NY 14068. Volumes 70-71 are available from: *SMU Law Review*; Southern Methodist University; Dedman School of Law; P.O. Box 750116; Dallas, TX 75275-0116.

**POSTMASTER:** Send address changes to: *SMU Law Review*; Southern Methodist University; Dedman School of Law; P.O. Box 750116; Dallas, TX 75275-0116.

Editorial and business offices: *SMU Law Review*; Southern Methodist University; Dedman School of Law; P.O. Box 750116; Dallas, TX 75275-0116. Office: 214.768.2061 or 214.768.2570. Printed by Joe Christensen, Inc.; Lincoln, Nebraska 68521.

Periodicals postage paid at Dallas, Texas and at additional mailing offices.

Citations conform with *The Bluebook: A Uniform System of Citation* (20th ed. 2015) and *Texas Rules of Form* (14th ed. 2018), and *MoUS* (14th ed. 2018).
THE SMU LAW REVIEW ASSOCIATION
2018–2019 BOARD OF EDITORS

President
STACY REEVES GULLEDGE

SMU Law Review
Editor-in-Chief
KELSEY FLORES
SMU Law Review
Managing Editor
KYLE MASON
SMU Associate Managing Editors
RICHARD COCHRANE
LARA KAKISH
JUAN FELIPE VELASQUEZ
Lead Articles Editors
ALYSE CICIO
BETHANY ECHOLS
MACKENZIE FITZGERALD
BRIAN LONG
JONATHAN PETREE
RACHEL ABOUKHAIR
VICTORIA BAHRAMI
CLAIRE BURDETT
DEVAN DAL COL
TESS DENNIS
Air Law Symposium Editor
TIMOTHY DOYLE
Air Law
Associate Symposium Editor
CHELSEA TILL

Journal of Air Law & Commerce
Editor-in-Chief
ALEC SCHLINKERT
Journal of Air Law & Commerce
Managing Editor
JEFFREY ALLCORN

Articles Editors
MADELEINE GIESE
TAMMIE BEASSIE BANKO
ALYSE CICIO
BROOKE HAUGLID
BETHANY ECHOLS
LUKE STREIBER
Air Law Symposium Editor
SYMPHONY CLE EDITORS
ELLEN HEIGHTEN
JONATHAN PETREE

Projects Editors
ANNA KATHERINE BONNET

Corporate Counsel

Symposium Editors

EMILY SEMON
DANIEL SEPULVEDA
LAURA LINDSAY TATUM
JOSEPH THELEN
HUNTER WINSAUER

SMU Law Review
Faculty Advisor
THOMAS WM. MAYO

Journal of Air Law & Commerce
Administrative Assistant
LISA BROWNING

THE SMU LAW REVIEW ASSOCIATION Publishes both
THE SMU LAW REVIEW AND THE JOURNAL OF AIR LAW AND COMMERCE

Member, National Conference of Law Reviews
THE SMU LAW REVIEW ASSOCIATION
2017–2018 STAFF

Rachel Aboukhair
Jeffrey Alcorn
Maria G. Alonso
Victoria S. Bahrami-Negad
Anna Katherine Bonnet
Austin Brakebill
Claire Burdette
Alyse Cicio
Richard Cochrane
Sally Cooper
Devan Dal Col
Tiffany Crawford
Tess Dennis
Tim Doyle
Bethany Echols
Robin Featherston
Mackenzie Fitzgerald
Kelsey Flores
Madeleine Giese
Matthew Grofman
Brooke Hauglid
Ellen Heighten
Klayton Hiland

Lara Kakish
Jackson Long
AJ Lozano
Lauren Marks
Kyle Mason
Taylor Michals
Lukas Moffett
Merritt Owens
Jonathan Petree
Caroline A. Reed
Katie Robinson Manworren
Chandler Rognes
Emily Semon
Daniel W. Sepulveda
Amy Steuer
Luke Strieber
Laura Lindsay Tatum
Joseph Theilen
Chelsea Till
Jennifer Wilt
Hunter Winsauer
Jake Winslett
SOUTHERN METHODIST UNIVERSITY DEDMAN
SCHOOL OF LAW

OFFICERS OF THE UNIVERSITY
R. Gerald Turner, President
Steven C. Currall, Provost and Vice President for Academic Affairs
Harold W. Stanley, Vice President for Executive Affairs
Brad E. Cheves, Vice President for Development and External Affairs
Christine C. Regis, Vice President for Business and Finance
Paul J. Ward, Vice President for Legal Affairs and Government Relations, General Counsel, and Secretary
Kenechukwu (K.C.) Mmeje, Vice President for Student Affairs
Rakesh Dahiya, Chief Investment Officer and University Treasurer

DEDMAN SCHOOL OF LAW
FACULTY AND ADMINISTRATIVE STAFF
Jennifer Collins, B.A., J.D. Judge James Noel Dean and Professor of Law
Jeffrey M. Gaba, B.A., J.D., M.P.H., Senior Associate Dean for Academic Affairs and M.D. Anderson Foundation Endowed Professor in Health Law
Nathan Cortez, B.A., J.D., Associate Dean for Research, Adelfa Botello Callejo Endowed Professor of Law in Leadership and Latino Studies, and Gerald J. Ford Research Fellow
Mary B. Spector, B.A., J.D., Associate Dean for Clinics, Co-Director of the Civil Clinic, Director of Consumer Advocacy Project, and Professor of Law
Greg Ivy, B.B.A., M.A., J.D., Associate Dean for Library & Technology, Underwood Law Library
Martin L. Camp, B.A., J.D., Assistant Dean for Graduate and International Programs
Becca Henley, B.A., J.D., Assistant Dean for Administration
Jill Nikirk, B.A., J.D., Assistant Dean for Admissions
Karen C. Sargent, B.B.A., J.D., Assistant Dean and Executive Director for Career Services
Stephen B. Yeager, B.B.A., J.D., Assistant Dean for Student Affairs
Anne G. Beard, Director of Development
Laura G. Burstein, B.A., J.D., Director of Public Service and Director of Academic Success
Lynn McVicker Dempsey, B.B.A., Director of External Relations
Erica Fadel, Director of Career Services
Natalie Thompson Greco, Director of Programs and Operations, Tsai Center for Law, Science, and Innovation
Kristy Offenburger, Director of Communications and Marketing
Michelle A. Ray, Director of Admissions
Rey Rodriguez, B.B.A., J.D., Director of Career Services and Diversity and Inclusion Initiatives
Abby N. Ruth, B.S., J.D., Director of Alumni Relations
Jerchel Anderson, E.M.B.A., Director of Financial Services
Laura Amberson, B.S., Registrar

FACULTY
Roy R. Anderson, B.A., J.D., LL.M., Vinson & Elkins Distinguished Teaching Fellow and Professor of Law
Hillel J. Bavli, B.A., J.D., LL.M., M.A., Ph.D., Assistant Professor of Law
Maureen N. Armour, B.A., M.S.W., J.D., Professor Emeritus of Law
Misty Birdsong, B.A., J.D., Adjunct Professor of Legal Research, Writing, and Advocacy
Lackland H. Bloom, Jr., B.A., J.D., Larry and Jane Harlan Senior Research Fellow and Professor of Law
William J. Bridge, B.S.F.S., J.D., Professor Emeritus of Law
Brook Busbee, B.A.S., J.D., Adjunct Clinical Professor of Law, Criminal Justice Clinic
Regis W. Campfield, B.B.A., LL.B., Professor Emeritus of Law and Marilyn Jeanne Johnson Distinguished Law Faculty Fellow Emeritus
Beverly M. Carl, B.S.L., J.D., LL.M., Professor Emeritus of Law
Dale Carpenter, B.A., J.D., Judge William Hawley Atwell Chair of Constitutional Law and Professor of Law
ADVISORY BOARD

Harvie Branscomb, Jr.            Deborah G. Hankinson
Branscomb P.C.                  Hankinson Levinger LLP
Corpus Christi, Texas           Dallas, Texas

The Honorable Nathan L. Hecht   Gregory S. Crespi
Supreme Court of Texas          Professor of Law
Austin, Texas                   Southern Methodist University

The Honorable Patrick E. Higginbotham   Craig T. Enoch
United States Court of Appeals    Winstead P.C.
Fifth Judicial Circuit            Austin, Texas

Thomas Wm. Mayo                  Ernest E. Figari, Jr.
Associate Professor of Law       Figari & Davenport
Southern Methodist University    Dallas, Texas
Dedman School of Law

R. Gerald Turner
President
Southern Methodist University