

---

Winter 2024

## Front Matter

---

### Recommended Citation

*Front Matter*, 77 SMU L. REV. vi (2024)

This Front Matter is brought to you for free and open access by the Law Journals at SMU Scholar. It has been accepted for inclusion in SMU Law Review by an authorized administrator of SMU Scholar. For more information, please visit <http://digitalrepository.smu.edu>.

# SMU Law Review

---

---

VOLUME 77

WINTER 2024

NUMBER 1

---

---

© 2024 by Southern Methodist University

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

### PREFACE

Preface: An Homage . . . . .	<i>Elan Wilson</i>	3
------------------------------	--------------------	---

### ARTICLES

The Post-Racial Deception of the Roberts Court . . . . .	<i>Cedric Merlin Powell</i>	7
Roberts Rules of (Dis)Order: Doctrinal Doublespeak on Affirmative Action and Stare Decisis . . . . .	<i>Vinay Harpalani</i>	61
<i>Students for Fair Admissions</i> Through the Lens of Interest-Convergence Theory: Reality, Perception, and Fear . . . . .	<i>Robert A. Garda, Jr.</i>	93
Data's Demise and the Rhetoric of <i>SFFA</i> . . . . .	<i>Shakira D. Pleasant</i>	161
<i>Students for Fair Admissions v.</i> Universities for Division, Exclusion, and Inequity: The Petitions, the Arguments, and the Decision . . . . .	<i>Josh Blackman</i>	187
Individual Dignity as the Foundation of an Inclusive Society . . . . .	<i>Cory R. Liu and Anthony Pericolo</i>	219
Racial Classifications in Higher Education Admissions Before and After <i>SFFA</i> . . . . .	<i>David E. Bernstein</i>	263
Race Preferences, Diversity, and <i>Students for Fair</i> <i>Admissions</i> : A New Day, A New Clarity . . . . .	<i>Maimon Schwarzschild and Gail Heriot</i>	285
Reversing <i>Grutter</i> . . . . .	<i>Lackland H. Bloom, Jr.</i>	305

---

The *SMU Law Review* (ISSN 1066-1271) is published four times a year, (1) Winter, (2) Spring, (3) Summer, and (4) Fall, by the SMU Law Review Association, Underwood Law Library, Dallas, Texas 75205. Domestic subscription price, \$42.00 per year. Foreign subscription price, \$49.00 per year. Single copies: Regular issues, \$18.00 (add 8.25% tax on single issue orders within the state of Texas. Tax exempt institutions must include copy of exemption certificate with order.) An additional charge will be made for postage and handling of each order of single copies. Prior issues (volumes 1-72) are available from: William S. Hein & Co.; 2350 North Forest Road; Getzville, NY 14068. Volumes 73-74 are available from: *SMU Law Review*; Southern Methodist University; Dedman School of Law; P.O. Box 750116; Dallas, TX 75275-0116.

**POSTMASTER:** Send address changes to: *SMU Law Review*; Southern Methodist University; Dedman School of Law; P.O. Box 750116; Dallas, TX 75275-0116.

Editorial and business offices: *SMU Law Review*; Southern Methodist University; Dedman School of Law; Underwood Law Library; 6550 Hillcrest Avenue, Suite 105; Dallas, TX 75205. Office: 214.768.2061 or 214.768.2570. Printed by Sheridan PA, a CJK Group Company, Hanover, Pennsylvania.

Periodicals postage paid at Dallas, Texas and at additional mailing offices.

Citations conform with The Bluebook: *A Uniform System of Citation* (21st ed. 2020), Texas Rules of Form (14th ed. 2018), and MoUS (14th ed. 2018).

# SMU Law Review

---

---

VOLUME 77

WINTER 2024

NUMBER 1

---

---

## THE SMU LAW REVIEW ASSOCIATION 2023–2024 BOARD OF EDITORS

### *President*

ELLIE JOHNSON

*SMU Law Review  
Editor-in-Chief*  
ELAN WILSON

*Texas Survey  
Editor-in-Chief*  
SYDNEY HARPER

*Journal of Air Law & Commerce  
Editor-in-Chief*  
BRYCE PILAWSKI

*SMU Law Review  
Managing Editor*  
COLIN HICKL

*Texas Survey  
Associate Managing Editors*  
ZACHARY TIRITILLI  
TYLER LAPORTE

*Journal of Air Law & Commerce  
Managing Editor*  
GRACE WOOTEN

*SMU Law Review  
Associate Managing Editors*  
MACKENZIE ARNOLD  
HANNAH FOOTE  
MATTHEW MUSSALLI

*Forum Executive Editor*  
RACHEL BRACHMAN  
  
*Forum Associate  
Managing Editor*  
RILEY GESLING

*Journal of Air Law & Commerce  
Associate Managing Editors*  
EMILY DAIGLE  
RACHEL GILLESPIE  
TERRENCE WICKS

*Lead Articles Editors*  
SOPHIE PRICE  
JACKSON OVERTON  
MIRANDA CASSIDY  
JACE BREEDLOVE  
LUKE NGUYEN

*Administrative  
Managing Editor*  
ELIZABETH KIRKLAND  
  
*Forum Assistant Executive Editor*  
DEBORAH MANSON

*Casenote & Comment Editors*  
CAROLINE R. ROBERTSON  
ZACHARY GRIGG  
EMMY EDWARDS  
JULIA TURNER  
SUZI GOEBEL  
EMAAN BANGASH

ALENA KHAN  
CHRISTOPHER VAN SLYKE  
DANIEL VARON  
EMIL MEINTJES  
JACOB DESELMS  
KARA ANDERSON  
SARAH LENGYEL  
TATUM HOLDAWAY

*Articles Editors*  
ANDREW PRICE  
COLE WEISS  
DARREN CHEN  
EMMA RILEY  
JILIAN DOUGHTY  
MEGAN THOMAS  
SHAHIN ZANGENEH  
VICTORIA GREGORY

BAILEY HOOKER  
COREY RACKLER  
DREW RAYMOND  
JACE ZETT  
JULIAN KHAIRA  
NATALIE DARGENE  
SPENCER CHAIKEN  
ZACHARY ANDERSON

*Corporate Counsel  
Symposium Editors*  
SERENE ZIDAN  
OLIVIA MAE VRIELINK

*Symposia CLE Editor*  
GRAYSON FELNER

*Air Law Symposium Editors*  
SAMUEL ROSENBLOOM  
OLIVIA CAHILL  
ALTAF SAMNANI

*SMU Law Review  
Faculty Advisor*  
THOMAS WM. MAYO  
ANTHONY J. COLANGELO

*Administrative Assistant*  
TALIBRA FERGUSON  
  
*Coordinator*  
LISA PONCE

*Journal of Air Law and Commerce  
Faculty Advisor*  
GREGORY S. CRESPI

---

---

MEMBER, NATIONAL CONFERENCE OF LAW REVIEWS

---

---

THE SMU LAW REVIEW ASSOCIATION PUBLISHES THE SMU LAW REVIEW, THE JOURNAL OF AIR LAW AND COMMERCE, AND THE SMU ANNUAL TEXAS SURVEY

# SMU Law Review

---

VOLUME 77

WINTER 2024

NUMBER 1

---

## THE SMU LAW REVIEW ASSOCIATION 2023–2024 STAFF EDITORS

NOOR AIN  
MATTHEW BEHAN  
CAMERON BONK  
WILLIAM CAGNINA  
MATTHEW CARDONE  
DAVID CARL  
COLE CONNOR  
ABIGAIL CRAVENS  
HOPE DAWSON  
BRIDGETTE DWYER  
MADISON GEIGER  
MADELYN GERRALD  
REESE GLUSING  
MADISON HUCKABY  
JENNY HULSE  
ALEX JACOVETTY  
AYESHA JAIN  
HARRISON JENKINS  
ABBIE JENNINGS  
KACI KATUSAK  
CAMERON KING  
BRADLEY KUCERA  
RACHEL KUP  
MORGAN LAING  
DAVID LANFORD  
BROOKE SUTTER  
KELLIE MAGUINNESS  
ELENA MAK

JACLYN MARSH  
CRISTINA MAULDIN  
LAUREL McCABE  
MORGAN MCGREGOR  
ZACHARY MILLER  
IBRAHIM NASIR  
CHIARA NATALE  
TAREK NATSHEH  
CLAIRE NAYLOR  
MADELEINE NELSON  
EVAN OSCHERWITZ  
JOHANNA PANG  
BARCLAY PROCTOR  
RYAN PUENTE  
ROM REIDERMAN  
BEN SAMWAY  
MICHAEL SANDERS  
MASON SARVER  
LINDSEY SHAW  
JILLIAN SMOORENBURG  
SIERRA STONE  
LAWSON SUMLER  
ANDREA VILLALPANDO  
JONATHAN VIVAT  
EASTON WILSON  
RINA WONG  
ARIANA WU

## SOUTHERN METHODIST UNIVERSITY DEDMAN SCHOOL OF LAW

### OFFICERS OF THE UNIVERSITY

R. Gerald Turner, *President*  
Elizabeth Lobo, *Provost and Vice President for Academic Affairs*  
Brad E. Cheves, *Vice President for Development and External Affairs*  
Christine C. Regis, *Vice President and Treasurer, Business and Finance*  
Harold W. Stanley, *Vice President for Executive Affairs*  
Paul J. Ward, *Vice President for Legal Affairs and Government Relations, General Counsel, and Secretary to the Board of Trustees*  
Kenekchukwu (K.C.) Mmeje, *Vice President for Student Affairs*  
Dr. Maria Dixon Hall, *Chief Diversity Officer and Senior Advisor to the President for Cultural Intelligence*  
Michael H. Hites, *Chief Information Officer*  
Rakesh Dahiya, *Chief Investment Officer*  
Rick Hart, *Director for Athletics*  
Chandra McQueen, *Director of Internal Audit and Consulting Services*  
Samantha Thomas, *Executive Director for Institutional Access and Equity, Executive Assistant to the President*

### DEDMAN SCHOOL OF LAW ADMINISTRATIVE STAFF AND FACULTY

Jason P. Nance, B.A., Ph.D., J.D., *Judge James Noel Dean, and Professor of Law*  
Thomas Wm. Mayo, B.A., J.D., *Senior Associate Dean for Academic Affairs, Altshuler Distinguished Teaching Professor, and Professor of Law*  
Greg Ivy, B.B.A., M.A., J.D., *Associate Dean for Library & Technology, Underwood Law Library, and Senior Lecturer*  
Jessica Dixon Weaver, B.A., J.D., *Associate Dean for Research, and Professor of Law*  
Mary B. Spector, B.A., J.D., *Associate Dean for Experiential Learning, Director of the Civil/Consumer Clinic, and Professor of Law*  
Martin L. Camp, B.A., J.D., *Assistant Dean for Graduate and International Programs and Professor of Practice*  
Christine Leatherberry, B.J., J.D., *Assistant Dean for Administration and Chief of Staff*  
Erika Fadel, B.A., M.Div., J.D., *Assistant Dean for Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion*  
Jill Nikirk, B.A., J.D., *Assistant Dean for Admissions*  
Marcie Davis, B.A., J.D., *Assistant Dean and Executive Director for Career Services*  
Stephen B. Yeager, B.B.A., J.D., *Assistant Dean for Student Affairs*  
Misty Birdsong, B.A., J.D., *Director of Academic Success and Clinical Professor of Legal Research, Writing, and Advocacy*  
Chanté Brantley, B.S., M.S.S.W., J.D., *Director of the VanSickle Family Law Clinic and Associate Clinical Professor*  
Laura G. Burstein, B.A., J.D., *Director of Public Service*  
Ruth A. Cross, B.A., J.D., *Director and Clinical Professor of Legal Research, Writing, and Advocacy*  
Lynn McVicker Dempsey, B.B.A., *Director of External Relations*  
Ashley Ellis, B.A., J.D., *Director of Alumni Relations*  
Clayton Ellis, B.A., *Director of Development*  
Natalie Thompson Greco, *Director of Programs and Operations, Tsai Center for Law, Science, and Innovation*  
Robert B. (Bob) Weathersby, Esq., B.S., J.D., *Director Large Firms and Local Government – Office of Career Services*  
Beth D. Lee, B.B.A., *Director, Corporate and Private Sector Development – Office of Career Services*  
Smitha Mathews, B.S., J.D., *Director Mid-size, Small and Boutique Firms – Office of Career Services*  
Mary Beth Nielsen, B.A., M.A., *Director Judicial Internships, Externships and Post-Graduate Clerkships – Office of Career Services*  
Diane M. Sumoski, B.A., J.D., *Director of the W.W. Caruth, Jr. Child Advocacy Clinic, Director of the W.W. Caruth, Jr. Institute for Children's Rights, and Clinical Professor of Law*  
Cassie Walker, M.L.I.S., J.D., *Director of Advocacy Programs and Assistant Director for Scholarly Initiatives*

Kandace Walter, B.S., J.D., *Director and Associate Clinical Professor of Law, Small Business and Trademark Clinic*  
Moira Cary, B.A., *Associate Director of Recruiting and Events – Office of Career Services*  
Courtney Cowan, B.B.A., J.D., *Associate Director of Admissions*  
Tom Kimbrough, M.L.I.S., J.D., *Associate Director for Collection Development – Underwood Law Library*  
Donna Wolff, M.L.S., J.D., *Associate Director – Underwood Law Library*  
Bobbie Heine, *Assistant Director for Graduate Legal Programs*  
Laura Amberson, B.S., *Registrar*  
Melissa Lara, B.B.A., *Financial Business Manager*

#### FACULTY

Roy R. Anderson, B.A., J.D., LL.M., A.M., *Professor Emeritus of Law*  
Maureen N. Armour, B.A., M.S.W., J.D., *Professor Emeritus of Law*  
Hillel J. Bavli, B.A., J.D., LL.M., A.M., Ph.D., *Associate Professor of Law*  
Lackland H. Bloom, Jr., B.A., J.D., *Professor Emeritus of Law*  
William J. Bridge, B.S.F.S., J.D., *Professor Emeritus of Law*  
Dale Carpenter, B.A., J.D., *Judge William Hawley Atwell Chair of Constitutional Law and Professor of Law*  
Carliss Chatman, B.A., J.D., *Associate Professor of Law*  
Anthony J. Colangelo, B.A., J.D., LL.M., J.S.D., *Robert G. Storey Distinguished Faculty Fellow and Professor of Law*  
James W. Coleman, B.A., J.D., *Professor of Law*  
Nathan Cortez, B.A., J.D., *Adelfa Botello Callejo Endowed Professor of Law in Leadership and Latino Studies, and Gerald J. Ford Research Fellow*  
Gregory S. Crespi, B.S., M.S., Ph.D., J.D., *Homer R. Mitchell Endowed Professorship in Commercial and Insurance Law, and Professor of Law*  
Gail Daly, B.A., M.A., J.D., *Professor Emeritus of Law*  
William V. Dorsaneo III, B.A., J.D., *Professor Emeritus of Law*  
Beverly C. Duréus, B.A., J.D., Th.M., D. Min., *Clinical Professor of Legal Research, Writing, and Advocacy*  
Linda S. Eads, B.A., J.D., *Professor Emeritus of Law*  
Monika Ehrman, B.Sc., J.D., LL.M., *Professor of Law*  
Jeffrey M. Gaba, B.A., J.D., M.P.H., *Professor Emeritus of Law*  
Joanna L. Grossman, B.A., J.D., *Ellen K. Solender Endowed Chair in Women and the Law and Professor of Law*  
Christopher H. Hanna, B.S., J.D., LL.M. (in Taxation), *Alan D. Feld Endowed Professor of Law, Altshuler University Distinguished Teaching Professor, and Professor of Law*  
Grant M. Hayden, B.A., M.A., J.D., *Professor of Law*  
Patricia S. Heard, B.A., J.D., *Clinical Professor of Legal Research, Writing and Advocacy*  
Christine Hurt, B.A., J.D., *Alan R. Bromberg Centennial Chair in Corporate, Partnership, Business, and Securities Law and Professor of Law*  
Christopher M. Jenks, B.S., J.D., LL.M., LL.M., Ph.D. Candidate, *Director of the Criminal Clinic and Professor of Law*  
Jeffrey Kahn, B.A., M.Phil., D.Phil., J.D., *University Distinguished Professor, Altshuler Distinguished Teaching Professor, and Professor of Law*  
Ndiva Kofele-Kale, B.A., M.A., J.D., Ph.D., *Professor Emeritus of Law*  
Henry J. Lischer, Jr., B.B.A., J.D., LL.M. (in Taxation), *Professor Emeritus of Law*  
John S. Lowe, B.A., LL.B., *Professor Emeritus of Law*  
Anna A. Mance, B.A., M.S.-MDP, J.D., *Assistant Professor of Law*  
George A. Martinez, B.A., M.A., J.D., *Professor of Law*  
Orly Sulami Mazur, B.B.A., M.P.A., J.D., LL.M. (in Taxation), *Associate Professor of Law*  
Sari Mazzurco, B.A., J.D., Ph.D., *Assistant Professor of Law*  
Pamela R. Metzger, B.A., J.D., *Director of the Deason Criminal Justice Reform Center and Professor of Law*  
Charles J. Morris, B.A., LL.B., *Professor Emeritus of Law*  
Frederick C. Moss, A.B., J.D., LL.M., *Professor Emeritus of Law*  
Natalie Nanasi, B.A., J.D., *Director of the Judge Elmo B. Hunter Legal Center for Victims of Crimes Against Women and Associate Professor of Law*  
Joseph J. Norton, A.B., LL.B., LL.M., S.J.D., D.Phil., LL.D., LL.D., *Professor Emeritus of Law*  
Anna Offit, A.B., M.Phil., J.D., Ph.D., *Assistant Professor of Law*  
Victoria Palacios, J.D., *Professor Emeritus of Law*  
Kenneth L. Penegar, A.B., J.D., LL.M., *Professor Emeritus of Law*  
Carla L. Reyes, B.A., J.D., LL.M., M.P.P., *Associate Professor of Law*

C. Paul Rogers III, B.A., J.D., LL.M., *Marilyn Jeanne Johnson Distinguished Faculty Fellow, Professor of Law, and Former Dean*  
Julia P. Rogers, B.S.E.E., J.D., *Professor of Law*  
Eric M. Ruben, B.A., J.D., *Associate Professor of Law*  
Meghan Ryan, A.B., J.D., *Co-Director of the Tsai Center for Law, Science and Innovation, Altshuler Distinguished Teaching Professor, and Professor of Law*  
Christina Sautter, B.A., J.D., *Professor of Law*  
Jennifer Rangel Stagen, B.A., J.D., *Clinical Professor of Legal Research, Writing and Advocacy*  
Walter W. Steele Jr., LL.B., *Professor Emeritus of Law*  
Marc I. Steinberg, A.B., J.D., LL.M., *Rupert and Lillian Radford Chair in Law and Professor of Law*  
Heather L. Stobaugh, B.A., M.A., J.D., *Clinical Professor of Legal Research, Writing and Advocacy*  
Joshua C. Tate, B.A., M.Phil. J.D., Ph.D., *Professor of Law*  
David O. Taylor, B.S., J.D., *Robert G. Storey Distinguished Faculty Fellow, Co-Director of the Tsai Center for Law, Science and Innovation, and Professor of Law*  
Elizabeth Lee Thompson, B.A., J.D., M.A., Ph.D., *Clinical Assistant Professor of Legal Research, Writing and Advocacy*  
Elizabeth G. Thornburg, B.A., J.D., *Professor Emeritus of Law*  
Jenia Iontcheva Turner, B.A., J.D., *Amy Abboud Ware Centennial Professor in Criminal Law*  
Harvey Wingo, B.A., M.A., J.D., *Vinson & Elkins Distinguished Teaching Fellow Emeritus and Professor Emeritus of Law*  
Peter Winship, B.A., LL.B., LL.M., J.S.D. *Professor Emeritus of Law*  
Leo Yu, LL.B., LL.M., J.D., *Clinical Professor of Legal Research, Writing, and Advocacy*



## ADVISORY BOARD

Harvie Branscomb, Jr.  
Branscomb P.C.  
Corpus Christi, Texas

Deborah G. Hankinson  
Hankinson Levinger LLP  
Dallas, Texas

The Honorable Nathan L. Hecht  
Supreme Court of Texas  
Austin, Texas

Gregory S. Crespi  
Professor of Law  
Southern Methodist University  
Dedman School of Law

The Honorable Patrick E. Higginbotham  
United States Court of Appeals  
Fifth Judicial Circuit

Craig T. Enoch  
Winstead P.C.  
Austin, Texas

Thomas Wm. Mayo  
Associate Professor of Law  
Southern Methodist University  
Dedman School of Law

Ernest E. Figari, Jr.  
Figari & Davenport  
Dallas, Texas

R. Gerald Turner  
President  
Southern Methodist University