# SMU Law Review

**Volume 66**  
**Summer 2013**  
**Number 3**

© 2013 by Southern Methodist University

## Table of Contents

**Foreword** .......................................................... ix

**Articles**


*Percolation, Uniformity, and Coherent Adjudication: The Federal Circuit Experience* ....................... *Rochelle C. Dreyfuss* 505


*A Case Study of Federal Circuit Policy Making* ....................... *W. Keith Robinson* 579

*Further Reflections on Extinguishing the Fountainhead of Knowledge: A Call to Transition to the “Innovation Policy” Narrative in Patent Law* ...................... *Simone Rose* 609

The SMU Law Review (ISSN 1066-1271) is published four times a year, (1) Winter, (2) Spring, (3) Summer, and (4) Fall, by the SMU Law Review Association, Storey Hall, Dallas, Texas 75275. Domestic subscription price, $42.00 per year. Foreign subscription price, $49.00 per year. Single copies: Regular issues, $18.00, Survey issue, $24.00. Add 8.25% tax on single issue orders within the state of Texas. Tax exempt institutions must include copy of exemption certificate with order. An additional charge will be made for postage and handling of each order of single copies. Prior issues (vols. 1-60) available from William S. Hein & Co., 1285 Main St., Buffalo, New York 14209. Volumes 61-64 are available from SMU Law Review, Southern Methodist University Dedman School of Law, Dallas, Texas 75275. POSTMASTER: Send address changes to SMU Law Review, Dedman School of Law, Southern Methodist University, Dallas, Texas 75275.


Periodicals postage paid at Dallas, Texas, and at additional mailing offices.

Citations conform with The Bluebook: A Uniform System of Citation (19th ed. 2010) and the Texas Rules of Form (12th ed. 2010).
SMU Law Review

Volume 66  Summer 2013  Number 3

Member, National Conference of Law Reviews

SMU Law Review Association
2013–2014 Board of Editors

President
Heather Coghlan

SMU Law Review Editor-in-Chief
Lance Wyatt

SMU Law Review Managing Editor
Phong Tran

Journal of Air Law & Commerce Editor-in-Chief
Jacqui Bogucki

SMU Law Review Journal of Air Law & Commerce Managing Editor
Laura Arbeiter

SMU Associate Managing Editors
Ashton Barrineau
Lindsey Hovland

Lauren Christy
Chelsea Clark
Ryan Frye Blair Green
Sarah Honeycutt

Lead Articles Editors
Nathan Lee
Rouzna Nayeri
Phillip Sanders

Articles Editors
Zunny Losoya
Bryan Parrish
Samuel Pinkston
Baine Sellers
Ross Staine

Managing Editors
Clarke Stavinaoha
Mark Steadman
Nathan Thompson
Jerry Tice

Texas Survey Editor
Brandon Bello

SMU Comment Editors
Renee Hunter
Nicolas Low
Cynthia Weber

Associate Texas Survey Editors
James Bedotto
Katie Cristina

JALC Associate Managing Editors
Elizabeth Griffin
Matthew Moran

JALC Comment Editors
Clarke Stavinaoha
Mark Steadman
Nathan Thompson
Jerry Tice

Corporate Counsel Symposium Editors
Jessica Greenwald
Brooke Panno
Kyle Park

JALC Comment Editors
Blake Feikema
Michelle Northcutt

JALC Comment Editors
Kimberly Falgout

Air Law Symposium Editor
Jason Glennon

Symposium CLE Editors
Jun Li
Joshua Tyler Shelton

Executive Editor
Christina Gigliotti

SMU Faculty Advisors
Thomas WM. Mayo
Anthony J. Colangelo

JALC Faculty Advisor
Gregory S. Crespi

SMU Administrative Assistant
Donnaise Baldwin

JALC Administrative Assistant
Lisa Browning

The SMU Law Review Association publishes both
the SMU Law Review and the Journal of Air Law and Commerce.
THE SMU LAW REVIEW ASSOCIATION
2013-2014 STAFF EDITORS

JOHN ADAMS
ANNA BOOTH
AARON CHIBLI
CC COPELAND
NHI DINH
KELLI GAVIN
SETH JASKOVIAK
CLINTON KUYKENDALL
EMILY LEEZER
NEAL LOBER
JOHN MCGREGOR
ANDRIA RAE MINYARD
JESSICA PHILLIPS
AMY RAUCH
JENNIFER SMILEY
PETER THOMPSON
KYLE ZUNKER

JOHN P. ATKINS
SAMUEL BRAGG
ALLISON CHILDS
CODY CRAVENS
ERIK FOUNTAIN
NICOLE HAGET
FAHAD JUNEJA
MEAGAN LANIER
EMILY LEHMBERG
JAMES M. LUCAS
HEATHER MCKINNEY
JOSHUA PELFREY
ALEX POOR
CHEYENNE ROGERS
CASSIE SUTTLE
J. BRYAN WHITE

JILLIAN BEYTHAN
AMANDA BRETT
BRYAN CLEGG
ASHLEY DEWEES
FARSHEED FOZOUNI
ERIC HEDLUND
CHRISTOPHER KNIGHT
SCOTT R. LARSO
ROBERT J. LEVINSKI
HUY LY
BRYAN MCKOWN
CATHERINE PETERMAN
SETH RASMUSSEN
MICHAEL SHEETZ
KELSEY TAYLOR
ALLYSON YATES
SOUTHERN METHODIST UNIVERSITY DEDMAN
SCHOOL OF LAW

OFFICERS OF THE UNIVERSITY

R. Gerald Turner, President
Paul W. Ludden, Provost and Vice President for Academic Affairs
Thomas E. Barry, Vice President for Executive Affairs
Brad E. Cheves, Vice President for Development and External Affairs
Chris Regis, Vice President for Business and Finance
Paul J. Ward, Vice President for Legal Affairs and Government Relations, General Counsel, and Secretary
Lori S. White, Vice President for Student Affairs
Michael A. Condon, University Treasurer

DEDMAN SCHOOL OF LAW

FACULTY AND ADMINISTRATIVE STAFF

Julia P. Forrestor, B. S. E. E., J. D., Dean ad interim and Professor of Law
John S. Lowe, B. A., LL. B., Senior Associate Dean for Academic Affairs and George W. Hutchison Chair in Energy Law
Nathan Cortez, B. A., J. D., Associate Dean for Research and Associate Professor of Law
Gail M. Daly, B. A., M. A., J. D., Associate Dean for Library and Technology and Associate Professor of Law
Ruth A. Cross, B. A., J. D., Associate Dean for Administration, Director of Legal Research, Writing and Advocacy Program and Senior Lecturer in Law
Lynn Switzer Bozalis, B. A., J. D., Associate Dean for Development and Alumni Affairs
Martin L. Camp, B. A., J. D., Assistant Dean for Student Affairs
Karen C. Sargent, B. B. A., J. D., Assistant Dean and Executive Director for Career Services
Jill Nikirk, B. A., J. D., Assistant Dean for Admissions
Rebecca Garza Greenan, B. S., B. A., M. Ed., J. D., Director of Public Service Program and Director of Academic Skills Assistance Program
Roland C. Webb, B. S., M. B. A., Director of Financial Services
Lynn McVicker Dempsey, B. B. A., Director of External Relations
Kristy Offenburger, Director, Communications and Marketing
Linda A. Hale, B. A., J. D., Director of Career Services
Stephen B. Yeager, B. B. A., J. D., Director of Career Services
J. Mark McWatters, B. B. A., M. B. A., J. D., LL. M., LL. M., Director of Graduate Programs
Becca Lickteig, B. A., J. D., Director of Admissions
Laura Amberson, B. S., Registrar

FACULTY

John B. Attanasio, B. A., J. D., LL. M., Dipl. in Law, Judge William Hawley Atwell Chair of Constitutional Law, Professor of Law and Former Dean
Roy R. Anderson, B. A., J. D., LL. M., Vinson & Elkins Distinguished Teaching Fellow and Professor of Law
Maureen N. Armour, B. A., M. S. W., J. D., Co-Director of Civil Clinic and Associate Professor of Law
Lackland H. Bloom, Jr., B. A., J. D., Professor of Law
William J. Bridge, B. S. F. S., J. D., Associate Professor of Law
Alan R. Bromberg, B. A., J. D., University Distinguished Professor of Law
Cheryl Nelson Butler, B. A., J. D., Assistant Professor of Law
Regis W. Campfield, B. B. A., LL. B., Professor Emeritus of Law and Marilyn Jeanne Johnson Distinguished Law Faculty Fellow Emeritus
Beverly M. Carl, B. S. L., J. D., LL. M., Professor Emerita of Law
Michael E. Cashen, B. A., J. D., Senior Lecturer in Law
Eric Cedillo, B. S., J. D., Coordinator, Consumer Advocacy Project
Anthony J. Colangelo, B. A., J. D., LL. M., J. S. D., Associate Professor of Law
Nathan Cortez, B. A., J. D., Associate Dean for Research and Associate Professor of Law
Gregory S. Crespi, B. S., M. S., Ph. D., J. D., Professor of Law
Ruth A. Cross, B. A., J. D., Associate Dean for Administration; Director of Legal Research, Writing, and Advocacy Program; and Senior Lecturer in Law
Gail M. Daly, B.A., M.A., J.D., Associate Dean for Library and Technology, Director of the Underwood Law Library, and Associate Professor of Law

David E. DePianto, B.A., J.D., Ph.D., Assistant Professor of Law

William V. Dorsaneo, III, B.A., J.D., Chief Justice John and Lena Hickman Distinguished Faculty Fellow and Professor of Law

Beverly C. Duréus, B.A., J.D., Th.M., Senior Lecturer in Law

Linda S. Eads, B.A., J.D., Associate Provost and Associate Professor of Law

Julia P. Forrester, B.S.E.E., J.D., Dean ad interim and Professor of Law

Jeffrey M. Gaba, B.A., J.D., M.P.H., Professor of Law

Christopher H. Hanna, B.S., J.D., LL.M. (in Taxation), Altshuler University Distinguished Teaching Professor and Professor of Law

Patricia S. Heard, B.A., J.D., Senior Lecturer in Law

JoAnn A. Hubbard, B.S., J.D., Senior Lecturer in Law

Christopher M. Jenks, B.S., J.D., LL.M., LL.M. (with distinction), Director of the Criminal Justice Clinic and Assistant Professor of Law

Larry Jones, B.B.A., J.D., LL.M., Director of Federal Tax Clinic and Small Business Clinic

Jeffrey Kahn, B.A., M.Phil., D.Phil., J.D., Associate Professor of Law

Ndiva Kofele-Kale, B.A., M.A., Ph.D., J.D., University Distinguished Professor and Professor of Law

Henry J. Lischer Jr., B.B.A., J.D., LL.M. (in Taxation), Professor Emeritus of Law

John S. Lowe, B.A., LL.B., Senior Associate Dean for Academic Affairs and George W. Hutchinson Professor of Energy Law

George A. Martinez, B.A., M.A., J.D., Professor of Law

Thomas Wm. Mayo, B.A., J.D., Altshuler University Distinguished Teaching Professor and Associate Professor of Law, Only Sulami Mazur, B.B.A., M.P.A. (summa cum laude), J.D. (Order of the Coif), LL.M., Assistant Professor of Law

Joseph W. McKnight, B.A., B.A., B.C.L., M.A., LL.M., Larry and Jane Harlan Faculty Fellow and Professor of Law

Charles J. Morris, B.A., LL.B., Professor Emeritus of Law

Frederick C. Moss, A.B., J.D., LL.M., Professor Emeritus of Law

John J. Mylan, B.S., J.D., LL.M. (in Taxation), Professor Emeritus of Law

Xuan-Thao Nguyen, B.A., J.D., Professor Emeritus of Law

Joseph Jude Norton, A.B., LL.B., LL.M., D.Phil., Distinguished Faculty Fellow in Financial Institutions, Professor of Law and James L. Walsh Distinguished Faculty Fellow

Victoria Palacios, J.D., Associate Professor of Law

Kenneth L. Penegar, A.B., J.D., LL.M., Professor Emeritus of Law

Roark M. Reed, B.S., B.A., J.D., Professor Emeritus of Law

W. Keith Robinson, B.S., J.D., Assistant Professor of Law

C. Paul Rogers III, B.A., J.D., LL.M., Professor of Law and former Dean

Meghan Ryan, A.B., J.D., Assistant Professor of Law

Eliot Shavin, B.A., J.D., Supervising Attorney, Civil Clinic

Ellen K. Solender, A.B., J.D., Professor Emerita of Law

Mary B. Spector, B.A., J.D., Co-Director of Civil Clinic, Director of Consumer Law Project, and Associate Professor of Law

Walter W. Steele Jr., LL.B., Professor Emeritus of Law

Marc I. Steinberg, A.B., J.D., LL.M., Rupert and Lillian Radford Chair in Law

Heather Stobaugh, B.A., M.A., J.D., Lecturer in Law

Joshua C. Tate, B.A., M.A., M.Phil. J.D., Ph.D., Associate Professor of Law

David O. Taylor, B.S., J.D., Assistant Professor of Law

Elizabeth G. Thornburg, B.A., J.D., Professor of Law

Sarah Tran, B.S., J.D., Assistant Professor of Law

Jenia Iontcheva Turner, B.A., J.D., Professor of Law

Jonni Walls, B.A., J.D., Lecturer in Law

Jessica Dixon Weaver, B.A., J.D., Assistant Professor of Law

Harvey Wingo, B.A., M.A., J.D., Vinson & Elkins Distinguished Teaching Fellow Emeritus and Professor Emeritus of Law

Peter Winship, B.A., LL.B., LL.M., James Cleo Thompson Sr. Professor of Law
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Position</th>
<th>Institution</th>
<th>Location</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Harvie Branscomb, Jr.</td>
<td>Branscomb P.C.</td>
<td>Corpus Christi, Texas</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deborah G. Hankinson</td>
<td></td>
<td>Hankinson Levinger LLP</td>
<td>Dallas, Texas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alan R. Bromberg</td>
<td>Professor of Law</td>
<td>Southern Methodist University</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Honorable Nathan L. Hecht</td>
<td>Supreme Court of Texas</td>
<td>Austin, Texas</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gregory S. Crespi</td>
<td>Professor of Law</td>
<td>Southern Methodist University</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Honorable Patrick E. Higginbotham</td>
<td>United States Court of Appeals</td>
<td>Fifth Judicial Circuit</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Craig T. Enoch</td>
<td>Winstead P.C.</td>
<td>Austin, Texas</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thomas Wm. Mayo</td>
<td>Associate Professor of Law</td>
<td>Southern Methodist University</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ernest E. Figari, Jr.</td>
<td>Figari &amp; Davenport</td>
<td>Dallas, Texas</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R. Gerald Turner</td>
<td>President</td>
<td>Southern Methodist University</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Honorable Patrick E. Higginbotham</td>
<td>United States Court of Appeals</td>
<td>Fifth Judicial Circuit</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>